

Mapping the landscape of online job vacancies

Background report: Bulgaria

Study: Real-time labour market information on skills requirements: Setting up the EU system for online vacancy analysis

Contract: AO/DSL/VKVET-GRUSSO/Real-time_LMI_2/009/16
prepared for Cedefop by Zhechko Dimitrov

Date of release: 19 January 2018

While the original text has been thoroughly revised by Cedefop experts, it did not go through the official publication process (peer review, language editing and formatting)

Please cite this report as:

Cedefop (2018). Mapping the landscape of online job vacancies. Background country report: Bulgaria, <http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/events-and-projects/projects/big-data-analysis-online-vacancies/publications>

© Cedefop, 2018

Preface

Over the last decades, online job portals have become important features of the job market. The Internet offers a rich source of live and real-time labour market information for almost all of occupations. It can provide insight on job-specific skills required in particular occupations in different regions, combined with information on the characteristics of the job offered – i.e. much more than is available using conventional sources. However, consistent and comparative information on the use of the internet and online job market by job-seekers and employers in Europe is rather scarce.

To tap the potential of online labour market information, Cedefop started to investigate the possibility to develop a system for gathering and analysing data from online job portals in the EU to complement the centre's toolkit of skills intelligence instruments. While this is feasible, drawing meaningful conclusions from these data requires a good understanding of the features of national online job markets. Therefore, Cedefop has mapped the landscape of the online job market in all EU Member States. This publication presents one of the background country reports developed in the project - 'Real-time labour market information on skills requirements: Setting up the EU system for online vacancy analysis' (AO/DSL/VKVET-GRUSSO/Real-time LMI 2/009/16). Its findings will inform the cross country comparison published in the upcoming synthesis report.

The work was undertaken by a consortium of external contractors: CRISP (Milano/IT), Tabulaex (Milano/IT) and IWAK (Frankfurt/DE) and their network of country experts (see annex 1 for detailed list) and closely supervised by Cedefop. It presents authors' analysis of the landscape of the online job portal market in the country using a methodology developed for the purpose of the project.

Index

Introduction	6
1. Methodology	7
1.1. Search Paths	7
1.2. Data Sources	7
1.2.1. Public Data/Academic Research	7
1.2.2. Research/Surveys of Interest Groups.....	7
2. Labour Market Dynamics and Impact on the OJV Market.....	10
3. Context and Characteristics of the Online Job-portal Market.....	12
3.1. PES Online Job-portal(s).....	12
3.1.1. Legal/Regulatory Framework	12
3.1.2. Organisational Structure of the PES Online Job-portal(s).....	13
3.1.3. Focus of the PES Online Job-portal(s)	14
3.1.4. Outreach of the PES Online Job-portal(s)	14
3.1.5. Posting of PES Vacancies on EURES.....	15
3.2. Private Online Job-portals	15
3.2.1. Legal/Regulatory Framework	15
3.2.2. Dominant Online Job-Portals and Their Business Models	15
3.2.3. Focus of the Private Online Job-portals.....	17
3.2.4. Outreach of the Private Online Job-portals.....	18
3.3. Co-operation Between Public and Private Online Job-portals	18
3.4. Role of other Recruitment and Job-search Channels	19
3.5. Expected Trends in the Online Job-portal Market.....	20
4. Use OJVs in Recruitment and Job Search	21
4.1. Use of OJVs in the Recruitment of Labour	21
4.2. Use of OJVs in Job-search.....	22
4.3. Expected Trends in the Use of OJVs in Recruitment and Job-search.....	23
5. Identifying Online Job-portals for Web-crawling.....	24
5.1. Documentation of the Job-portal Research Process.....	24
5.1.1. Identifying the Online Job-portals Through Google Search.....	24
5.2. Conditions for Drafting and Posting OJVs in the Selected Job-portals.....	24
5.2.1. Drafting and Posting an OJV on the PES Online Job-portal	24
5.2.2. Drafting and Posting an OJV on a Private Online Job-portal	25
6. Format and Content of OJVs.....	27
6.1. Legal/Regulatory Framework	27

6.2. Format of OJVs.....	28
6.3. Content of OJVs.....	28
6.4. Main Differences between the Public and Private Online Job-portals.....	32
6.5. Expected Trends in the Format and Content of OJVs	32
References	34
Expert Interviews	35
Annex 1: Research Process.....	36
Annex 2: Identified Online Job-portals.....	40
Annex 3: Employer survey by the Bulgarian Industrial Association (2017)	42

List of Abbreviations

BIA	Bulgarian Industrial Association
Cedefop	European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training
CRISP	Centro di ricerca interuniversitario per i servizi di pubblica utilità, University of Milano-Bicocca
ESCO	European Standard Classification of Occupations
EURES	European Employment Services
GCDF	Global Career Development Facilitator
HR	Human Resources
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IISDA	Integrated Information System of the State Administration
ISCO	International Standard Classification of Occupations
NCOP	National Classification of Occupations and Posts
OJVs	Online Job Vacancies
PES	Public Employment Services

Introduction

With the project “Real-time Labour Market Information on Skill Requirements: Setting up the EU System for Online Vacancy Analysis”, Cedefop explores online job-vacancies (OJVs) as a new source of real-time Labour Market Information. By crawling the most important online job-portals of the 28 EU Member States, Cedefop will further its understanding of the changing skills demand in different sectors and occupations. A systematic overview of the online job-portal landscape in each of the 28 EU Member States will identify the most relevant online job-portals and provide context for the data scraped from them. With the Landscaping Activity, Cedefop seeks to acquire insights into the structure of online job-portal markets and the extent to which online job-portals are used in recruitment and job-search. Furthermore, it aims to better understand which factors cause variation in the formats and content of OJVs in different countries.

This Country Report was compiled between April and October 2017 and constitutes a first overview of the online job-portal landscape in Bulgaria. It is based on desk research of available data sources in Bulgaria (e.g. public data, academic research and publications of interest groups) and expert opinions. Chapter 1 describes the methodology used for compiling the report in terms of the relevant search paths and data sources. Chapter 2 gives an overview of the main drivers for the use of online job-portals in recruitment and job-search, while Chapter 3 concentrates on the characteristics of the online job-portal market and lists the most important players. Moreover, it seeks to understand to what extent OJVs published on the online job-portals provide adequate information on the developments in the Bulgarian labour market in terms of the number of vacancies and representation of sectors/occupations. Furthermore, it elaborates on the legal and regulatory framework guiding the activities of the job-portal owners and employers, highlights the differences between the public versus private online job-portals and delineates their relationships with one another. Chapter 4 covers the use of online job-portals in recruitment and job-search. It focuses on the differences in the behaviour of employers and job-seekers across sectors, occupations, qualification levels and regions. Chapter 5 presents the most important online job-portals in Bulgaria for web-crawling and describes a step by step process of the OJV drafting and posting on select private and public online job-portals. Chapter 6 concludes the Country Report by describing the main features of OJVs in Bulgaria in terms of format and content. In particular, it explores to what extent OJVs contain information pertaining to hard and soft skills required for the job, how these skills are characterised and what they reveal about the nature of the job.

1. Methodology

1.1. Search Paths

Desk research was gathered between 18 April and 17 May 2017. Keyword searches were conducted on the information system of the National Statistical Institute and Eurostat, official websites of state institutions and agencies. We also searched research institutes, academic organisations, and international institutions accredited in Bulgaria as well as employer organisations, trade unions and non-governmental organisations. Additionally search engines, social media and career websites results were analysed. A list of specific search dates and the keywords and search combinations as well as a brief summary of the findings can be found in Annex 1.

1.2. Data Sources

1.2.1. Public Data/Academic Research

Despite various search efforts, no public data or academic research on the subject of online job-portals or OJVs could be identified.

There is no vacancy survey run by the PES or other similar survey that could offer information relevant to this project. Periodic job vacancy surveys are carried out only by regions of the Employment Agency divisions and their data are used in the development of this report. According to NSI data, the number of free vacancies for 2017 is about 19,000, while in 2012 it was 16,030. Most free and unoccupied jobs are in the sectors: Healthcare, Manufacturing, Transport, Trade and Education.

1.2.2. Research/Surveys of Interest Groups

Between 27 April and 5 May 2017, the Bulgarian Industrial Association conducted a survey on the role of online job-portals. The survey included 200 employers representing small, medium and large enterprises across Bulgaria. A field survey helped analyse the degree of recognition of online job search portals among job-seekers. It surveyed 400 unemployed individuals and job-seekers from large cities around the country who were registered with the PES. The purpose of the employers' survey was to identify the preferred methods (channels) for recruiting staff, the motives for using online job portals, to study the degree of recognition and rating of online job portals, as well as the problems in interacting with them. The purpose of the survey among unemployed jobseekers was to explore preferred job search approaches, the motives for using online job portals, the degree of recognition and rating of online job portals, and the problems encountered when using them as a search tool to find a job. The questions in the polls were defined as a "closed" type. The results of the survey are included in the report. Both questionnaires are in the annexes.

Expert interviews were conducted between 27 April and 9 May 2017. The selection of the interview partners was based on the principles of equality, competence, engagement, interest in the subject of the survey and optimal coverage of the different categories of OJV stakeholders. With this in mind seven individuals were selected:

- A representative of a national employers' organisation who, as the head of a national centre and chairman of the Human Potential Development Association, had information and competence to summarise the views of employers and human resources specialists;
- A representative of the State Statistical Institute, who had a vision of official statistics as a whole;
- A representative of the National Employment Agency, who had information and competence on the legal framework and the state employment portals;
- Two representatives of online job-portals (the oldest portal and the most recent portal);
- Two representatives of recruitment agencies working with OJVs (one with an international network and one operating on the Bulgarian labour market for 20 years).

The selected interview subjects are experts with leading positions in the organisations that they represent and have a vision of future priorities in the OJV market. Four of the interview partners are managers, two are government experts (directors of departments in the relevant organisations) and one is a project manager. There were no difficulties in securing their participation in the expert interviews. All experts were well informed and demonstrated knowledge and competence in the questions they were asked. Only the government experts had some difficulty answering questions about the business models used by private online job-portals. To date, no research or evaluation (rating) of online job portals had been conducted in Bulgaria. It was important for us to study the experts' views on the differences in the functionality of job portals. In this respect, in the period between 27 April and 9 May, in parallel with the interviews, the experts carried out a further study - an expert evaluation using the Delphi method. With it, independently of each other and on the basis of an online questionnaire, the experts rated the functionalities of the job sites on the following scale:

- **Low functionality:** poor design, inadequate composition of the categories, difficulty in using and navigating in the website, relatively slow loading of the pages, lack of additional options and services for the users (the functionalities are limited only to the publication of the adverts and the CV of the candidates)
- **Average functionality:** relatively appropriate design, logical alignment of categories, availability of help information to help guide users, satisfactory page loading speed, lack of additional options and services to users (functionalities are limited to posting ads and CVs of applicants)
- **High functionality:** attractive design, logical grouping of categories, availability of help information to help guide users, satisfactory page loading speed, availability of additional options and functionalities (mobile apps, employers' ranking, business news, special design options, promotions and rebates, package deals, favours for loyal users, options for creating employer profiles, links to websites offering training, urgency and confidentiality options, online consultations, etc.).

