

Long-term cross-country mobility in apprenticeships

Draft Case Study Report

Cedefop project on Long-term cross-country mobility in apprenticeships
(service contract AO/DLE/RCDC_LRUST/ Long-term cross-country mobility
in apprenticeships/ no/2018)

France

By Vincent JOSEPH & Romain PIGEAUD, February 2020



Centre Info



In cooperation with ICF S.A

Disclaimer

This text is presented in its original form.

It has neither been revised nor edited by Cedefop.

Table of contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
INTRODUCTION.....	4
Framework level	4
System level	6
Implementation level	8
CHAPTER 1. STATE OF PLAY.....	16
1.1. Framework level	17
1.1.1. Dimension 1.1. Overall size and training capacity of companies 17	
1.1.2. Dimensions 1.2. and 1.3. Sectoral employers' organisations (SEO) in the national, international and European context.....	18
1.1.3. Dimensions 1.4. Intra-EU trade; 1.5. Enterprise foreign affiliates; 1.6. International sourcing.....	20
1.1.4. Dimension 1.7. Intra-EU labour migration for skilled labour.....	22
1.1.5. Dimension 1.8. Skills shortages in medium-level occupations	24
1.1.6. Dimension 1.10. Immigration policy	24
1.1.7. Dimension 1.11. International qualifications	25
1.1.8. Dimension 1.12. Tradition regarding cross-border VET and/or labour mobility.....	27
1.2. System level	28
1.2.1. Dimension 2.1. Apprenticeship type and 2.3. Apprenticeship function	28
1.2.2. Dimensions 2.2. Share of VET students in apprenticeship schemes	29
1.2.3. Dimensions 2.4. Apprenticeship governance; 2.5. Funding of the in-company training;.....	29
1.2.4. Dimensions 2.6. Duration of the whole apprenticeship period; 2.7 Duration of in-company placements; 2.8. Alternance	30
1.2.5. Dimensions 2.9. Type of contract; 2.10. Status of apprentices; 2.11. Remuneration; 2.12. Occupational health & safety standards and social insurance	32

1.2.6. Dimensions 2.13. Curriculum training standard; 2.14. Use of validation; 2.15 Legal basis for apprenticeships and integration of mobility	35
1.3. Implementation level.....	38
1.3.1. Dimension 3.1. Governance of apprenticeship implementation	38
1.3.2. Dimension 3.2. Age of apprentices at enrolment	39
1.3.3. Dimension 3.3. Employers' attitude towards apprenticeship ...	39
1.3.4. Dimensions 3.4 and 3.5 (Long-term) mobility national strategies or initiatives; 3.15 Pilot projects for (long-term) mobility	40
1.3.5. Dimension 3.7. Methodologies and guidelines	42
1.3.6. Dimensions 3.8. Authorities promoting long-term mobility if apprentices; 3.9. Involvement of intermediary organisations and structures;	43
1.3.7. Dimension 3.10. Role and capacity of VET providers in implementing mobility	44
1.3.8. Dimension 3.11. Funding of long-term mobility.....	45
1.3.9. Dimensions 3.12. Employers' interest in receiving apprentices from abroad on long-term mobility; 3.13. Employers' interest in letting apprentices go abroad on long-term mobility; 3.14. Apprentices and their families' interest in long-term mobility	46
CHAPTER 2. LATEST AND FUTURE DEVELOPMENTS.....	48
CONCLUSIONS.....	51

Introduction

Framework level

Among the 500 leading global companies, 29 are French.¹ In 2016, France was the 7th largest exporter in the world and the 4th largest exporter of services.²

France performs in line with the EU average in internationalisation.³ However, it is worth mentioning here the current major policy push to increase the degree of internationalisation of French firms. During 2017 and the first quarter of 2018, the French Prime Minister announced the new strategy for international export support.⁷⁵ Its four objectives are to:

- (i) make France's regions a launch-pad for internationalisation based on Team France Export;
- (ii) develop simpler, more efficient export support;
- (iii) ensure greater proximity on the ground for access to public financing abroad;
- (iv) and ensure companies have employees trained for international trade, given that the success and sustainability of exports depend largely on the level of skills of employees.⁴

Moreover, since 2008, 'Business France,' the main French agency for export promotion, has been strengthened through additional resources to support 10,000 companies (in 2009), the merger with similar departments located outside the Ministry of the Economy (in 2011), and the merger with the French Agency for International Investment (in 2015). These mergers were designed to streamline the various smaller agencies and bring them under one umbrella. These measures helped increase the number of exporting companies by 4,000 in 2015. Even so, the overall number of companies exporting to foreign markets remained relatively low, at 125,000 in 2015.⁵

SMEs make a significant contribution to the French 'non-financial business economy'. They account for 55.2% of value added, close to the EU average of 56.8%. Their share of employment, at 61.6%, is somewhat lower than the EU average of 66.4%.⁶ Significantly, in 2016, the percentage of other Member States' SMEs exporting within the EU (17.3%) was more than double that of French SMEs

¹ Global fortune 2016

² Business France 2018 report

³ European Commission, (2017). *2017 SBA Fact Sheet – France*

⁴ Ibid

⁵ Ibid

⁶ Ibid

(7.8%).⁷ A number of administrative services exist to help SMEs expand across national borders. However, the multiplicity of administrative services and the general lack of coordination among these services result in suboptimal supporting environment. The support system is thus complex, which means that it is harder for SMEs than for large companies to do cross-border business.⁸

That said, the consolidation of agencies and responsibilities mentioned above has increased efficiency and enabled resources previously consumed by administrative processes to be reallocated towards internationalisation. This has seen the number of companies exporting increase for four consecutive years, with an additional 4,000 companies sending products or services overseas since 2015.⁹ Crucially, SMEs are also playing a growing role in internationalisation efforts, with 26,000 new SMEs exporting in 2016.¹⁰

Employer organisations in certain sectors – namely: construction and public works, automotive, and crafts sectors – are highly involved in supporting apprenticeships and promoting international mobility for apprentices.¹¹ For instance, for the construction and public works sector, the social partners have set a target of 1,000 persons engaged in European mobility by 2020.¹²

The participation of sectoral bodies in existing EU or international networks enable them to develop mobility programmes in partnership with counterparts from other countries. Pre-existing contacts help build relationships of trust between host and sending organisations and share knowledge about the specific apprenticeship-related context, content and requirements in their respective countries.

Given the relatively high number of French multinational companies, the existence of foreign affiliates may enable employers to understand the benefits of work/apprenticeship related mobility, as well as the practical aspects of organising such mobility. Nevertheless, this may not be systematically correlated to a higher level of employer involvement and interest in mobility.