According to the Delphi methodology, experts' responses were summarised using statistical results (average scores). The experts were sent the summary together with a second questionnaire asking for confirmation of the expert's opinion. So each expert could analyse the average score and re-review their opinion or include additional information supporting their initial assessment. This cycle was repeated twice as the experts approached their estimates. The results of the study are presented in Section 5.1.2. and Section 5.1.3.

Table 1: Overview of the different sources used in the Landscaping Activity

Type of source	Title/year	Provider	Information on			Quality
			Share of existing vacancies on online job-portals (PES/private)	Use of OJVs per sector/occupation/qualification level/ region	Skills requirements in OJVs	
Source 1 ⁽¹⁾: Research/surveys of interest groups	Two Field Surveys: Employers and Jobseekers (combined with data from Delphi Expert Survey): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> An online survey of the degree of recognition of online job-portals by the target group "Employers"; Field survey on the degree of recognition of online job search portals for the target group "Jobseekers". 	BIA	Private online job-portals cover 73% of the OJV market. About 90% of the OJV market covered by private online job-portals is concentrated in five job-portals.			Good
Source 2: Expert opinions	Expert opinions 2017	Experts 1-7 (see the References for detailed information)	Yes (not all experts)	Yes	Yes	Good

Source: Dimitrov (2017).

⁽¹⁾ In terms of public data (Source 1), we conducted four types of research (see Annex 1).

2. Labour Market Dynamics and Impact on the OJV Market

In the last 5-7 years, the Bulgarian labour market is mainly influenced by three factors that determine the demand for labour and the skills requirements of the workforce:

- Changes in the structure and development of the economy;
- Technological change;
- Demographic trends.

The main changes in **the structure and development of the Bulgarian economy** in recent years are related to the following trends: marginalisation, fragmentation of enterprises; increasing employment and exacerbation of the shortage of a qualified workforce; and transition from goods to services, administrative and support activities. Changes in the structure and development of the economy have an **impact on the OJV market** and company practices in the use of online search and recruitment tools such as:

- A significant increase in the number of online job search and employment portals;
- Increase in the number of companies that use mostly online tools combined with other recruitment channels;
- Exacerbated competition in recruitment, which forces businesses to pay more attention to their brand (the public image); in this regard, online ads for OJV also acquire institutional advertising elements;
- OJV ads that are addressed less to the unemployed, but rather to currently employed individuals and graduates who are looking for better opportunities for career development;
- An increase in the number of business sites that have "Careers" sections with published OJV ads and online application tools;
- More announcements attracting foreign specialists, particularly in the sectors and branches related to information and communication activities, finance, hospitality and gastronomy, energy, as well as managerial positions in the metallurgical and chemical industry.

The penetration of **new technologies** has greatly expanded the imbalance between demand and supply of skills in the labour market. Over the next five years, experts ⁽²⁾ anticipate a shortage of about 400,000 skilled professionals. There is a growing demand for high technology specialists, and individuals with skills in STEM, specifically in, digital technologies, mechatronics, nanotechnology, biotechnology, green technologies and neurotechnology. A substantial change is also being observed in the nomenclature of professions; in the past three years the National Classification of Occupations has added about 25 new professions. Experts forecast ⁽³⁾ that by the end of 2020 more than 120 new professions will emerge, mostly in the high-tech sector. The penetration of new technologies has an **impact on the OJV market** in the following directions:

- In the past three years, the number of users of online job-portals (employers and jobseekers) has increased by around 30%;

⁽²⁾ Report from the Institute for Economic Research at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, 2015, project leader Prof Iskra Beleva.

⁽³⁾ Interview with the appointed expert from the Bulgarian Industrial Association.

- The design of online advertisements has improved. It now focuses on elements designed to attract the candidate's attention by emphasizing the key requirements for the position, through company branding and by highlighting the advantages of working at the enterprise;
- OJVs focus on the conditions and the opportunities for further training and professional development as well as the acquisition of cross-functional and hybrid skills;
- The number of companies using social media in demand and recruitment, mostly on LinkedIn, Facebook, Twitter, etc., is increasing;
- The demand for labour on the labour market in general is becoming increasingly bifurcated between the low paid jobs requiring no qualifications and highly qualified jobs with a relatively high remuneration. However, the number of jobs on the labour market in general without qualification is decreasing. These trends also reflect the nature of online ads for OJVs;
- The selection focus is shifting from formal qualifications to assessment of competences ⁽⁴⁾. In the OJVs' content, employers are increasingly focusing on skills and, to a lesser extent, on education and qualifications.

The dimensions of the **demographic crisis** and their negative impact on the labour market in Bulgaria are mainly related to the decline and ageing of the labour force, the low birth rate and the low life expectancy of the population, the migration processes and the resulting disproportionate population development of the individual regions. Demographic trends also have an impact on the OJV market by increasing the number of advertisements offering different forms of flexible hiring, such as internship programs, remote work, reduced working hours, variable hours, fixed-term contracts, second-job contracts, etc. On the other hand, an increase in activity in the online job-portals by job seekers over the age of 50 years is also noteworthy.

⁽⁴⁾ A competence is an expression of an individual's ability to successfully combine and integrate into his/her behaviour at work different elements of his/her own knowledge, skills, experience, professional qualities, and other personality traits and characteristics. A competence is a kind of corporate standard of behaviour and performance required by the employer to distinguish successful employees from the rest.

3. Context and Characteristics of the Online Job-portal Market

3.1. PES Online Job-portal(s)

3.1.1. Legal/Regulatory Framework

There are two public offices that provide employment services in Bulgaria: the Integrated Information System of the State Administration (IISDA), which maintains the Administrative Register, and the Electronic Labour Bureau at the National Employment Agency (PES), which maintains the E-Labour platform⁽⁵⁾. The online platforms are two, one for the Employment Agency and the other for the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Bulgaria. The operation of public online job-portals is regulated by various pieces of legislation:

- Public Employee Act;
- Administration Act;
- Ordinance on the administrative register;
- Ordinance for conducting competitions for employees in the state;
- Labour Code. Section III. Choice;
- Labour Code. Section IV. Contest;
- Labour Code. Section VIII. Additional conditions for the employees under an employment relationship in the state administration;
- Labour Code. Section VIII “c”. Additional conditions for carrying out work through a company providing temporary work (New, SN No. 7/2012, effective 5 December 2011);
- Ordinance on the terms and conditions for carrying out intermediary activity on recruitment;
- Employment Promotion Act;
- Rules for the implementation of the Employment Promotion Act;
- Rules of Procedure of the Employment Agency;
- Access to Public Information Act.

These regulations determine the requirements for the recruitment, selection and appointment of employees in the state administration, local government and state-owned enterprises. Selection procedures have been defined for competition and selection. The structure and content of the “**Administrative Register**” is regulated in detail. The requirements for the content, structure and activity of the **Electronic Labour Bureau at the National Employment Agency** do not concern all OJVs. Employers are only obliged to announce vacancies in the regional employment offices for positions with the state and municipal administration as well as for the state and municipal enterprises. The publication of OJVs by other employers is not mandatory. The Electronic Labour Bureau has an E-labour platform which provides free access to OJVs as well as information for jobseekers. Private organisations that perform intermediary services for employment in Bulgaria and abroad and temporary employment agencies (personnel leasing) have to register with the Electronic Labour Bureau. They must submit to the PES information about job vacancies and re-

⁽⁵⁾ See <http://iisda.government.bg/> and <https://www.az.government.bg/en/ejobs/>.

cently filled positions or eliminated positions. Intermediaries that also manage job-portals must provide the PES with access rights to their websites. Intermediaries that do not have their own websites or portals must declare all vacancies on the website of the PES. The type and nature of the information in these online portals is explained in more detail in Section 3.1.2.

3.1.2. Organisational Structure of the PES Online Job-portal(s)

The Administrative Register exclusively posts vacancies for state employment opportunities. Specific regulation determines the type of information that is entered in the Administrative Register, as well as the conditions and the order for keeping, maintaining and using this public resource. The Administrative Register is maintained by the Council of Ministers through the Integrated Information System of the State Administration (IISDA) and the Unified Information System for Human Resources Management in the State Administration. The entry of information in the register is carried out by employees of the hiring administrative areas, who are responsible for the OJV information's reliability and completeness, as well as for the observation of the deadlines for entry. **The structure** of the Administrative Register includes established templates of information on:

- The regulatory framework, legal information, legal reports and the accessibility policy;
- Administrative structures and bodies of the executive power;
- Administrative services and modes;
- Information about all public sector vacancies according to the type of employment relationship, administrative structures, job competitions, and competitions by location.

The Electronic Labour Bureau at the National Employment Agency is available through the agency's official website. Its structure includes:

- Profiles of job-seekers registered with the Labour Offices;
- Vacancies announced in the Labour Offices.

Job-seekers have access to the following features:

- Information about registering and creating a job-seeker profile;
- Intermediary services for finding a job ⁽⁶⁾;
- Services provided by a psychologist;
- Services provided by a case manager;
- Professional orientation; by career counsellor
- information on Adult learning;
- public Programs and projects in the field of employment;
- Employment measures; (ALMPs)
- Link to EURES for job-seekers searching for a job in Europe.

Employers actually use the following information and functionalities:

- Submit a job vacancy request (OJV);
- Programs and projects in the field of employment;
- Employment measures;
- Adult learning;
- Intermediation services for the recruitment of workers;

⁽⁶⁾ Mediation services are described in the system (list) and are carried out "face-to-face" depending on the needs of the job seeker. These include: developing a personal development plan; counselling; targeting to specific employers (job vacancies); referral to training.

- Companies posting for temporary work;
- Recruitment companies;
- Assistance with mass layoffs;
- Hiring of foreigners;
- Link to EURES - recruitment in Europe.

3.1.3. Focus of the PES Online Job-portal(s)

The Administrative Register focuses on employers from the state administration system and state-owned enterprises in their respective industries. Most of the OJVs on the Administrative Register are aimed at specialists with higher education and job experience. Advertisements are targeted at currently employed individuals, recent graduates and job-seekers. Most vacancies regard occupations in the following fields: social, economic and legal sciences; humanities; natural sciences, mathematics and informatics; and technical sciences. To a lesser degree and depending on the specifics of the state institutions, the Administrative Register is also looking for people from the following professional fields: health and sport; security and defence; arts; pedagogical sciences and agricultural sciences and veterinary medicine.

The Electronic Labour Bureau focuses on the unemployed and job-seekers registered with labour offices and employers in all sectors. One advantage of this portal is that it makes use of the infrastructure available within regional employment services such as the regional and local employment agents.

3.1.4. Outreach of the PES Online Job-portal(s)

Public online job-portals cover about 27% ⁽⁷⁾ of vacancies or about 245,700 ads, calculated approximately on an annual basis ⁽⁸⁾. Some OJVs advertise positions for state employees and specialists in state-owned enterprises, which must be posted to the Administrative Register. Registration of OJV ads in the Electronic Labour Bureau is also mandatory for firms in the labour market and temporary employment companies (staff leasing), but in practice this obligation is rarely enforced. Usually, the E-labour platform is used by micro and small enterprises (construction, manufacturing, hotel and restaurant management, agriculture and forestry), in smaller cities and mainly for positions requiring low-qualified candidates with low remuneration, particularly for roles that are hard to fill ⁽⁹⁾. The portal is also used by employers who advertise temporary jobs as part of projects and measures initiated by the National Employment Agency.

⁽⁷⁾ Opinion of the interviewed expert from the Employment Agency

⁽⁸⁾ By approximate calculations, the total number of online job vacancies, calculated on an annual basis, is around 910 000. It should be taken into account that the actual number of vacancies is much lower. These data reflect the internal and external mobility of the workforce, turnover, the release of jobs due to retirement and maternity leave, the announcement of internships, temporary and part-time employment and the creation of new jobs. In addition, some employers publish the same vacancy on several online job-portals, while others simply "test" the labour market, look for talent, or recruit back-up employees without having an urgent need or a true open position (create a reserve list of potential candidates but do not hire them). In addition, some job-portals, especially portals belonging to the same corporation, transfer OJVs to one another.

⁽⁹⁾ In regions such as Plovdiv, Varna, Stara Zagora, Bourgas and others there is a physical shortage of labour. Some people from minority groups (mostly Roma) prefer not to work and receive social benefits from the state. According to a Trend Research Center survey commissioned by the Friedrich Ebert Foundation in Bulgaria, there are over 300,000 demotivated young people (up to 29) who neither study nor seek employment (not registered with the employment services).

3.1.5. Posting of PES Vacancies on EURES

In Bulgaria, there are 31 EURES advisers, specialising in specific EU countries as well as 20 assistants. These individuals are located in and provide services at the regional employment services. Their activity is managed by the EURES National Coordination Office at the National Employment Agency. All data from the National Employment Agency's E-Labour bureau are automatically transferred to the EURES portal through web services, which synchronises the PES with EURES once each day to add or remove vacancies. Currently job-seekers are interested in the platform and EURES services, but they find it difficult to cope alone and therefore frequently seek help from EURES assistants in the regions. There is an overwhelming interest in publicly announced campaigns to place Bulgarians with specific professional profiles in positions abroad. According to experts ⁽¹⁰⁾, about 10% of employers know and use the services available via the Bulgarian EURES website (eures.bg).

3.2. Private Online Job-portals

3.2.1. Legal/Regulatory Framework

There is no specialised legal framework regulating the activities and content of the private online job-portals in Bulgaria. Separate indirect requirements for portals and references to the content of posted online job vacancies are contained in the following legal acts:

- Labour Code;
- Employment Promotion Act;
- The Protection against Discrimination Act;
- The protection of personal data Act;
- Copyright and related rights law;
- Law on Obligations and Contracts;
- National classification of occupations and posts (NCOP);

In Bulgaria, there is no trade organisation for owners of online job-portals and therefore no ethical norms for their work have been defined. Portals regulate relationships with their users through a "Terms of Service agreement".

3.2.2. Dominant Online Job-Portals and Their Business Models

There are 31 narrowly profiled ⁽¹¹⁾ private online job-portals in Bulgaria. These are the websites: Jobs.bg; Rabota.bg; Zaplata.bg; BestJobs.bg; Hotel.BestJobs.BG; Jobs.dobruja.com; JobTiger.bg; Sofiajobs.com; Buljobs.bg; Jobco.bg; Intercompass.bg; Staj.bg; Rabota.start.bg; Karieri.bg; Bg.gigajob.com; Rabotiv.com; Jobsagents.com; Iskamrabota.bg; Bg-rabota.com; Mycv.bg; Rabotnimesta.com; Work.bg; Jobs.borsa.bg; Jobspace.bg; Itjobs.bg; Rabotaposveta.com; Varna-jobs.com; Plovdivjobs.com; Bg.jooble.org; Bgcityjobs.com; Post.bestjobs.bg.

Of these portals, 26 portals offer OJVs for the whole country and five are regionally focused. All sites are geared to different occupations or sectors on the labour market, with search options by region. Only two websites – itjobs.bg and Hotel.BestJobs.BG – specialise in specific sectors, ICT

⁽¹⁰⁾ According to data from the interviewed experts from the Employment Agency and BIA.

⁽¹¹⁾ Provide only ads for job vacancies.

and the hotel and restaurant sector, respectively. All online portals offer listings for the country and abroad, while Post.bestjobs.bg offers only international opportunities. All portals are focused on the target group of job-seekers, which includes the unemployed, the employed looking for a job change, and students who are graduating or want to study while working. Only the Staj.bg portal specialises in recruiting participants for internship programs. The oldest website is JobTiger.bg and the newest is Buljob.com.

There are an additional 37 websites with advertisements in different areas (trade, property, services, etc.) that also maintain online job ads. These are the websites: Freeware; Bgzona.net; Lot.bg; Nox.bg; Marmalad-bg.com; Alo.bg; Olx.bg; Bazar.bg; Burkan.info; Topobiavi.net; Info-dir.org; 555.bg; Obqvi.net; Napazar.eu; Kupime.bg; Podatel.com; Free-obqvi.com; Quant.biz; Malkiobqvi.com; Gratis.bg; Magazincheto.eu; BGOBqva.com; Obiavi-bulgaria.com; MALL359; Ad-sBG.eu; Obiavi1.com; Parichka.com; Kupuvam-prodavam.net; Prodajba.com; Predlaga.bg; Alabala.bg; Mbiavitevi.net; Obiavitevi.com; Bgoferti.com; Frog.bg; Avanta.cc; Zor.bg.

Of the 26 national online job-portals, there are five portals whose combined market share covers 90% of the private OJV market. The largest of these five portals, Jobs.bg, covers 50% of the private online job marketplace ⁽¹²⁾. So far there has been no official ranking of the jobsites. There are no public discussions about the criteria that can be used for this rating. In this regard, a separate expert study ⁽¹³⁾ was carried out on the leading private online job-portals by applying the following criteria:

- Total number of active job ads;
- New job ads within one business day ⁽¹⁴⁾;
- Website features ⁽¹⁵⁾;
- Degree of Brand Recognition among Job Seekers ⁽¹⁶⁾;
- Degree of Brand Recognition among Employers ⁽¹⁷⁾.

Based on this study, a ranking of the top four portals was determined (see Table 2).

Table 2: Top 4 online job-portals in Bulgaria based on survey data

Portal	Website	Total No. Of Active Jobs	New Published OJVs within one business day	Website Features	Degree of Brand Recognition among Job-Seekers	Degree of Brand Recognition among Employers
Jobs.bg	https://www.jobs.bg/	42,412	2,182	High	89%	85%
Rabota.bg	http://www.rabota.bg/	1,380	92	High	68%	59%
Zaplata.bg	https://www.zaplata.bg	5,460	79	High	63%	55%
Job-Tiger.bg	http://www.jobtiger.bg/	1,660	29	High	71%	66%

Source: Dimitrov based on data from the Delphi Expert Survey (2017).

⁽¹²⁾ According to the opinion of the interviewed experts from BIA, selection agencies, online job portals. These conclusions are compared with our experts' study on the scope of online job portals.

⁽¹³⁾ Delphi Expert Survey and Two Field Surveys - Employers and Jobseekers.

⁽¹⁴⁾ Calculated on average for a period of one month (22 working days).

⁽¹⁵⁾ Delphi expert assessment at three levels: high (exceeding technological necessity), medium (technological necessity), low (under the technological necessity).

⁽¹⁶⁾ Percentage of surveyed jobseekers.

⁽¹⁷⁾ Percentage, share of the interviewed employers.

The leading private online portals in Bulgaria apply identical business models ⁽¹⁸⁾. All portals function within the media sector with the exception of JobTiger.bg, which serves as a labour market intermediary. Jobs.bg is owned by individuals and is a member of the global recruitment network - THE NETWORK. The portal Rabota.bg is owned by Investor Media Group, a leading Bulgarian media company. Its portfolio includes a full range of media products, including Bulgaria ON AIR, Bulgaria's online television channel Bloomberg TV Bulgaria, over 15 online media and sites in different segments, Bulgaria ON AIR radio and Bulgaria ON AIR The Inflight Magazine, Investor Digest and GO ON AIR, The Traveler's Magazine. The portal Zaplata.bg is owned by Rezon Media AD, which is the largest group of specialised media in Bulgaria and which owns a large advertising network of specialised sites including imot.bg, mobile.bg, fakti.bg, bazar.bg, as well as print media related to cars and real estate - mobile.bg (newspaper and magazine), Sofia properties, Varna properties and Plovdiv properties. The Bestjobs.bg portal is owned by individuals who maintain four additional online job-portals – Ho.BestJobs.bg, Jobs.dobruja.com, Post.bestjobs.bg, Staj.bg – and a recreation and reference site called Club of BestJobs.bg. The JobTiger.bg portal is owned by individuals who maintain three more career sites – Careerdays.bg, Tigerclub.bg and Jobtiger.tv. The group is jointly owned by three companies: TigerClub, specialising in the provision of corporate and individual social benefits, career and personal development consulting, team building and event management; JTR JobTiger Recruitment, a recruitment agency; Tiger OnSite, a leasing, outsourcing, out-staffing and seasonal employment agency. JobTiger is the official representative for Bulgaria at the GCDF International Training Program for Career Development Professionals.

As can be observed from the description, business portfolios of private job-portals primarily rely on financial revenue from fees for posting advertisements, promotions, advert recognition options, and developing and publishing employers' profiles. Portals like Zaplata.bg, Rabota.bg and Bestjobs.bg transfer information to other websites for work or use it to maintain separate sections on their websites. The JobTiger.bg portal uses the information to provide additional services in the field of career development and human resources management.

All private online portals for work in Bulgaria use a traditional ⁽¹⁹⁾ approach to process online vacancy announcements and application processes. Portals compete on their ability to post the most ads and to divide them into the best classification systems as well as by offering the best design, speed and convenience on their website. Some also offer additional functionalities related to: mobile applications; employer ranking; business news; promotion and ad enhancement options; employer account creation options; links to other websites offering career counselling and training; emergency and privacy options; methodological guidelines for preparing a CV or letter of motivation; and interview preparation tips.

3.2.3. Focus of the Private Online Job-portals

Private job-portals in Bulgaria are focused on the following target groups ⁽²⁰⁾: employers; highly qualified applicants, employed persons seeking new jobs, employed persons holding key positions, employees wishing to develop their competence and qualifications, employed persons wishing to engage in further work, Bulgarians working abroad, students and unemployed individuals. The focus on employers primarily targets companies:

⁽¹⁸⁾ Business models that are almost identical or close in nature and strategy. This conclusion is based on the opinion of experts from the National Statistical Institute, BIA, recruitment agencies and online job portals.

⁽¹⁹⁾ Approach that is formal, time-stable, universal.

⁽²⁰⁾ According to the opinion of all interviewed experts confirmed by own study of online job portals.