⁷ Ibid

⁸ Ibid

⁹ European Commission, (2018). *2018 SBA Fact Sheet – France*

¹⁰ Ibid

¹¹ C.f. some of the organisations that participated to the « Territorial conference of the mobility of apprentices » <http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/evenement/496/assises-territoriales-de-la-mobilite-des-apprentis-atma>

¹² For all types of mobility, short and long, apprentices and pedagogical staff. http://www.education-permanente.fr/public/articles/articles.php?id_revue=1753&id_article=2729#resume2729

System level

In France, two type of contracts enable to access to a qualification by alternating learning in a training centre and training in a company, with the status of employee: the apprenticeship contract and the professionalisation contract.

An apprenticeship contract ("*contrat d'apprentissage*") is understood as an employment contract enabling young people to follow a theoretical and practical curriculum in order to acquire a professional qualification. The apprenticeship contract is an employment contract of special type concluded between the apprentice or his representative legal and the employer, established according to a standard contract, as defined if the Labour code. The employment contract alternates periods of learning in apprentice training centres (*Centres de formation par apprentissage* – CFA) and periods of in-company work and work-based learning. The apprenticeship contract is primarily intended for young people aged 16 to 29 who have completed their compulsory education, but can also apply to young people aged 15, if they can prove that they have completed lower secondary education, and also to certain groups over 29 years of age.

Apprentices spend 60% to 75% of their time learning and working in a company. The period of training in a CFA is at least 25% for the two-year (European Qualifications Framework, EQF Level 3) professional skills certificate (*Certificat d'aptitudes professionnelles, CAP*)¹³ (for apprentices in skilled manual occupations) and at least 25% for the three-year (EQF Level 4) vocational baccalaureate.

The duration of the apprenticeship contract can vary from 6 months to 3 years depending on the type of profession and the qualification studied. The maximum duration may be increased to 4 years when the status of disabled worker is recognised. The apprentice receives a salary calculated according to his age and progress in the training cycle(s) of the apprenticeship. Employers that conclude an apprenticeship contract are entitled to state subsidies. They also benefit from an almost total exemption of social security contributions. Companies are also supported by a new simplified grants system for hiring apprentices.

Apprenticeships are seen as facilitating labour market integration and as an effective instrument for tackling youth unemployment. Around half of apprentices work in the company where they had completed their apprenticeship. Moreover, according to a recent study, in France, 67% of apprentices were in employment seven months after finishing their apprenticeship.¹⁴

¹³ CAP: *Certificat d'Aptitude Professionnelle*, vocational skills certificate at secondary education level

¹⁴ European Parliament, (2017). *Skills Development and Employment: Apprenticeships, Internships and Volunteering*, Study for the DG EMPL Committee, [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2017/602056/IPOL_STU\(2017\)602056_EN.pdf](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2017/602056/IPOL_STU(2017)602056_EN.pdf)

Yet, despite the better employment outcomes, only 7% of young people aged 16 to 25 undertake an apprenticeship in France, compared to 15% in European countries where the youth unemployment rate is low.¹⁵ Moreover, the number of apprentices has declined over recent years in France.¹⁶

Indeed, in an effort to improve school-to-work transitions and boost youth employment, the French government has embarked on an ambitious vocational education and training (VET)/apprenticeship reform programme.¹⁷ This ambitious VET reform, initiated in 2017, encompasses all stages of apprenticeships and covers the funding of apprenticeships, including incentives targeted at SMEs.¹⁸ The French government is also planning improvements in school-based VET which represents around 75% of I-VET. Significantly, the measures aim to improve the attractiveness and labour market relevance of apprenticeships.¹⁹

New legal provisions came into force in 2018, aimed at removing obstacles to long-term European mobility for apprentices, including the suspension of French employers' liability during the period of mobility abroad (1 months to 12 months), and simplified processes for short mobility periods (less than 4 weeks).

In addition, the new legal provisions offer the newly created Skills Operators (*Opérateurs de compétences* – OPCOs²⁰) the possibility to financially cover social contributions, remuneration, and ancillary costs of apprentices. Among their tasks, skills operators will support SMEs in anticipating skill needs and designing appropriate skills development training programmes for their employees (*plans de développement des compétences*). OPCOs will also be responsible for developing apprenticeships.²¹

¹⁵ <https://www.gouvernement.fr/apprentissage-en-clair>

¹⁶ European Parliament, (2017). *Skills Development and Employment: Apprenticeships, Internships and Volunteering*, Study for the DG EMPL Committee, [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2017/602056/IPOL_STU\(2017\)602056_EN.pdf](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2017/602056/IPOL_STU(2017)602056_EN.pdf)

¹⁷ European Commission, (2018). *Education and Training Monitor 2018 - France*, https://ec.europa.eu/education/sites/education/files/document-library-docs/et-monitor-report-2018-france_en.pdf

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ Ibid

²⁰ OPCOs will replace the social partners' *Organismes Paritaires Collecteurs Agréés (OPCA)* (Joint Commission for Collective Training) which are authorised joint collection bodies responsible for collecting, pooling and redistributing the financial contributions due by companies for professional training, <https://www.insee.fr/en/metadonnees/definition/c1823>

²¹ <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/news-and-press/news/refernet-france-reforming-continuing-vocational-training-2018-bill>

Implementation level

French cross-border VET mobility is well developed compared to most other EU Member States. France includes VET mobility as a target of learner mobility under the ET 2020 strategy, noting the role of school partnerships both inside and outside Erasmus+.^{22,23} To this end, the French government's objective is for 15,000 young people to spend periods of training abroad by 2022.²⁴ This government's mobility target encompasses both short and long-term apprenticeship mobility and can include both learners on 'apprenticeship contracts and 'professionalisation contracts'.

The French bodies promoting and implementing the long-term cross-border mobility of apprentices are the Ministry of Labour, the Ministry of Education, and the Erasmus+ agency France Education/Formation. All of them seek to widely promote and disseminate the benefits of the Erasmus+ programme for VET learners and apprentices. For example, a special study has been recently conducted by the MEP Jean Arthuis at the request of the Minister of Labour; the report "Erasmus Pro: removing obstacles to the mobility of apprentices in Europe" was published in January 2018.

VET mobility is encouraged explicitly in French legislation. The law on 'the liberty of choosing one's career',²⁵ which came into force in September 2018, aims to remove obstacles to long-term European mobility for apprentices. Furthermore, recent reforms to the Labour Code (March 2018) and to the VET system (September 2018) include measures that support the mobility of apprentices and trainees in apprenticeship training schemes.²⁶ One section in the Labour Code is dedicated to International and European mobility of apprentices.