- in high-tech and dynamically developing sectors ⁽²¹⁾ with strong growth in investments in tangible assets and human resources;
- in the sectors with the highest employment and labour turnover;
- that are large and medium-sized enterprises with internal movement of staff;
- that develop new products and services ⁽²²⁾;
- undergoing restructuring;
- with foreign participation in ownership;
- in large cities;
- offering internship programs;
- announcing OJVs for highly qualified positions, such as top managers, functional managers, line managers, supervisors and specialists.

The main focus of private job portals on jobseekers predominantly concerns more highly skilled people aged between 18 and 50.

3.2.4. Outreach of the Private Online Job-portals

There are an estimated 910,000 OJVs in Bulgaria on an annual basis ⁽²³⁾. Private online job-portals cover 73% of the OJV market or about 665,000 ads. About 90% (597,870 ads) of these private portal OJVs are held by the five leading online job-portals. These five portals divide their 90% of the market on an annual basis as follows:

- Jobs.bg: 298,935 OJV ads (50%);
- Rabota.bg: 143,489 OJV ads (24%);
- Zaplata.bg: 83,701 OJV ads (14%);
- BestJobs.bg: 41,851 OJV ads (7%);
- JobTiger.bg – 29,894 OJV ads (5%).

3.3. Co-operation Between Public and Private Online Job-portals

In Bulgaria there is no purposeful cooperation or established practices of interaction between private and public portals. State-run online portals are strictly profiled with established, fixed information templates, while private ones are more flexible. Nevertheless, some employers from the state administration and state enterprises duplicate their ads from the Administrative Register for use on private online job-portals. The same trend is observed at the National Employment Agency's E-Labour platform. Some of the employers post ads on the agency's website but duplicate them with advertisements for the same jobs in private online job-portals. Personnel recruitment and

⁽²¹⁾ High-tech sectors (sub-sectors) are: Information and communication technologies, Manufacture of computer and communication equipment, electronic products and optical equipment, Machine building, Mechatronics, Manufacture of pharmaceutical substances and products, Research and development. The above-mentioned sectors are dynamically developing with a pronounced growth in investment, including the following sectors: Metallurgy, Chemistry, Energy, Construction, Hotels and restaurants, Trade, Manufacture of food products, Real estate operations.

⁽²²⁾ From the industry, trade, repair of motor vehicles and motorcycles, advertising, sport and leisure activities.

⁽²³⁾ The following data have been provided by the interview partners and author's study of the online job-portals.

leasing agencies are required to publish their listings on the E-Labour platform, but due to the lack of enforcement, very few of them fulfil this obligation. There are no statistics on job vacancy advertisements for any advertising channel. No-one compares this data with official information published by the National Social Security Institute, although it is extremely important for combating the grey economy and monitoring and forecasting labour market trends.

3.4. Role of other Recruitment and Job-search Channels

Traditional channels where Bulgarian employers recruit job applicants can be classified as follows:

- Recruitment within the company (Mining, Manufacturing, Manufacturing and Distribution of Electricity and Gas and Gaseous Fuels, Construction, Government administration, Education, Health);
- Implementing programs with recruiting purposes, such as “Bring a Friend” programmes to encourage and stimulate employees to serve as a recruitment network (Metallurgy, Mechanical Engineering, Financial and Insurance Activities);
- Interaction with specialised recruitment agencies (large enterprises, trade, information and communication technologies);
- Interaction with the PES (agriculture, forestry and fishing, construction, water supply, sewage services, waste management and restoration, construction, food and beverage production, clothing production);
- Interaction with local authorities and community leaders including professional and minority groups (agriculture, forestry and fishing, construction, water supply; sewage services, waste management and restoration, construction, food and beverage production, clothing manufacture);
- Interaction with educational institutions (e.g. internship and scholarship programs or career centres) – large enterprises, manufacturing, mining, commerce, energy, transport, information and communication technologies, government ;
- Using online tools, such as posting ads on specialised job sites, announcing on own corporate sites, or posting information on social networks - all sectors described in the report;
- “Head-hunting“ – trade, manufacturing, information and communication technologies, financial and insurance activities;
- Partnership with staff leasing agencies – processing industry;
- Announcements in the media (e.g. printing, radio, television) – enterprises in small settlements, mainly agriculture and food production;
- Attracting external candidates through corporate training and certification courses organised by Vocational Training Centres – manufacturing, construction; information and communication technologies. They offer training and support acquiring qualifications and jobs for about 80% of successful graduates
- Participation in national, sectoral or regional career forums and exhibitions – large enterprises.

3.5. Expected Trends in the Online Job-portal Market ⁽²⁴⁾

It is difficult ⁽²⁵⁾ to predict future trends in the development of online job-portals in the current situation of the labour market in Bulgaria. What can be envisaged at this stage is the following:

- The number of employers looking for professionals from abroad will increase ⁽²⁶⁾, which will lead to more active use of EURES and transnational job-portals, mostly from Europe;
- Specialised online portals for cross-border job mobility will be created and third-country workers from outside the EU will be attracted;
- Websites will appear based on the shared economy concept, and will try to meet "demand" and "supply" of qualified and unqualified services without necessarily creating a permanent employment relationship;
- A significant increase in the use of OJV will occur, with the demand for highly qualified specialists prevailing;
- The role of social networks, such as LinkedIn and Facebook, as recruitment channels will grow;
- The number of job-portals will be reduced and mainly two or three portals will dominate the market ⁽²⁷⁾;
- The Jobs.bg portal will increase its market position to about 70%;
- The number of websites for other purposes will continue to grow to include a "work" section;
- Job-portals will expand their services and functionalities as well as their interactions with other specialised career development and human resource development websites ⁽²⁸⁾.

⁽²⁴⁾ The following information is based on the expert interviews.

⁽²⁵⁾ Due to the lack of research and statistics on the activity of the online job portals in Bulgaria, there is still no developed and implemented system for long-term forecasting the labour force needs on the Bulgarian labour market.

⁽²⁶⁾ Acute shortage of qualified workforce, which leads to the rise in search and use of a mobile workforce from Europe and the import of specialists from third countries.

⁽²⁷⁾ The return on investment is low and this business will prove to be unprofitable for most of the portal owners. The OJVs market has been distributed and users are mostly focused on two to three online job-portals.

⁽²⁸⁾ Consultations concerning the recruiting process and career development, electronic tests for candidates' competency assessment, e-learning platforms, e-platforms containing information on the competencies by occupations and professions required by employers.

4. Use OJVs in Recruitment and Job Search

4.1. Use of OJVs in the Recruitment of Labour

Employers who are most active in posting online job ads represent enterprises ⁽²⁹⁾:

- In highly technological and dynamic developing sectors;
- In the sectors with the highest employment and labour turnover;
- With high investment activity;
- Expanding their business, developing their markets and introducing new products and services;
- In the process of restructuring or entering the Bulgarian market;
- With a strategy to apply modern policies and standards in the management of human resources;
- of large and medium size with internal movement of staff;
- Mostly with foreign participation;
- Located in large urban areas;
- Positioned in regions with acute shortages of qualified workforce (Sofia, Plovdiv, Varna, Bourgas, Stara Zagora, Rouse, Targovishte).

The following factors affect employers' attitudes toward using online job-portals for work:

- Increasing access to the Internet among different target social groups;
- Young people's confidence, attention and preference to this channel and tech-based approaches to communicating information;
- Increased technological capabilities for designing and combining different sources, types and volumes of information;
- Employer branding opportunities;
- Saving time, effort, speed and convenience;
- Saving money;
- Optimal coverage of target audiences and targeting a wider range of relevant potential job applicants;
- Developing a larger base for applicant selection and choice;
- Attracting a mobile workforce from other regions outside the employer's location;
- Creating a reserve base of potential candidates for future positions.

Despite all of the benefits associated with online job recruitment, employers must also weigh the disadvantages ⁽³⁰⁾:

- They may receive a huge number of applications (CV), including from people who have nothing to do with the announced requirements, the selection of which requires time and effort;

⁽²⁹⁾ According to the opinion of the interviewed experts from the electronic job portals and the recruitment agencies.

⁽³⁰⁾ According to the opinion of all the interviewed experts and according to the results of the survey of job-seekers and employers

- There is an inability to link the requirements of the job with the qualities of the candidates or with the candidates with the necessary skills;
- There is a lack of tools for preliminary online assessment and self-assessment of candidates' competencies;
- No single, internationally accepted classification of sectors and areas of work currently exists;
- There are no unified standards and classifiers to describe the requirements for the announced positions;
- Only three main job-portals have a version in English, and only Zaplata.bg also offers OJVs in Russian ⁽³¹⁾;
- Different pages have different loading speeds;
- The designs and arrangement of the categories is not always sufficiently in line with consumer preferences, perceptions and interests ⁽³²⁾;
- There is a lack of user feedback options.

Online recruitment is the most preferred channel for more than 80% of Bulgarian employers ⁽³³⁾. They almost never recruit candidates for vacant positions using just one channel, but often combine three, four or more approaches in order to successfully attract suitable candidates. Recruitment within the company and movement within the organisation, without publishing OJVs, occurs in about 7% of cases. Only about 15% of employers (generally large and foreign companies) prefer to use recruitment or leasing agencies, but in these cases, agencies also advertise online OJVs on behalf of their clients. Head-hunting is primarily used to recruit management positions and is increasingly combined with online ads, online monitoring, and initiating discussions via forums on social networks. As the shortage of skilled workers becomes more extreme, head-hunting has also started to be used to recruit lower positions in the company hierarchy. About 30% of employers, mostly in small cities and recruiting for low-skilled jobs, prefer to use the information and mediation services of the PES, but about 15% of these employers also duplicate advertisements in local and national online job-portals. About 20% of businesses have online ads for OJVs on their corporate sites, in a "Careers" section, but their effectiveness is low, as candidates do not follow this information, and none of the portals have provides users with a "search engine" on corporate sites ⁽³⁴⁾.

4.2. Use of OJVs in Job-search

Access to the Internet and the development of computer technologies, including mobile applications for smartphones, has increased job-seekers' interest in OJVs. The use of OJVs in job search is preferred by the following categories of individuals ⁽³⁵⁾:

⁽³¹⁾ The disadvantage is that the majority of online job portals do not have an English version. The Russian, Romanian, Turkish and Serbian language versions should be expanded.

⁽³²⁾ Job-seekers are willing to study job opportunities in acquired professions and majors, while information in portals is structured by occupational areas (sectors)

⁽³³⁾ According to the interviewed experts and according to the results of the survey of the employers.

⁽³⁴⁾ According to the interviewed experts and according to the results of our survey, companies that have corporate websites duplicate OJV ads with simultaneous publications in online job portals and on their corporate websites. There are hardly any candidates on the ads on the company sites, or their number is four to five times smaller than the candidates who responded to the ads in the online job portals. Job seekers do not have the habit of tracking ads on business websites.

⁽³⁵⁾ According to the opinion of the interviewed experts from BIA, NSI and online job portals.