As mentioned earlier, under the new law, French employers are no longer legally responsible for the remuneration of apprentices and for ensuring compliant working conditions for apprentices during their period of mobility abroad, as it was previously the case. The host employer or training provider is now solely responsible regarding compliance with aspects such as the apprentice's working

²² http://www.education.gouv.fr/pid25535/bulletin_officiel.html?cid_bo=57077

²³ European Commission, (2019). *Vocational mobility in Europe: Analysing provision, take-up and impact*, Final report prepared by ICF for the European Commission, May, <https://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=738&langId=en&pubId=8216&furtherPubs=yes>

²⁴ Ibid

²⁵ Loi n° 2018-771 du 5 Septembre 2018 pour la liberté de choisir son avenir professionnel.

²⁶ European Commission, (2019). *Vocational mobility in Europe: Analysing provision, take-up and impact*, Final report prepared by ICF for the European Commission, May, <https://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=738&langId=en&pubId=8216&furtherPubs=yes>

time, health and safety, remuneration, and weekly leave, in accordance with the legal and contractual provisions of the country concerned.²⁷

Significantly, the new law also aims to facilitate long mobility periods abroad and simplifies processes for short mobility periods: the period abroad may vary from six months to maximum one year. In addition, the duration of apprenticeship contracts may now be adjusted considering the skills acquired during the mobility period abroad. This is possible through an agreement between the training provider, the French employer and the apprentice. For short mobility periods (less than 4 weeks), an agreement governing the provision of staff also needs to be concluded between the parties concerned.

The new law also allows for more flexibility regarding the content of apprenticeship training abroad: The provisions of the Labour Code that define the content of training for apprenticeships no longer apply during the period of mobility abroad.²⁸ While this gives certain degree of freedom in terms of skills development and skills acquisition, it also raises the question of ensuring the quality of training content.

It is also important to mention that the French apprenticeship curriculum allows for its discretionary and flexible adaptation to accommodate learning outcomes from mobility arrangements lasting six months or more.

In addition to a favourable legislative framework, the other supporting factors of cross-country mobility in France include:

- **Strong political support and commitment:** the current government is aiming to generalise Erasmus and extend it to apprenticeships with a special focus on long-term mobility. The government is also looking to develop Erasmus Pro so that apprentices could also benefit from that programme as much as possible. France has also developed bi-national secondary school-leaving certificates with Germany, Spain and Italy.
- **A long tradition of VET mobility combined with a raft of pre-existing mobility programmes for apprentices:** these include the long-standing programmes of the *Compagnons du Devoir*,²⁹ the French automobile industry³⁰ and construction sector, and a series of initiatives by the Ministry of

²⁷

<https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do?idSectionTA=LEGISCTA000036760676&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006072050&dateTexte=20180623>

²⁸ The (field) research will seek to establish whether this gives certain degree of freedom in terms of skills development and skills acquisition, it also raises the question of ensuring the quality of training content.

²⁹ <https://www.compagnons-du-devoir.com/>

³⁰ For example, the promotion of European mobility has been part of the automotive sector's training policy for more than 20 years. To this end, the Association Nationale pour la Formation Automobile et la Mobilité (ANFA) has developed a strategy and

National Education within the Franco-German exchange and cooperation framework.³¹

- **A positive view of apprenticeship mobility in French society:** in general, the French society values apprentices' work and life experiences abroad and the acquisition of new technical, language and social skills which apprentices can then share with others upon their return.
- **The existence of agencies dedicated to cross-border mobility in the field of VET:** such agencies include the Franco-German agency "Pro-Tandem" and the Franco-German Youth Office offering exchanges between France and Germany.³²

The development of long-term mobility requires the involvement of two types of actors from the field of VET: Apprentices' Training Centres – CFAs – and the "skill operators" (*OPCOs - Opérateurs de compétences*).

The newly established OPCOs are responsible for developing apprenticeship and professional development schemes and can fund (partially or totally) apprenticeship mobility.

As learning outcomes from mobility can be accommodated and recognised in the French system, prior to mobility the Apprentices' Training Centre (CFA) must contact the authorities abroad responsible for issuing the diploma or certification to ensure that all or part of a set of skills can be assessed abroad as part of mobility and identify under what conditions this assessment is possible.³³

A decree was issued by the Ministry of Education in January 2019 concerning the professional diplomas the Apprentices Training Centre can award.³⁴ It sets out in the Education Code's general regulations all the professional diplomas allowing

measures to promote learner, teacher & trainer mobility and help training providers develop European partnerships. ANFA is in charge of the Unit for European Mobility and Qualifications, which provides pedagogical, technical, organisational and, occasionally, financial support to training centres in starting new mobility projects. ANFA has developed a strong network of European partners who work together to develop European mobility in the automotive sector. ANFA also worked with the European Commission for years to supply the ECVET Team, and subsequently created a network of mobility advisers.

³¹ European Commission, (2019). *Vocational mobility in Europe: Analysing provision, take-up and impact*, Final report prepared by ICF for the European Commission, May, <https://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=738&langId=en&pubId=8216&furtherPubs=yes>

³² <https://protandem.org/fr/>

³³ http://cache.media.eduscol.education.fr/file/Diplomes_professionnels/44/2/Vademecum-mobilite-EN-2015_05_489442.pdf

³⁴ Décret n° 2019-14 du 8 janvier 2019 relatif au cadre national des certifications professionnelles

for transnational mobility during the period of study, both within and outside the EU, whether in training institutions or in the workplace.

In this regard, toolkits have already been published by the Ministry of Labour, for companies and Apprentice training centres.³⁵ The Erasmus+ agency, in partnership with the *Association Nationale pour la Formation Automobile et la Mobilité (ANFA)* (automotive industry), has published a skills reference framework for European and international mobility coordinators in Apprentice training centres.³⁶

The Euroguidance website offers a range of resources and information services on European mobility for professionals.³⁷ Regarding professional diplomas in National Education, a vade mecum (Handbook/Guide) has been published by the Ministry of National Education for the attention of training institutions: "Implementation of mobility for certification purposes in Europe in professional diplomas".³⁸

Euroguidance also provides information on existing funding sources for mobility.³⁹ Some specific funding is, for instance, provided by the Franco-German Youth Office (FGYO/OFAJ) or Pro-Tandem exchanges, while regional funding differs from one region to another. For example, the FGYO/OFAJ is an international organisation working for Franco-German cooperation, which has enabled nearly 9 million young people from Germany and France to participate in 320,000 exchange programmes since 1963. Its annual budget is €24.7m.⁴⁰ However, some practical issues linked to the implementation of the new legal provisions, intending to lift the barriers to apprentice mobility, need to be specified. For example, one needs to specify the practical consequences of the suspension of the employer's liability (see subsection 1.1.2).

Some sectoral networks have historically been among the most involved actors promoting mobility of apprentices, along with networks linked to the development of apprenticeships like the Chambers of Commerce and Industry, Chamber of Trades and Crafts, or the *Compagnons du Devoir*. The latter is the national vocational training provider (and crafts guild) for 30 manual/crafts trades – has overseen these for the past nine centuries – and runs a number of apprenticeship mobility programmes. The *Compagnons du Devoir* have a long-

³⁵ <https://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/ministere/documentation-et-publications-officielles/guides/kits-mobilite-alternance>

³⁶ http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/docs/2731_guide_cfa_final.pdf

³⁷ <https://www.euroguidance-france.org/espace-professionnel/ressources-pour-les-professionnels/>

³⁸ http://cache.media.eduscol.education.fr/file/Diplomes_professionnels/44/2/Vade-mecum-mobilite-EN-2015_05_489442.pdf

³⁹ <https://www.euroguidance-france.org/financer-sa-mobilite/>

⁴⁰ Franco-German Youth Office (FGYO/OFAJ), (2016). *The Franco-German Youth Office - Building bridges between cultures, generations and societies*

standing tradition of mobility, promote European mobility to the apprentices they train using a variety of tools, including a blog.⁴¹

Some Apprenticeship Training Centres (CFAs) have also developed a high level of expertise in mobility, especially the ones which have participated in pilot projects on the long-term cross-border mobility of apprentices.⁴²

The law of September 2018 establishes new requirements for CFAs: among other things, they must: encourage the national and international mobility of apprentices by appointing dedicated staff, which may include a “mobility advisor”; mobilise local resources at national level and making use of European Union programmes at international level; and provide information where appropriate on mobility periods in the content of the training. However, this will require substantial investment by the CFAs in human resources and staff training.

Several heterogenous factors and their impacts on cross-border mobility in France to be examined include:

- Foreign language skills of French learners, especially among VET learners – compared with many other European countries, the foreign language skills of French learners are poor, especially the language skills of VET learners;
- The personal and socio-economic situation of young people (education, health, employment situation, etc.);
- The academic calendars of apprenticeship training centres (CFAs) that may clash with the period for the mobility abroad;
- The complexity of administrative procedures for skills certification and for validating Erasmus+ credits;
- Variations in terms of interest in apprenticeship mobility across different sectors, also related to the existence or not of demand for specific skills (skills shortages).

There are several nationally recognised (short and long-term) apprenticeship mobility schemes in France. These include:

- **The Franco-German Youth Office (FGYO/OFAJ)**⁴³ pilot project for the mobility of apprentices, the purpose of which is to strengthen the professional dimension of Erasmus+, so that young apprentices benefit from the same mobility opportunities as students; this enhances the employability of the young beneficiaries. The role of the FGYO/OFAJ in this initiative is to prepare participants for mobility: it provides language courses for individual language

⁴¹ <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/sl/publications-and-resources/data-visualisations/mobility-scoreboard/country-fiches>

⁴² Members of the consortium European Apprenticeship Ambassador EAA and EAA Go further

⁴³ <https://www.fgyo.org/>

preparation and an intercultural seminar to make apprentices aware of the specificities of working in a company in Germany.

- **"European Apprenticeship Ambassadors"** is the name of a consortium of 31 VET training centres from 10 European Union countries, launched with the support of the European Commission in 2016. The project aimed to develop the long-term mobility of apprentices and post-apprentices (graduates less than 12 months), through:
 - the implementation of training pathways including a mobility of 6 to 12 consecutive months, with a work-linked training modality in the host country
 - the identification of obstacles and search for solutions to remove them to long-distance mobility

In 2016 and 2017, the project enabled 55 departures of young people in long-term mobility to be organised, and the partners to identify 54 obstacles to the LTMA, whether at local, national or European level.

It was continued in 2017 by the **"European Apprenticeship Ambassadors - Go Further"** project, involving 14 organisations from 10 European countries and supported by the European Commission. The second consortium aims to:

- Focus on the recognition and validation of competences acquired in mobility to obtain a qualification in the country of origin,
- Supporting consortium members located in a country other than France in removing their national obstacles,
- Open the consortium to other European countries (Belgium and Czech Republic).

The consortium has built on the work initiated by the first pilot project in order to go further, by proposing twinning agreements between European VET centres or initiating new training paths. The project has enabled the organisation of 49 long mobility schemes for apprentices and post-apprentices.

- **Chambres de Commerce et d'Industrie (CCI) France**⁴⁴ (the network of Chambers of Commerce and Industry in France) has launched and is supporting the "Movil'App" programme (European Mobility and Apprenticeship).⁴⁵ This is a European mobility programme which enables young people to undertake a work placement anywhere in Europe. Not only does it target apprentices, but also post-apprentices, trainers or vocational training decision-makers. Since 2007, when it was launched, Movil'App has enabled more than 5,800 people –learners and trainers / tutors – to benefit from learning mobility across the EU.⁴⁶ The programme is co-financed by the

⁴⁴ <https://www.cci.fr/>

⁴⁵ <https://www.cci.fr/web/apprentissage/apprendre-en-europe/-/article/Le+programme+MOVIL%60APP/ou-se-renseigner>

⁴⁶ <http://eose.org/ressource/movilapp/>

European Commission through ERASMUS +, KA1 Mobility for VET learners and staff.⁴⁷

Several other supportive actions for the promotion and development of apprenticeship mobility schemes also exist in addition to the ones described above:

- The Ministry of Agriculture, Agri-Food and Forestry has set up MOVEAGRI,⁴⁸ a website that functions as a social network promoting internships abroad. The website provides information on the different subsidies available for undertaking an internship abroad and promotes the sharing of experiences, tips and testimonials to help prospective applicants prepare for their internship abroad. Moreover, within the framework of a partnership between the Erasmus+ France Education Training Agency and the Ministry of Agriculture, a network of advisers dedicated to international mobility and the Erasmus+ programme in agricultural education has been set up.⁴⁹
- The APCMA (Permanent Assembly of Chambers of Arts and Crafts) set up the "EuroApprentissage"⁵⁰ network in 2009 in response to a call for proposals from the European Commission. The objective has been to create, for the European craft industries, a "network of networks" for the mobility of apprentices, supported by an Internet platform for the dissemination of tools.
- As mentioned earlier, ANFA (National Association for Automobile Training), a skills operator in the automotive services sector has implemented the Unit for European Mobility and Qualifications, which provides pedagogical, technical, organisational and, occasionally, financial support to training centres in terms of starting new mobility projects. ANFA has developed a strong network of European partners who work together to develop European mobility opportunities in the automotive sector. ANFA has also created a network of mobility advisers.
- The CCCA-BTP,⁵¹ the first European learning and training network in the construction sector, is implementing a European initiative with actions on European mobility and engineering education for the benefit of companies and young people involved in strategic projects. These projects are carried out within the framework of the European Commission's Erasmus+ programme.