- Up to 50 years of age;
- With higher education;
- With professional qualifications and experience in a particular area;
- Looking for a first job;
- Looking for work abroad;
- Looking for work in another city;
- Living in larger cities;
- Looking for flexible employment;
- Looking for additional work;
- Looking to increase their income from work;
- Interested in participating in internships programs and other programs and measures to promote employment;
- Interested in developing their professional skills and careers.

OJVs are used more actively by students and individuals who are currently employed compared ⁽³⁶⁾ to the unemployed. Women are more active in the use of OJVs compared to men. About 60% of job-seekers have used online job-portals. However, unlike employers, job-seekers preferred job search approaches are through relationships and personal contacts, such as information and assistance from relatives and acquaintances, and face-to-face meetings.

With the use of OJVs for job search, some inhibitions and barriers exist on the part of job-seekers:

- It is difficult to get employer feedback;
- There is insufficient or incorrect (purposefully) information in ads;
- Ads often take an unattractive, dry, haughty or boring tone in the description section;
- The requirements are too high or unclear.

There is a trend towards increasing the use of social networking for job search, and there is increasing interest and trust in websites where information about different employers is shared and discussed.

4.3. Expected Trends in the Use of OJVs in Recruitment and Job-search ⁽³⁷⁾

Use of OJV use in job search and employment will continue to gain popularity and to expand for all jobseekers regardless of the economic sector. At the same time, opportunities will be sought for more optimal integration with other approaches and channels for labour force recruitment and job search. The role of social networks is growing. Job-seekers will become increasingly interested in the policies that the enterprise implements - the reputation of the employer, the availability of a good working environment, relationships, technologies and processes that enrich employees' lives and give them personal meaning, inspiring challenges, motivation for improvement, and a well-meaning and encouraging work environment.

⁽³⁶⁾ According to the opinion of the interviewed experts from online job portals.

⁽³⁷⁾ Information in this Section originates from expert interviews.

5. Identifying Online Job-portals for Web-crawling

5.1. Documentation of the Job-portal Research Process

5.1.1. Identifying the Online Job-portals Through Google Search

The job-portals which dominate in the Google searches⁽³⁸⁾, have the most OJVs posted, have a nation-wide cross-sectoral range, have been indicated as the essentials according to the expert interviews and are most relevant concerning the labour market are the following:

- Zaplata.bg;
- Rabota.bg;
- Jobs.bg;
- Jobtiger.bg;
- Buljobs.bg;
- National Employment Agency's website (E-Labour platform);
- jooble.bg;
- olx.bg;
- Alo.bg;
- Rabota.start.bg;
- The National coordination office of EURES for Bulgaria managed by the National Employment Agency (OJVs come from EURES members and partners, in particular from the European Public Employment Services);
- The Administrative register (All job vacancies in the public sector).

5.2. Conditions for Drafting and Posting OJVs in the Selected Job-portals

5.2.1. Drafting and Posting an OJV on the PES Online Job-portal

The drafting process when working with the National Employment Agency's (PES) system for posting OJVs envisages filing an application for an OJV online through the agency's website in the E-labour platform. It can be done by approval from the Labour Office Directorate or through importing from a Private Labour Mediator on the platform.

Searching for OJV ads and/or jobseeker profiles does not require registration on the website. However, to actually use the full data, which appears incomplete on the platform, it is necessary to contact a representative of the Labour Office Directorate.

The application for drafting and posting an OJV follows the logic of the query in the National Database (according to the OJV specification). The National Database is an Information System of the Employment Agency, which includes information about the registered unemployed and the services provided (counselling, training, referral to job vacancies) by the employment services. The

⁽³⁸⁾ The Google search for identifying the most important online job-portals for web-crawling is documented in Annex 2.

system is integrated with the Commercial Register so that the data for the registered employers is received in real-time or updated as needed.

According to a report conducted by the Bulgarian Industrial Association ⁽³⁹⁾, the mandatory fields to be filled in for an employer are: BULSTAT code, company name, type of company, company class and economic activity.

In general, the OJV ads on the PES are not detailed enough based on the submitted fields. For example, information about the description of the job tasks and responsibilities themselves is missing. A job description cannot completely replace tasks and responsibilities. Very often requests are not fully filled in and there is a lack of information. For example, the "Main and Additional Responsibilities and Tasks" field is not required, even though it is one of the most important parts in a job ad. Also the requirements section is not mandatory. The obligatory fields for filling in the e-templates of an advertisement in the online job portals are: position; category, area (closed question - drop down menu); job type - permanent, temporary, etc. (closed question - drop down menu); type of employment - full, reduced working day (closed question - drop down menu); level in the hierarchy (closed question - drop down menu); state and settlement.

5.2.2. Drafting and Posting an OJV on a Private Online Job-portal

Since there are no unified rules or regulatory frameworks for managing the activities and content of a private job portal, each of the job websites has its own individual interface, user rules and internal infrastructure. However, the main points of the business models are uniform. For the purposes of describing the drafting and posting processes of a private job-portal, we have chosen one of the bigger, most popular and oldest Bulgarian job website, JobTiger. Some of the content may vary depending on the website management's decisions.

In order to start drafting an ad on a private online job-portal, the employer needs to register with the platform. The mandatory fields include: name of the company, identification number of the company, and contact details (telephone number and email). After the employer receives account confirmation, they can publish a new job ad. The template can be standard or branded: the branding option includes presentations with text and graphic designs for a tailored page in the website with an individual design, including up to two pieces of news and one video per month ⁽⁴⁰⁾. This option may reduce the company's recruitment costs.

The mandatory fields include: position (job title), job level, working time, job description, Industry, and location. The type of OJV ad could be summarised in three options – free, special and corporate. The cost-free OJV ads can be posted for up to one month, and the service is unlimited. Special OJV ads are marked with two stars and are published after the corporate and prior to free job postings. They also provide the opportunity to add external links to the company website for applications.

There are subscription packages that facilitate the optimisation of a company's annual budget and reduce recruitment expenses. The subscription extends for up to twelve months. Moreover, the platform offers a strategy for making job postings and advertisements more popular.

Overall, the application in private online job-portals is more simplified than that of the PES and thus more user-friendly for the employer. However, some important elements in the private portal's template are not categorised such as "type of contract" (which is mandatory in the PES template). Another benefit of using the private portal is its time efficiency. If the employer has a contract with

⁽³⁹⁾ Report on Best Practices for Establishing and Operating Profiles of Unemployed Jobseekers.

⁽⁴⁰⁾ <http://www.jobtiger.bg/info/portfolio/branding/?ln=1>.

the job portal, postings and all actions on the website take place faster. For example, when posting an OJV, the employer does not have to fill in the company's data each time. According to the expert interviews, the PES website is preferred by employers who are mostly searching for low qualified positions, whereas the private job-portals offer more highly qualified OJV ads. The reason is for this is the more favourable public image of private online portals: the latter are preferred by jobseekers and are therefore used more by leading companies - employers.

Job candidates are not required to pay a fee. Employers, on the other hand, prefer to pay a fee, so their ads would reach a wide range of potential candidates.

6. Format and Content of OJVs

6.1. Legal/Regulatory Framework

There is no legal framework in place in Bulgaria to directly regulate the content and design of OJVs. The following legislative frameworks, standards and mechanisms indirectly influence the choice of format, design and content of the OJVs:

- **The National Classification of Occupations and Positions (NCOP)** is approved by an order of the Minister of Labour and Social Policy after coordination with the President of the National Statistical Institute. It requires exact spelling of the name and the code of the declared vacancy according to the adopted classification system – NCOP.
- **Protection Against Discrimination Act:** When declaring a vacancy the employer has no right to set requirements related to gender, race, nationality, ethnicity, citizenship, origin, religion, prior convictions, political affiliation, personal or social situation, disability, age, sexual orientation, marital status, property status or any other features established by law or by an international treaty to which the Republic of Bulgaria is a party. Exceptions are only allowed in respect of sex, age and reduced working capacity where, by reason of the nature of the work, gender, age or health status is an essential element of it.
- **Labour Code, State employee Act, and Ordinance on the Conduct of State Employee Competitions:** They refer to positions that are held based on the selection and competition in the state administration, local government, state and municipal enterprises, state educational and scientific institutions. They set requirements for the content of advertisements related to the mandatory indication of the organisation's name, location and nature of the job, requirements for the position, manner of conducting the competition and required documents when applying.
- **Employment Promotion Act and Regulations for its Implementation:** This regulates the form and content of employers' advertisements (queries) for workforce needs with a description of the nature of the work and the educational and qualification requirements to the applicant and how to make the selection.
- **Protection of Personal Data Act and its Implementing Rules:** This Act requires employers to make clear in the content of the advertisements that there are no requirements for the position which force candidates to give personal data.
- **European Structural and Investment Funds Regulations and Employment Promotion Programs, funded by the European Social Fund and the Republic of Bulgaria:** This regulation sets specific frameworks and requirements for target groups, participation procedures, form and content of advertisements.

Other regulatory OJV mechanisms are related to the general conditions and standards and the format of the advertisements offered by the websites. Each job portal offers a model for the OJV format and content categories. Nevertheless, the different portals' models remain similar. It has been established in all OJV ads, regardless of whether they appear in a corporate site, electronic media or a job website. The general requirements of the websites are require the following:

- A declaration of the authenticity of the information;
- A ban on promoting products and services;
- Prohibition of requirements obliging candidates to purchase training or other services;

- A ban on forwarding links to other pages (corporate site, social networking profiles);
- Prohibition of discriminatory, abusive, defamatory texts or those that violate or disregard basic human, intellectual or public rights.

6.2. Format of OJVs ⁽⁴¹⁾

Over the past three years, under the influence of unfavourable demographic trends and the worsening deficit and labour force competition, new trends emerged in the OJVs' format:

- Strengthening the advertising aspects, focusing on the ads' design and attractiveness, shortening the content in order to attract the attention, motivation and comfort of the target groups;
- Moving the emphasis from a description of the requirements to a description of the benefits;
- Using keywords and messages that are more populist, easy to perceive and influence the candidates subconsciously;
- Increasing the number of ads in English (not to attract candidates from abroad, but rather as pre-selection of candidates);
- A clearer differentiation of the ads' format and content according to the level of the position in the company hierarchy;
- a clearer differentiation of the format and content of ads according to the size of the firm and the form of ownership of the capital.

The languages used in online ads are primarily Bulgarian and sometimes English. German, French or Russian are occasionally used.

6.3. Content of OJVs ⁽⁴²⁾

The factors that affect the content of OJVs are as follows:

- Degree of shortage for the type of role within the labour market. Positions in sectors experiencing shortages (Information and Communication Technologies, Machine Building, Chemical Industry, Metallurgy, Transport, Construction, Energy, Mining, Food Industry, Healthcare) focus on more attractive content and a description of the benefits of the business and the conditions it offers. Different approaches are used to attract the attention of potential candidates and to compete for the candidates including specific design, advert reinforcement options, company profiles, emphasis on working conditions and benefits for the candidates ("we offer"); etc.
- Requirements for specific skills. OJVs are sometimes published in English if the position requires knowledge of the language. There is often a detailed identification and listing of the certificates required for the position, a detailed description of the areas and activities in which the candidate is expected to have the relevant experience; Managerial positions emphasise soft skills and experience while positions for technical specialists focus on the level of knowledge of certain technologies, software, systems and standards.