Mobility initiatives also exist at regional level. For example, as part of the Interreg V project "Succeeding without borders" co-financed by the European

⁴⁷ <http://eose.org/ressource/movilapp/>

⁴⁸ <http://moveagri.ning.com/>

⁴⁹ <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/sl/publications-and-resources/data-visualisations/mobility-scoreboard/country-fiches>

⁵⁰ <http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/projet/39/l-erasmus-des-apprentis-le-projet-euroapprentissage>

⁵¹ <https://www.ccca-btp.fr/>

Regional Development Fund (ERDF) and the Grand Est region, FGYO/OFAJ offers mobility grants to help finance the cross-border travel of apprentices from the French Alsace region (French Lower Rhine and Upper Rhine departments) for a period of in-company training in the German Upper Rhine region.⁵²

⁵² The Franco-German Youth Office offers a «Success without borders» scholarship for cross-border apprentices <https://www.ofaj.org/programmes-formations/interreg-apprenties.html>

CHAPTER 1. State of play

Around 4,000 apprentices benefited from Erasmus+ mobility in 2016-2017.⁵³ The average duration of apprenticeship mobility was 19 days. The figures for mobility organised under the Erasmus + programme show that LTMA mainly concerns apprentices in higher education. On the other hand, 76% of apprentices in upper secondary schools on Erasmus+ mobility in 2016/2017 went abroad for less than 20 days, and only 15% left France for more than 3 months; 62% of those in higher education were abroad for 3 months or more. For upper secondary school apprentices in Erasmus+ mobility, 69% were men and 31% women; approximately one third were preparing for a level 3 diploma and nearly two thirds were completing a level 4 diploma.

The above figures do not take into account mobilities organised outside the Erasmus+ programme, for example in the case of mobilities organised by companies without funding from the European programme.

Long-term mobility for VET learners in ErasmusPro mainly concerns graduate apprentices with trainee status in vocational training: the long-term mobility that exists today is, therefore, part of post-apprenticeship pathways.

Developing LTMA for apprentices is a widely shared objective, at the heart of a set of recent reforms, including that of the vocational training and apprenticeship system in September 2018, and is the subject of numerous initiatives of apprenticeship stakeholders.

When opinions are reported below, they are followed by the name of the corresponding stakeholders interviewed, into brackets [*name of the organisation*].

⁵³ Data calculated by the French agency Erasmus + Education & training.

Observatoire Erasmus + (2019). Note n° 11 - L'alternance dans Erasmus +: un premier état des lieux [Note 11 - The alternating training in Erasmus +: a first inventory of the situation]. http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/docs/2781_observatoire_11.pdf

1.1. Framework level

1.1.1. Dimension 1.1. Overall size and training capacity of companies

Of the 3.82 million French companies in 2018, 287 large companies (GE)⁵⁴ employ 3.9 million full-time equivalent employees, i.e. 29% of the total of employees. In contrast, 3.67 million, or 96%, are microenterprises,⁵⁵ employing 2.4 million full-time equivalent employees (18% of the total). Beyond this dualism, there is a fairly balanced breakdown of employment: 5,800 medium-sized enterprises⁵⁶ and 140,000 small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs)⁵⁷ employing 25% and 28% of employees respectively.⁵⁸

This context can help create a favourable environment for the reception of apprentices from abroad on long-term mobility, particularly in large companies and medium-sized enterprises.

Nearly 82% of new apprenticeship contracts (entries) in 2017 concerned SMEs with fewer than 250 employees, and more than half of these new contracts (entries) were from companies with fewer than 10 employees.⁵⁹

Apprenticeships seem to be particularly popular in France's craft industry, which corresponds to 1,358,000 businesses (more than half are sole proprietorships) and employs 3.1 million people, mainly in four families of trades: food, manufacturing, construction and services.⁶⁰ The sector employs and trains 140,000 young apprentices every year, i.e. 35% of apprentices in France. For companies in this sector, apprenticeship is a way of passing the baton between generations by training the future craftsmen.

These two company profiles (SMEs *versus* large companies) correspond to two very different logics as regards apprenticeships: for SMEs, hiring apprentices with the objectives of staff sourcing and recruitment seems to be the prevalent reason; for companies with more than 250 employees, the presence of apprentices is partly linked to their obligation to have 5% of work-study students in their workforce. In this case, apprenticeships are not seen as a solution to staffing to the same degree as in SMEs.

⁵⁴ Large companies: more than 5000 employees

⁵⁵ Micro-entreprises: less than 10 employees

⁵⁶ Medium-sized enterprises: more than 250 employees and less than 5000

⁵⁷ Small and medium-sized enterprises: less than 250 employees and more than 10

⁵⁸ <https://www.insee.fr/fr/statistiques/3303564?sommaire=3353488>

⁵⁹ DARES Results, 2018. Apprenticeship in 2017. <https://dares.travail-emploi.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/2018-046.pdf>

⁶⁰ <https://www.artisanat.fr/lartisanat/un-secteur-cle-de-leconomie/lartisanat-premiere-entreprise-de-france>

In the first case, especially as regards the smallest companies, it will be more difficult to organise mobility: for them, the apprentice provides flexibility and capacity in terms of HR adjustment. These companies may, therefore, be reluctant to send their apprentices abroad because they need them to work and contribute productively to the business at home [Compagnons du devoir, ANFA]. On the other hand, they may be more likely to host European apprentices. One possible solution to the apprenticeship-related SMEs' conundrum is the exchange of apprentices, although this may be difficult to implement. [Compagnons du devoir, FNADIR, MEP Jean Arthuis].

Micro-enterprises appear to be less structured in terms of encouraging the international mobility of their apprentices. Without external support, it is very complicated for them to organise mobility, especially when the company does not have a human resources department [Compagnons du devoir, UIMM, ANFA].

For large companies, especially those with international operations, the implementation of LTMA appears simpler; their interest in mobility can be linked to their greater internationalization and outward orientation (see below chapter 1.1.3) [AFREF, FACE, MEP Jean Arthuis].

1.1.2. Dimensions 1.2. and 1.3. Sectoral employers' organisations (SEO) in the national, international and European context

Employers' and employees' federations are organized in professional branches/sectors in which they can conclude joint collective agreements. These professional branches develop vocational training strategies in line with employment trends and take initiatives in the field of vocational qualifications, through the joint bodies in which they participate: joint national employment commissions (*Commissions paritaires nationales de l'emploi*, CPNE), sectoral observatories of trades and qualifications (*Observatoires prospectifs des métiers et des qualifications*, OPMQ), and Skills Operators (*Opérateurs de compétences*, OPCO). The role of professional branches has been strengthened since 2018⁶¹ in several areas related to vocational training, including the steering of work-study schemes (apprenticeships and "professionalization contracts") and the financing of apprenticeships. The international mobility of apprentices is thus one of the topics to be dealt with by the joint organizations of the professional branches and the OPCOs⁶². The CPNE could be involved in the development of pathways that integrate CBLTMA [CFDT].

⁶¹ National interprofessional agreement of 2017, law of 5 September 2018

⁶² Each of the 11 existing OPCOs is related to some specific branches (from 9 to up several dozens). Cf for a more detailed presentation of the OPCOs and the branches they are linked to: <https://www.centre-info.fr/site-droit-formation/site-fiches-pratiques/annexes/presentation-des-11-operateurs-de-competences-opco>
The Board of Directors of the OPCO is composed of an equal number of employer and employee representatives and takes into account the diversity of the member

A restructuring of the professional branches has been undertaken in order to reduce their number. More than 200 branches were counted at the beginning of 2020, grouped within eleven OPCOs (which replaced the previously 20 OPCAs) organized according to criteria of coherence for sectors and professions, and challenges in terms of skills and business needs.

This institutional landscape which is now less complex as a result of this restructuring (with a reduced number of branches and OPCOs) should improve the visibility of CBLTMA support possibilities for Apprentices training centres (*Centres de formation d'apprentis*, CFAs) and the enterprises [MESR].

Some professional branches have historically been very active in promoting the international mobility of apprentices: e.g. construction, automotive, craft industry. Their investment in this area can take the form of coordinating or supporting Erasmus+ projects, supporting the CFAs in the organization of mobility placements abroad, particularly for scheme design and partner search, developing mobility actions with a view to certification, disseminating good practices, promoting the mobility of apprentices through the creation and dissemination of communication materials.

The Erasmus+ France / Education Formation agency leads working groups linking several OPCOs on the topic of apprenticeship mobility. It also organizes a Territorial Conference for the Mobility of Apprentices.⁶³

The reform of the "law for the freedom to choose one's professional future" (hereinafter referred to as law on "professional future") of September 2018 has opened up new possibilities for OPCOs to develop the mobility abroad of students in alternance training schemes (apprentices and "professionalization contracts"): the possibility of compensating for all or part of the loss of resources resulting from the mobility of the apprentice abroad, financing of expenses related to the missions of CFAs on international mobility, in particular "apprenticeship referent" within their staff.

The conditions for financing the mobility of apprentices are to be determined by each OPCO, according to its own priorities. At the beginning of 2020, only a few had specified their financing arrangements, the OPCOs' attention being monopolised by other priorities during their initial implementation phase [Compagnons du devoir, Erasmus + agency].

The national statistical institute INSEE distinguishes around twenty economic sectors, depending on the main activity of companies. The professional branches

professional branches. A government commissioner attends the meetings of the board of directors in an advisory capacity.

⁶³ *Assises Territoriales de la Mobilité des Apprentis* (ATMA) which was held for the third time in May 2019. http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/docs/agenda/496_programme.pdf

group together companies in the same sector of activity and covered by an agreement or a collective agreement; there are currently more than 200 professional branches in France. Stakeholders and experts interviewed stress the great diversity of economic situations and challenges from one branch to another, which will affect their capacity to support CBLTMA. Thus, in some sectors, the branches are highly structured: e.g. in metallurgy, chemical industry, construction.

As branches are the level where joint collective bodies operate and design VET strategies and policies, developing CB LTMA will be easier for larger occupational branches than for smaller ones.

Various opinions are expressed as regards the level of involvement of employers' organisations in promoting the international mobility of apprentices.

For some, the employers' organisations do not appear to be very committed to these issues except in a declarative way, with a few exceptions concerning sectors that have historically had more international links, such as wholesale trade. *"At the level of the employers, the subject is above all carried by the companies"* [MENJ].

MEP Jean Arthuis notes that in order to create an environment conducive to the development of LTMA, employers' organisations should *"change their way of thinking, which is often trapped by tradition and corporatism. Let us not forget that social Europe is non-existent and that the European Union remains largely an addition of national egoisms."*

The cooperation of joint organisations at a European level could make it possible to develop common programmes for the promotion of apprenticeship mobility [UIMM]. Working with counterparts in other European countries can be achieved at the professional branches level, using umbrella organisations, or through inter-branch cooperation, such as in the NETINVET network⁶⁴ in the two sectors of International Trade and Transport and Logistics, to develop a favourable environment for LTMA [ANFA].

1.1.3. Dimensions 1.4. Intra-EU trade; 1.5. Enterprise foreign affiliates; 1.6. International sourcing

In 2017, 4,900 French multinational firms (excluding the banking sector and non-market services) controlled 43,600 subsidiaries abroad; almost half of these were controlled by large firms (employing more than 5,000 employees).

These subsidiaries employed 6 million people, of which 2.3 million worked in subsidiaries located within the EU. Half of the jobs located in the EU are in

⁶⁴ <https://www.netinvet.eu/fr/about/network>

Germany (409,000 employees), the United Kingdom (392,000) and Spain (349,000).⁶⁵

Conversely, foreign-controlled enterprises employed 2.2 million people, mainly in medium-sized enterprises. Industry, business services (including temporary employment) and trade accounted for more than three-quarters of these jobs.⁶⁶

The predominance of large companies (with more than 5,000 employees) and medium-sized companies (employing between 250 and 5,000 employees) in the form of subsidiaries abroad suggests that it will be easier to organise intra-company mobility for apprentices there than for SMEs of less than 250 employees and Very small enterprises [Ministry of Labour].

Having subsidiaries abroad can facilitate the implementation of intra-group CBLTMAs in various ways [Erasmus+ Agency]:

- through the placement of apprentices in these subsidiaries,
- possibly by setting up mechanisms for the reciprocal exchange of apprentices.

For instance, among large companies with a European dimension, Airbus has developed cross-border training courses for engineers. A prerequisite is to have a competent Human Resources department [MESRI]. It thus appears necessary to make these multinational companies and their human resources aware of the existence, opportunities offered by and requirements of CBLTMA [Compagnons du devoir].

The 2018 reform allowing companies to set up their own Apprentices training centre (CFA) should further strengthen the capacity of companies with foreign subsidiaries to promote LTMA as part of their training and intra-group mobility policies.