⁽⁴¹⁾ According to the interviewed experts from BIA, recruiting agencies and online job portals.

⁽⁴²⁾ According to experts interviewed at BIA, the EA, the NSI, recruiting agencies and online job portals.

- Traditions and culture in working with OJVs in the different sectors. About 80% of ads in the financial sector, ICT, science and tourism are in English. Announcements of vacancies in industry emphasise the duties and responsibilities; in pharmacy and medicine - the qualifications and experience; in commerce - the minimum requirements for taking office, etc. The announcements of companies in the high-tech sectors, the financial sector and the business services as well as recruitment agencies use a more indirect writing style and personally address the potential candidates.
- Size and national or international focus of the company. Larger enterprises, export-oriented and foreign-owned companies focus on the employer's brand and career prospects for potential candidates. Over 80% of these companies' ads are in English.

Advertisements for lower positions are usually shorter and fewer information categories are used. These ads primarily list what the candidate can bring to be at an advantage in the role, the company description and the working conditions. Larger companies, as well as those in the information and financial sector, are trying to get away from cliché-filled lists of tasks, responsibilities and requirements that rely on phrasing like: *"We offer..."*; *"You want to ..."*; *"Do you want to ..."*; *"If you're here, you might expect ..."*; *"What should you be ideally ..."*; *"We are your company"*; *"We will do together ..."* etc. A general trend is to reduce and simplify text in online advertisements as well as to limit the exhaustive list of the obligations, responsibilities and requirements for taking a position. The reasons for this approach, according to interviewees, are related to the low quality of the workforce, the unwillingness of applicants to get into details, the increasingly limited opportunities to find the "ideal candidate", the generational differences in perception of information and the risk of repelling potential candidates by listing high requirements. In this regard, the content of the OJV does not focus on:

- Characteristics of the employment relations ⁽⁴³⁾;
- Designation of competences, according to national and international classifications and standards, references to competence models, etc. Typically, skill requirements and qualities of the personality in an essayist style are often mentioned, which many times sound like clichés;
- Core values, ethical norms and cultural "artefacts" of the organisation;
- Clauses of concluded collective agreements (at sector and organisation level).

The overwhelming part of the OJVs contains references to skills, competencies, and personality traits that are defined in the "Requirements to Applicants" category. The function of these references is to clarify the requirements and pre-selection of the candidates. However, these requirements are ambiguous, because there are no descriptions and explanations of behaviours that illustrate the knowledge of the relevant competence.

The most common soft skills requirements listed in OJVs are related to the following competences:

- Teamwork;
- Effective communication;
- Communication in a foreign language;
- Emotional intelligence;
- Building relationships;
- Assertiveness;
- Leadership;

⁽⁴³⁾ Form of the employment relationship: fixed-term contract, probation, unstructured working hours.

- Client-oriented;
- Tolerance to differences;
- Sense of responsibility.

The most common requirements for "hard, technical skills" in OJVs are related to the following competences:

- Safety and health at work;
- Environmental care;
- Digital skills and working with specialised software;
- Specific operations and operation of machines, tools and technologies;
- Working with technological documentation;
- Work with regulations and standards;
- Quality assurance;
- Personal effectiveness;
- Result orientation;
- Attention to detail and precision;
- Analytical thinking;
- Planning, organisation, control;
- Taking decisions and overcoming problems.

The most commonly requested personality traits in OJVs are related to the following qualities and characteristics:

- Readiness for continuous learning, improvement and professional development;
- Ability to work under pressure and stress;
- Working capacity;
- Flexibility and adaptability to change;
- Loyalty and dedication;
- Discipline and reliability;
- Independence and initiative.

In the majority of the OJVs there is a tendency to refine the requirements to the candidates and to increase the messages related to opportunities for training, professional development and career development. However, these messages are not specific and justification is not provided for how they match the work at hand.

With the exception of positions for "narrowly" qualified specialists, the requirements are generally straightforward, usually indicating the level and area of the required education, and no specific specialty is fixed.

Requirements related to the legal status of the applicant are only stated in online advertisements for internship programs. The PES handles all jobs related to state programs and labour re-activation of specific target groups (unemployed, youth, adults, and people with disabilities).

There are no directly discriminatory elements in the content of the OJVs. However, discriminatory messages in ads are deliberately alluded to by presenting content in English or by using "code words". Table 3 shows the types of "coded language" that is used and what the wording might imply.

Table 3: Use of code words in OJVs in Bulgaria

Type of message	Code words	Hidden meaning
Discriminatory	<i>Young and dynamic team</i>	Older people are not encouraged
	<i>Good career start</i>	Looking for a young person
	<i>You want to be financially independent</i>	We are looking for young people, maybe students
	<i>Intense physical load</i>	Women are not suitable
	<i>Smiling and welcoming</i>	Good looks, physically attractive
Enhancing the positive image of the enterprise	<i>International company</i>	Profitable, stable, prosperous, high standards. Stable job. A good future line in the candidate's CV.
	<i>Fast growing ...</i>	A new, unknown, small but ambitious company
	<i>A reputable company</i>	It suggests an established corporate identity. It means - a well-established company, popular, with good reputation and high standards. But, reputable companies are known and do not need this definition behind them, which often indicates that uncertainty surrounds the popularity and transparency of this business.
	<i>In connection with the expansion of the business we are looking for ...</i>	There is a high turnover of staff ⁽⁴⁴⁾
	<i>Sure job</i>	There is a competitive advantage in the form of financial and organisational stability. But in business, nothing is certain, especially when it comes to jobs. Often behind this message are hidden low wages and poor working conditions.
	<i>Correct labour relations</i>	It suggests a practice of respecting the law and the rights of the employee, insurance on gross wages, etc. It suggests problems in the relations with the employees.
Suggesting conditions	<i>Attractive remuneration</i>	Salary is directly related to results
	<i>Competitive remuneration</i>	Do not expect higher wages than the usual for the labour market
	<i>Motivating remuneration</i>	You will get what you deserve
	<i>Dynamic and challenging work</i>	Frequent business trips, willingness to change, constant problems, high workload, overtime
	<i>Interesting and diversified work</i>	Non-routine tasks, multiple functional obligations, changing requirements
	<i>Resistance to pressure and stress</i>	Intensive loading, frequent problems, incl. in relationships
Suggesting requirements for skills and abilities	<i>Sustainable motivation</i>	Do not overly anticipate
	<i>Positive thinking</i>	"The glass is not half empty, but half full"
	<i>Active sales</i>	Do not rely on existing clients but seek new contacts
	<i>Energetic</i>	Will need to work quickly, perhaps not just to be in the office, but to explore, take initiative and solve things right away and on the spot

Source: Dimitrov (2017).

⁽⁴⁴⁾ It is often found in the OJVs. Typically, the reason for declaring an OJV is that the employee, who was appointed on that position has left. Job-seekers note the constant publication of that ad and think that something is wrong and that the people who had occupied the position were not satisfied. To hide this effect, employers point out that the reason for declaring the OJV is an expansion of the company's business. Most often this situation occurs with positions where the remuneration is directly related to the results - insurance agents, advertising agents, distributors, sales persons, etc.

6.4. Main Differences between the Public and Private Online Job-portals

The main differences between private and state portals are the following:

- The activity of public online job-portals is regulated by the law;
- Public job-portals have strictly regulated target groups, format, classifiers and ad content;
- The services provided by public service portals are not commercial;
- Public online job-portals are linked to a specific infrastructure (state administration, employment services) that offers additional person-to-person services;
- Public portals have official rights and functions related to the EURES system;
- The market share of private online portals for work is significantly higher at 73%, with 27% for public portals; private portals are more preferred by employers, especially for positions requiring qualification ⁽⁴⁵⁾;
- The format, design and content of the OJVs in private online job-portals are more attractive, flexible and adaptable to labour market trends;
- Private job-portals offer more effective online features and services tailored to the needs of jobseekers.

6.5. Expected Trends in the Format and Content of OJVs

According to experts, online OJV ads will become shorter in text and will become increasingly focused on content to attract attention, present key messages and motivate potential candidates. Portals will be geared toward user comfort. "More dry" and comprehensive information about tasks, requirements, and other terms will be presented through various addendums to ads. This trend will force job sites to create additional space to place addendums or to opt out of the ban on links to corporate sites, accounts, and social networking messages. At the moment, some of the job-portals (e.g. Jobs.bg, Zaplata.bg, JobTiger.bg) offer an option to create questionnaires to inform employers in more detail about candidates' qualities and preferences. Applicants are also expected to have the opportunity to pose their questions online to employers.

Different online self-assessment tools, such as questionnaires, tests, case studies, serious games ⁽⁴⁶⁾, etc., will be posted to the advertisements. JobTiger.bg offers a link to the National Competency Assessment System, developed by the Bulgarian Industrial Association (BIA) and is available on the website www.mycompetence.bg. The MyCompetence system has competence models of 1300 key NCOP posts, 20 sector competence catalogues, online self-assessment tools for holding a specific job, e-tests for key competences, e-trainings, resource catalogues for skills development and qualification. The system allows access to international catalogues, taxonomies and positions and competence libraries such as ESCO, O * Net, e-Competence Framework, EUROccupations, DISCO, as well as international e-learning platforms

An increase in the interest in the E--Labour platform of the National Employment Agency, which has developed and implemented an electronic personal profile of a jobseeker, is expected; they are in the process of expanding online services and tools for assessment and self-assessment of

⁽⁴⁵⁾ According to data from the interview with the experts from BIA, the recruiting agencies, the online job portals and the results of the survey conducted by the employers and the job-seekers.

⁽⁴⁶⁾ Online games for developing professional knowledge and skills.

the jobseekers' skills and automated discovery compliance, matching between these skills and the employers' requirements.

References

Joerres Jeffrey A. (2011): Chairman and CEO of Manpower Inc., Speech to the World Economic Forum in Davos.

Beleva, Iskra (2015): Study report from the Institute for Economic Research at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences.

Bulgarian Industrial Association, Report on Best Practices for Establishing and Operating Profiles of Unemployed Jobseekers.

Friedrich Ebert Foundation in Bulgaria (2011), Trend Research Center survey.

Expert Interviews

Name of organisation	Type of organisation	Expert's position	Interview date
NSI	Statistical Office	Department of General Methodology and Analysis of Statistical Studies	27 April 2017
HR consultancy company	Labour market intermediary	Managing director	2 May 2017
HR consultancy company	Labour market intermediary	Managing director	3 May 2017
National Employment Agency	PES	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Head of the Intermediation Services Unit of the EA; • IT expert; • Head of Adult Vocational Guidance and Training; • Chief Directorate of the Directorate-General for Employment Services; • EURES Chief Adviser - National Coordinating Office in the EA 	4 May 2017
Private online job-portal	One of the most established private online job-portals	Managing director and associate	5 May 2017
HR recruitment agency	Labour market intermediary	Project manager	5 May 2017
Bulgarian Industrial Association	Employers' Association	Head of the National Competence Assessment Centre	9 May 2017

Annex 1: Research Process

18 April 2017-19 April 2017

Survey of data in the information system of the National Statistical Institute and Eurostat.