Another possible model would be to set up a partnership between the French CFA and a company with a subsidiary abroad, which needs to internationalise the career path of apprentices in training; the subsidiary abroad could act as an intermediary with a training centre abroad, where part of the training could take place [Compagnons du devoir].

In addition to companies with a subsidiary abroad, mobility can also be envisaged in the supply chain of companies sourcing abroad, for example across various branches within the industrial sector [UIMM].

⁶⁵ <https://www.insee.fr/fr/statistiques/4262265>

⁶⁶ <https://www.insee.fr/fr/statistiques/4242187>

The CBLTMA can also support SMEs' internationalisation strategy [ANFA].

For instance, this can be the case for companies in the craft industry, which accounts for 30% of French exporting companies.⁶⁷ According to figures provided by CMA France, two-thirds of the mobility of apprentices in the craft industry is in four sectors of activity: hairdressing and beauty care (22%), bakery and pastry making (18%), car repair (12%) and hotels and restaurants (12%). The arts and crafts sectors are very little represented (although they are among the handicraft sectors with export activity).

Specific advantages or obstacles may come into play in the case of mobility linked to the internationalisation strategies of craft businesses [CMA France]:

- the CBLTMA can help to promote 'made-in-France' know-how abroad, and conversely, incoming mobility can provide specific know-how from other countries;
- among the obstacles, there may be a real or perceived competitive problem, with the risk of losing an apprentice who leaves without returning with very specific know-how, or that of a foreign apprentice who returns home with customer contacts.

The question of supporting the company, in order to concretely exploit the benefits linked to sending or receiving apprentices abroad, is particularly crucial in this context [CMA France].

1.1.4. Dimension 1.7. Intra-EU labour migration for skilled labour

In European statistics, France appears to be the second largest host country for posted workers (more than 200,000 reports received in 2016), well after Germany. In terms of posting workers abroad, France ranks fourth (over 130,000 declarations issued), far behind Poland and Germany and just after Slovenia.⁶⁸

Young Europeans who are nationals of a European Union (EU) or European Economic Area (EEA) country or Switzerland can be hired by a French company and sign an apprenticeship contract freely.

The "Professional Future" law of 2018 has eased the reception conditions for apprentices from other EU Member States. Even though they now benefit from the provisions of the Labour Code relating to apprenticeships, several provisions still do not apply to them: purpose of the apprenticeship contract, duration of the

⁶⁷ <https://www.artisanat.fr/lartisanat/un-secteur-cle-de-leconomie/un-savoir-faire-qui-sexporte>

⁶⁸ <https://www.vie-publique.fr/parole-dexpert/21975-le-travail-detache-en-france-et-dans-lunion-europeenne>

contract and of the apprenticeship training, conditions for the integration of apprenticeship training.⁶⁹

For the apprentices coming in France from abroad in temporary mobility as part of their theoretical or practical training, and employed by a foreign firm: their employer is exempted from the obligations linked to the temporary posting of an employee.⁷⁰

These specific provisions for apprentices are likely to encourage LTMA in the opinion of the experts interviewed, whether from the education or business sector [Ministry of Labour, MESRI, UIMM, etc.].

Several stakeholders point to potential obstacles to CBLTMA related to competitive effects between countries.

At the level of the countries of origin, some employers and Member States may fear mobility without return to the home country (and sending company), which is already the case for the millions of Eastern Europeans who have moved to the West, states MEP Jean Arthuis ; "*an organized LTMA would reduce this phenomenon*". For example, the apprentice could be required to return to complete his/her training in his/her home country [CRMA Rhône Alpes].

In craft sectors where the reputation of Made in France is very strong (pastry making, butchery, bakery, hairdressing, arts and crafts, etc.), employers can be more reluctant to send their apprentices on long-term mobility [CMA France].

The LTMA could also exacerbate a "sense of competition" that may exist, for example, in neighbouring countries which share a common border such as France and Spain [CMA France]. There is a risk that a country will invest in the training of a young person, but that young person will leave because he/she is better paid abroad [CRMA Rhône Alpes].

The option of developing reciprocal circular-type exchange arrangements between two countries⁷¹, advocated for example by MEP Jean Arthuis, is currently the subject of debate; some companies could also prefer to promote unilateral schemes of outgoing mobility.

⁶⁹ Art. L6222-43 of the Labour Code

Law No 2018-217 of 29.3.18, Article 23

⁷⁰ Art. L1262-6 of the Labour Code

Law No 2018-771 of 5.7.18

Order of 4.6.19

⁷¹ I.e. country A sends an apprentice to country B and simultaneously hosts one from it.

1.1.5. Dimension 1.8. Skills shortages in medium-level occupations

Labour migration situations are very diverse depending on the people's country of origin and legal status. As such, issues linked to the incoming mobility of apprentices may be very different [AFREF].

Several factors can hinder the development of CBLTMA in sectors experiencing labour/skills shortages: most notoriously the investment required for training apprentices at a time when skilled people are needed for ongoing activities in a company. Regarding apprentices undertaking levels 3 and 4 qualifications, another barrier may be their language skills deficit [CFDT].

In large companies, CBLTMA is not used to resolve labour or skills shortages or as a recruitment strategy; it is rather used for softer benefits such as open-mindedness, international dimension, language skills, etc. Designing apprenticeship training paths with a European dimension to foster careers with an international dimension at an early stage concerns only certain very specific professions, for example "convention technician" (*technicien de conventionnement*) at Airbus, or other specific professions at *Électricité de France* (EDF) [FIPA].

However, it can be assumed that employers of sectors experiencing shortages may show just as much interest for CBLTMA as employers in other sectors [FACE].

Social economy training organisations [Synofdes] express reluctance to regard CBLTMA as a tool to solve labour shortages.

1.1.6. Dimension 1.10. Immigration policy

To enter apprenticeship training, non-EU foreigners, whether minors or adults, must have a work permit. Either this is included in their residence permit, or conversely it must be requested from the French administration; the latter case concerns those who have a student residence permit.⁷²

Apprenticeship is reserved for those already present on the French territory and is not accessible to recently arrived migrants. Foreign candidates for apprenticeship must be able to prove that they have already completed one year of study in France as a student before becoming an apprentice.

This criterion has been a difficulty identified in the context of pilot projects to develop the LTMA (Euro App project), for the reception of young apprentices from other EU countries but with a non-European nationality. Alternative solutions have been implemented such as signing an internship agreement; however, these do not appear to be satisfactory [Compagnons du devoir]

72

https://www.gisti.org/IMG/pdf/dispositionsjeunesetrangersapprentissage_version20190220_1_.pdf

An employer may have different types of interests in labour immigration: for example, to source the skills needed for business activities; but also, in the case of a company that is a subsidiary of a parent company located abroad, to become accustomed to the work culture of that parent company. [AFREF].