Keywords and search combinations: "labour market"; "Persons employed by economic activities and sectors"; "Persons employed by statistical area"; "Employment rate by age group", "movement of employees by economic sectors and statistical regions"; "Unemployed persons"; "persons employed"; "Monitoring business trends"; "Innovation"; "Business demography"; "Degree of urbanization"; "free workplaces"; "Labour market policies"; "Quality of employment"; "Digitization and use of digital technologies"; "Internet access"; "Enterprises with access to the Internet"; "Enterprises with Internet access by type of connection"; "Businesses with a website / webpage"; "Employees in enterprises using the Internet"; "Population, demography, migration and projections"; "Online job portals"; "Online vacancies"; "Online recruitment".

Websites: <http://www.nsi.bg>; <http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat>.

Number of visits - 20. Number of separate units of information relevant to some extent for the reports - 26.

The obtained data are related to labour market trends, demographic statistics and Internet access data. National statistics do not monitor data related to the OJV.

Sources offer official, reliable and up-to-date information that can be used indirectly for the topic of the study. There are no specific OJV data.

20 April 2017-24 April 2017

Survey of data and information on official websites of state institutions and agencies, research institutes and academic organizations; international institutions accredited in Bulgaria; employers' organisations, trade unions, non-governmental organizations.

Keywords and search combinations: *"labour legislation"; "Normative acts to promote employment"; "National classification of professions and positions"; "Protection against discrimination"; "Rules on the Recruitment and Appointment of Government employees"; job vacancy rules "; "Rules for announcing competitions for vacant positions"; "Calls for competitions"; "Sector analysis of the labour market"; "Labour market surveys, analysis and forecasts"; "Recruitment models", "preferred recruitment methods"; "Business trends"; "Demographic trends"; "Labour force status"; "Problems in staff selection"; "Online vacancies"; "Online recruitment"; "Online systems and recruitment portals"; "Number of vacancies declared"; "Job advertisements on the Internet"; "Internet access"; "Careers"; "Human Resources"; "Job sites" "Career sites"; "Career guidance sites"; "Funded projects related to the selection and management of human resources"; "Policies and measures on human resources management"; "Reports, positions and opinions related to the state of human resources"; "Priorities and strategies"; "Workplace"; "Skills of the workforce"; "Systems for forecasting needs for new skills"; "Skills shortages"; "Deficient professions"; "New professions"; "Professions of the future"; "Digital technologies", "use of social networks".*

Over 50 websites, the most important of which are: www.government.bg; www.mon.bg; <https://www.mlsp.government.bg/>; www.nssi.bg/; www.apis.bg/; <https://www.bia-bg.com/>;

<https://www.az.government.bg/>; www.navet.government.bg/; <https://www.mi.government.bg/>;

www.bica-bg.org; www.krib.bg; www.bcci.bg/; www.knsb-bg.org/; www.osf.bg/;
www.worldbank.org/bg/country/bulgaria; https://ec.europa.eu/commission/index_bg;
<https://www.ngobg.info/>; www.ipa.government.bg/; www.bas.bg/; <http://eures.bg/>.

Number of visits – 69. Number of units of information appropriate to some extent for the purpose of the reports - 93.

The obtained data are related to the trends of the labour market, demographic information, economic development, human capital status by economic sectors and regions, needs for new skills of the labour force; deficient and new occupations, career guidance issues, Internet access data, social networking activity. Data related to OJV are too few and are interpreted in a context other than the study's objectives.

Sources offer official, reliable, up-to-date and mostly expert information that can be used indirectly for the topic of the study. In Bulgaria, there have been no studies of work portals and approaches to the use of OJV.

25 April 2017-08 May 2017

Survey of data and information in specialized business and career websites, corporate websites, electronic media, social networks, recruitment agencies, etc.

Keywords and search combinations: *"job ads"; "Recruits"; "Work on the Internet"; "Online job portals"; "corporate website"; "My career"; "Online recruitment"; "Employer"; "Candidates"; "offers"; "Search"; "work in ... "; "Work for ... "; "Work like ... "; "free workplaces"; "Vacant positions"; "Job offers"; "Work-offers"; "A job abroad"; "seasonal job"; "Apprenticeship in an enterprise"; "part-time job"; "Work for students"; "Looking for work"; "Find work"; "Apply online"; "Appropriate work"; "Job messages"; "Necessary skills"; "Job requirements"; "Required education and experience"; "Job responsibilities"; "Prestigious work"; "finding a job"; "Recruitment of candidates"; "Successful career"; "Jobseekers through ..."; "Advantages and disadvantages of online recruitment"; "Workplace"; "Position"; "career"; "Salary"; "Online labor market"; "Posts for employers "; "Job posting reviews"; "Job preferences" "Searched positions"; "New professions"; "Requirements for job applicants"; "Job search strategies" "how to look for a job"; "How to find a job"; "Why we cannot find a job"; "" Information about employers "; "What kind of people are employers looking for"; "What skills are employers looking for"; "What professions are employers looking for"; "Recruitment publications"; "Preferred recruitment methods"; "Recruitment techniques"; "Opinions about online job portals"; "Everything for work"; "do social networks help jobseekers find a job"; "Help me get a job"; "internships"; "A job overseas"; "extra work"; "A choice between several job offers"; "What information is hidden in the job advert"; "How to write an online job ad"; "How to post job ads"; "What information should the job announcement contain"; "What is not a job announcement"; "The most common clichés in online job ads"; "Career Search Tips" "Labour Market Analysis in Bulgaria" "Legislation in the field of recruitment and selection of human resources".*

Websites – over 100, most important of which are: www.investor.bg; <https://money.bg>; www.Offnews.bg; www.Dnevnik.bg; www.Dnes.bg; www.Capital.bg; www.Dariknews.bg; www.Focus-news.net; www.bgnes.com; www.Fakti.bg; www.Webcafe.bg; www.http://industryinfo; <https://www.blitz.bg/>; <https://trud.bg/>; www.karieri.bg/; www.careerdays.bg/; <http://www.karierist.com/>; <http://www.youthbg.net/>; www.Google+; <https://www.secret.ly>;

www.Reddit.com; <http://www.economy.bg>; [www.Svejo.net](http://www.svejo.net); <http://www.karea-bg.com/>;
www.Twitter.com; www.kakvidastanem.bg; [www.Facebook.com](http://www.facebook.com); [www.Youtube.com](http://www.youtube.com);
www.Blogspot.com; www.linkedin.com; www.mycompetence.bg.

Number of visits – 102. Number of separate units of information relevant to some extent for the reports – 88.

The obtained data relates to the identification of online job portals, various publications, articles, consultations, discussions on career search, the quantity and quality of online job advertisements, jobseekers' expectations, the most common requirements for jobseekers, competencies, opinions about employers, discussions in social networks close to the subject of the survey.

Sources offer primarily reference, news, expertise, advice, consultation and feedback to users. The information is up-to-date but its reliability is limited, given that the publications reflect the editorial policy and personal opinions.

09 May 2017-17 May 2017

Using search platforms on the Internet.

Keywords and search combinations: *"job ads"; "Recruits"; "Work on the Internet"; "Online job portals"; "Online recruitment"; "Employer"; "Candidates"; "offers"; "Search"; "work in ... "; "Work for ..."; "Work like ..."; "free workplaces"; "Vacant positions"; "Job offers"; "Work-offers"; "A job overseas"; "seasonal job"; "Apprenticeship in an enterprise"; "part-time job"; "Work for students"; "Looking for work"; "Find work"; "Apply online"; "Appropriate work"; "Job messages"; "Necessary skills"; "Job requirements"; "Required education and experience"; "Job responsibilities"; "Prestigious work"; "finding a job"; "Recruitment of candidates"; "Successful career"; "Jobseekers through ..."; "Advantages and disadvantages of online recruitment"; "Workplace"; "Position"; "career"; "Salary"; "Online labour market"; "Posts for employers "; "Job posting reviews"; "Job preferences" "Searched positions"; "New professions"; "Requirements for job applicants"; "Job search strategies" "how to look for a job"; "How to find a job"; "Why we cannot find a job"; " Information about employers "; "What type of people are employers looking for"; "What skills are employers looking for"; "What professions are employers looking for"; "Recruitment publications"; "Preferred Recruitment Methods and Channels"; "Recruitment techniques"; "Opinions about online job portals"; "Everything about work"; "Help social networks for jobseekers"; "Help me get a job"; "internships"; "A job overseas"; "extra work"; "A choice between several job offers"; "What information is hidden in the job advert"; "How to write an online job ad"; "How to post job ads"; "What information should the job announcement contain"; "What is not a job announcement"; "The most common clichés in online job ads"; "Career Search Tips"; "Labour Market Analyses in Bulgaria"; "Legislation in the field of recruitment and selection of human resources".*

Online job search Platforms: <https://www.google.bg/>; <https://scholar.google.com/>;
<https://www.livejournal.com/>; <http://www.ebshost.com/academic/academic-search-premier>; Google images; Google Lens; Google Trends; Alta Vista; Excite; Infoseek; Northern Light; Fast Search; Monster.com; CreerPath; List of Bulgarian Portals and Search Engines – host.bg, specialized BG search engines for work (Buljobs, NAPRED.BG, bg.Jooble.org, sofiajobs.com), Catalog of Bulgarian websites.

Number of visits - 111. Number of units of information appropriate to some extent for the purpose of the reports.– 124.

Sources offer a variety of information depending on the keywords, their combinations, and the search approach. It combines old and up-to-date information. Interpreting information requires confidential analysis, expert judgment, additional verification and refinement.

18 April 2017-15 May 2017

Survey, monitoring, registration and analysis of the results of monitoring the identified online job portals.

Annex 2: Identified Online Job-portals

Grid for documenting the Google search for job-portals (Bulgarian and English)

Search 1	Обяви за работа	Job adverts
	615,000 резултата Първите 5 резултати: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sofiajobs.com; • Zaplata.bg; • Alo.bg; • Rabota.bg; • Jobs.bg. 	615,000 results Top 5 websites: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sofiajobs.com; • Zaplata.bg; • Alo.bg; • Rabota.bg; • Jobs.bg.
Search 2	Търсене на работа	Job search
	11,700,000 резултата - същите	11,700,000 results – mostly the same for the first page
Search 3	Свободни работни места	Job vacancies
	399,000 резултата Първи резултати: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Сайта на АЗ; • Регионално управление образованието РУО – София, Благоевград, Варна, Смолян, Русе и т.н.; • Сайт на община Добрич. Преобладават държавни институции	399,000 results Top results: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PES website; • Websites of regional education managements for Sofia, Blagoevgrad, Varna, Smolyan, Rousse etc.; • Website of Municipality of Dobrich. State institutions dominate in the results.
Search 4	Работа	Jobs
	556,000,000 резултата Първите резултати: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Jobs.bg; • Zaplata.bg; • Sofiajobs.com (regional for Sofia); • Rabota.bg; • Buljobs.bg. 	556,000,000 results Top 5 websites: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Jobs.bg; • Zaplata.bg; • Sofiajobs.com (regional for Sofia); • Rabota.bg; • Buljobs.bg.
Search 5	Сайтове за работа	Job websites

	<p>1,270,000 резултата</p> <p>Първите 5 резултати:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Rabota.bg; 2. Jobhow.org (blog on how to search/offer (for) job positions); 3. Buljobs.bg; 4. Rabota.start.bg; 5. Zaplata.bg. 	<p>1,270,000 results</p> <p>Top 5 websites:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rabota.bg; • Jobhow.org (blog on how to search/offer (for) job positions); • Buljobs.bg; • Rabota.start.bg; • Zaplata.bg.
	Оферти за работа	Job offers
Search 6	<p>6,850,000 резултата</p> <p>Първите 5 резултати:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Sofiajobs.com; 2. Rabota.bg; 3. Zaplata.bg; 4. Alo.bg; 5. Jobtiger.bg. 	<p>6,850,000 results</p> <p>Top 5 websites:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sofiajobs.com; • Rabota.bg; • Zaplata.bg; • Alo.bg; • Jobtiger.bg.
	Предлагам работа	Offering job
Search 7	<p>796,000 резултата</p> <p>Първите 5 резултати:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Marica.bg (сайт на фирма); • Sofiajobs.com; • Pozvanete.bg; • Alo.bg; • Zor.bg. 	<p>796,000 results</p> <p>Top 5 websites:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Marica.bg (company website); • Sofiajobs.com; • Pozvanete.bg; • Alo.bg; • Zor.bg.
	Търся работа	Job searching
Search 8	<p>937,000 резултата</p> <p>Първите 5 резултати:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Sofiajobs.com; 2. Pozvanete.bg; 3. Zaplata.bg; 4. Alo.bg; 5. Olx.bg. 	<p>937,000 results</p> <p>Top 5 websites:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Sofiajobs.com; 2. Pozvanete.bg; 3. Zaplata.bg; 4. Alo.bg; 5. Olx.bg.

Source: Dimitrov (2017).

Annex 3: Survey by the Bulgarian Industrial Association (2017)

SURVEY (Employers)

Dear Employers,

This study aims to explore the role of online job portals on the Bulgarian labor market. The findings of the survey will be used to improve the efficiency of online recruitment and selection processes. The questions are "closed-type" and you are expected to indicate with "X" the answer that you consider to best meet your needs and attitudes. Completing the survey will take no more than five minutes. Thank you in advance for your understanding!

1. Which approach (channel) for recruiting and selecting staff do you prefer and do you use most often? Please rate your preference in the table below from 0 to 3.

Key: „0“ - I do not use at all; „1“ - I rather not use it; „2“ - I rather use it; 3 - I prefer and use most often.

№	Approach / Channel for recruiting and selecting cadres	Preference			
		0	1	2	3
1.	Recruitment within the company				
2.	Interaction with specialized recruitment agencies				
3.	Interaction with Labor Offices				
4.	Interaction with educational institutions (internship and fellowship programs, career centers)				
5.	Ads on your own company site				
6.	Ads in online portals for work				
7.	Advertisements in the media - newspapers, magazines, radio, television				
8.	Interaction with staff leasing agencies				
9.	Attracting suitable candidates through training at the company's Vocational Training Center				
10.	Participation in national, sectoral or regional career forums and exhibitions				
11.	Other approaches. What are they?				

2. Which of the following Web sites do you recognize and know they only function as specialized online portals for work? Please mark "X" in the "Specialized Online Job Portal" column if you believe the website works only as an online search and employment platform.

No	Web site	Specialized online job portal
1.	Olx.bg	
2.	Emag.bg	
3.	Zaplata.bg	
4.	Bezplatno.net	
5.	JobTiger.bg	
6.	Bgzona.net	
7.	Lot.bg	
8.	Obqvi.net	
9.	Jobs.bg	
10.	Rabota.bg	
11.	Alo.bg	
12.	555.bg	
13.	Podatel.com	
14.	BestJobs.bg	
15.	Mycv.bg	
16.	Jobspace.bg	
17.	Kvant.biz	
18.	Malkiobqvi.com	
19.	Sofiajobs.com	
20.	Intercompass.bg	
21.	bgrabotodatel.com	
22.	Rabotiv.com	
23.	Jobsagents.com	
24.	BGObqva.com	
25.	Buljobs.bg	
26.	Iskamrabota.bg	
27.	Predlaga.bg	
28.	Post.bestjobs.bg	
29.	Jobco.bg	
30.	Rabotnimesta.com	

3. Please, indicate what you think are the three most popular online job portals in Bulgaria (preferred by employers and jobseekers). Please rate the online portals you have specified on a scale of 1 to 3, depending on your preferences.

No	Name of the online job portal	Rating		
		1	2	3

4. Why would you prefer to use an online job portal in the recruitment and selection process? Please select up to three of the following benefits (motives) by marking them with the "X" in the appropriate answer column.

No	Advantages of online ads on a specialized portal	Mark with „X“
1.	Saving time and effort, speed and convenience	
2.	Saving of funds, reducing the cost of selection	
3.	Transparency of the recruitment and selection procedure	
4.	Optimal coverage of target audiences and targeting a wider range of relevant potential job candidates	
5.	Opportunity to search and attract talent	
6.	Ensure a larger base of candidates as a basis for recruiting and selection	
7.	Opportunity to promote the Employer brand and the benefits of the enterprise	
8.	Opportunity to design information and focus on key messages to candidates	
9.	Opportunity for faster and more effective communication and feedback to candidates of interest	
10.	Opportunity to attract mobile workforce, candidates from other settlements close to the location of the enterprise	
11.	Opportunity to provide backup footage	
12.	Opportunity to study the labor market	
13.	Other advantages. What are they?	

5. What disadvantages do you think the functioning of online job portals have at this stage?
Please select up to three of the answers listed below by marking them with the "X" in the corresponding answer column.

No	I'm not satisfied with:	Mark with „X“
1.	Lack of functionalities for pre-selection of candidates according to the company's stated criteria	
2.	Lack of online tools for ex-ante evaluation and self-assessment of candidates' competencies	
3.	Unreliable, unverified, non-standardized information in the CVs of the candidates	
4.	Lack of unified, internationally accepted classification of sectors and areas of work	
5.	Lack of a link to the corporate site and to corporate profiles and social networking initiatives	
6.	Lack of uniform standards, dictionaries and classifiers to describe competencies and other requirements to the announced positions	
7.	Difficult orientation in the web site's structure	
8.	Slow loading of pages	
9.	Lack of additional functionality and service options to users	
10.	Other disadvantages. What?	

Company information

Name	
Address	
Average number of staff	
Economic sector	

SURVEY (Jobseekers)

Dear ladies and gentlemen,

This study aims to explore the role of online job portals on the Bulgarian labor market. The findings of the survey will be used to improve the efficiency of online job portals and online recruitment and selection processes. The questions are of "closed type" and you are expected to indicate "X" the answer you think corresponds to the greatest extent to your needs and attitudes. Completing the survey will take no more than five minutes. Thank you in advance for your understanding!

Which approach (job search channel) do you prefer and do you most often use?

Please rate your preferences for the following online recruitment and selection channels and rate them on a scale from 0 to 3.

Key: „0“ - I do not use at all; „1“ - I rather not use it; „2“ - I rather use it; 3 - I prefer and use most often.

№	Approach / Channel for recruiting and selecting cadres	Preference			
		0	1	2	3
1.	Information and assistance from relatives and acquaintances				
2.	Recruitment agency services				
3.	Labor office services				
4.	Survey of online ads on specialized job sites				
5.	Direct contacts with employers				
6.	Create an account in the social networks				
7.	Research of advertisements in the media - newspapers, magazines, radio, television				
8.	Participation in internship programs				
9.	Visit to national, sectoral or regional career forums and exhibitions				
11.	Other approaches. What are they?				

1. **Which of the following web sites do you recognize and know they only function as specialized online portals for work?** Please mark "X" in the "Specialized Online Job Portal" column if you believe the website works only as an online search and employment platform.

№	Web sites	Specialized online job portal
1.	Olx.bg	
2.	Emag.bg	
3.	Zaplata.bg	
4.	Bezplatno.net	
5.	JobTiger.bg	
6.	Bgzona.net	
7.	Lot.bg	
8.	Obqvi.net	
9.	Jobs.bg	
10.	Rabota.bg	
11.	Alo.bg	
12.	555.bg	
13.	Podatel.com	

14.	BestJobs.bg	
15.	Mycv.bg	
16.	Jobspace.bg	
17.	Kvant.biz	
18.	Malkiobqvi.com	
19.	Sofiajobs.com	
20.	Intercompass.bg	
21.	bgrabotodatel.com	
22.	Rabotiv.com	
23.	Jobsagents.com	
24.	BGObqva.com	
25.	Buljobs.bg	
26.	Iskamrabota.bg	
27.	Predlaga.bg	
28.	Post.bestjobs.bg	
29.	Jobco.bg	
30.	Rabotnimesta.com	

2. Please, indicate what you think are the three most popular online job portals in Bulgaria (preferred by employers and jobseekers). Please rate the online portals you have specified on a scale of 1 to 3, depending on your preferences.

№	Name of the online job portal	Rating		
		1	2	3

3. Why would you prefer to use an online job search portal for finding a job? Please select up to three of the following benefits (motives) by marking them with the "X" in the appropriate answer column.

№	Advantages of online ads on a specialized portal	Mark with „X“
1.	Saving time and effort, speed and convenience	
2.	Access to more ads and employers	
	Access to company information	
3.	Opportunity to compare and choose the most appropriate suggestions	
4.	Opportunity to react quickly	
5.	Brief, synthesized and clear information about the announced position	
6.	Reliability of information	
7.	Ability to orientate about the labor market demand and employers' overriding requirements	
9.	Other advantages. What are they?	

4. What do you find not satisfactory about the online portals at this stage? Please select up to three of the answers listed below by marking them with the "X" in the corresponding answer column.

№	I'm not content with:	Mark with „X“
1.	Disappointment from applying in many places and lack of affirmative response, even of simple feedback from employers	
2.	Insufficient or incorrect information in ads	
3.	Unattractive, trivial, dry, haughty or boring style and frequent clichés in the ad description	
4.	Excessively high or unclear requirements for the candidates' qualities	
5.	Fake ads	
6.	Employer anonymity with an agency listing	
7.	Lack of online tools for ex-ante evaluation and self-assessment of the competences and qualities of the candidates	
8.	Lack of opportunity to position your own CV and portfolio, regardless of ads	
9.	Difficult orientation in the website's structure	
10.	Slow loading of pages	
11.	Lack of additional functionality and service options for users	
12.	Other disadvantages. What?	

Information about the person

Age and gender	
Address	
Education	
Employment (studying, unemployed, busy but looking for a more suitable job)	