1.1.7. Dimension 1.11. International qualifications

International job-specific qualifications are very rare. The existing international qualifications correspond to company certifications (e.g. Microsoft certifications), or certifications of regulated activities such as air or sea navigation.

This characteristic does not a priori constitute a favourable factor for the development of the mobility of apprentices: indeed, these international qualifications hardly concern job-specific qualifications; they do not, therefore, apply to apprenticeship pathways corresponding to long-term training paths.

Only a few European certifications exist, for example in the handicraft sector: for farriers⁷³ or in hairdressing⁷⁴ [CMA France].

For MEP Jean Arthuis, the development of internationally recognised qualifications is a central issue: "*we need a Bologna-type process for vocational training*".

In addition, there are cases where two countries join forces to create an 'atypical' qualification in the form of a dual qualification, recognised in both the sending and the destination country⁷⁵. The award of diplomas recognised in two EU Member States can be a favourable factor in the development of CBLTMA [Erasmus + Agency].

In France, the national qualifications framework not only defines levels of qualification but also links them to the working conditions and salary levels defined under collective agreements. As such, international qualifications should be registered into the national qualifications framework to guarantee official recognition to the corresponding level of qualification, including working conditions and salary level [CFDT, Synofdes].

Concerning higher education (for diplomas that can be obtained through apprenticeships), several factors contribute towards a favourable context for the development of dual qualifications: the transversal competences component of higher education qualifications (Bachelors, Masters, PhD), their articulation with the EQF, the alignment of the French national qualifications framework with the EQF, the division of French qualifications into skills 'blocks'/sets (*blocs de*

⁷³ <http://www.eurofarrier.org/file.php?id=13>

⁷⁴ <http://www.coiffure.eu/projects/ehc/european-hairdressing-certificate>

⁷⁵ E.g. Franco-German engineering qualifications: <https://www.itii-alsace.fr/formations/formation-ingenieur-mecatronique-franco-allemand/>

compétences). It would be possible to envisage that 30%-50% of training standards for the acquisition of professional competences could be made identical in different countries through the notion of transversal competences; the remaining training standards would remain specific to a profession or a country [MESRI].

With rotating mobility, each country could specialise in a part of the training delivered with common examination and validation regulations. In this configuration, there remain issues related to the language skills needed to follow the courses in the different countries or the ability to offer courses in other languages [CMA France].

The link to the EQF as a condition for success is underlined through the example of the creation of a Franco-German apprenticeship path for an engineering degree [UIMM].⁷⁶

In addition to the ECVET tools [CMA France, CRMA Nouvelle Aquitaine], combining the skills block logic with the use of the European Skills, Competences, Qualifications and Occupations (ESCO) classification could also act as an enabling factor for LTMA [AFREF].

Supporting the twinning between vocational training institutions in Europe could also be among the first steps towards educational cooperation for the development of European vocational qualifications [Compagnons du devoir].

However, ECVET has not at all led to the same development of international VET curricula as ECTS has in higher education. Indeed, in order to allow the delegation of the validation of part of the qualification to a foreign partner, French CFAs must first be authorised to carry out continuous assessment during training, which concerns only a minority of VET curricula⁷⁷ [Compagnons du devoir] (see also chapter 1.2.6).

In addition, several factors will influence the possibility and the interest in developing bilateral qualifications in two countries: proximity of the job profile in both countries and mutual benefits for the employers in both countries [CFDT].

Several factors have been noted which put into perspective the value of developing common qualifications in different countries.

An incentive to extend the scope of international qualifications beyond higher education would be to remedy the difficulties in the recognition of vocational qualifications between European countries [Compagnons du devoir].

⁷⁶ Cf. the following example of the Franco-German engineering diploma, which was developed with a view to recognition in France and Germany <https://www.itii-alsace.fr/formations/formation-ingenieur-mecatronique-franco-allemand/>

⁷⁷ E.g. <https://www.itii-alsace.fr/formations/formation-ingenieur-mecatronique-franco-allemand/>

However, if European directives allowed for the recognition of VET qualifications from one country to another, the development of international qualifications would become less relevant [CMA France]. Likewise, if the training content and competence standards became strictly identical in the different countries, CBLTMA may not serve much of a purpose: mobile apprentices are precisely in search of elements of differentiation [CMA France]. Aiming to harmonise qualifications raises the risk of building too complex schemes and wasting resources in the process.

1.1.8. Dimension 1.12. Tradition regarding cross-border VET and/or labour mobility

Concerning apprentices from France taking part in Erasmus+ mobility, the most popular destination country is Spain (17.5% of apprentices on Erasmus+ mobility in 2017-2018), followed by Italy (15.1%) and the United Kingdom (13.9%). Germany, Portugal, the Czech Republic, Denmark and Ireland are also favoured destination countries.

The preferred destination countries differ according to the areas of training: apprentices in the service sector are concentrated in Spain, the United Kingdom and Ireland. Apprentices in the industrial production sectors focus on Italy, as well as in industrial countries in Northern and Central Europe.⁷⁸

Traditions of labour mobility exist in border regions, e.g. in Alsace-Lorraine (with Germany) or in Occitania (with Spain), where cross-border routes are organised between local business units. The mobility of apprentices draws on these cross-border traditions [MESRI].

Well-established cross-border mobility, for example between France and Germany, should of course be favourable ground for LTMA when it works well. It is necessary that such mobility is not one-way. However, in the case of Germany, a largely one-way mobility is noted: the reception of apprentices with a view to addressing labour shortages in that country [MENJ]. On the German side, young French apprentices are recruited to fill skills shortages and then have the possibility to be hired on permanent contracts [FIPA]. In the case of ProTandem, the French have an easier time sending than receiving apprentices [Compagnons du devoir].

The framework of the dual training system is particularly ill-suited to mobility and associated recognition of learning outcomes, due to its very holistic conception of skills/competence assessment. This, in turn, makes it very difficult and complicated for German actors to believe that they can delegate part of this assessment to a foreign partner [MENJ]. The difference between the French

⁷⁸ http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/docs/2781_observatoire_11.pdf

apprenticeship model and the German model, the latter focusing more on the direct needs of a sector while being less favourable to subsequent career changes, complicates the recognition of learning outcomes between the two countries [AFREF]. The multiplicity of rules linked to the dual system in Germany and Austria makes it more complicated to organise mobility in these countries [Erasmus + Agency].

Another type of tradition concerns training pathways already based on a tradition of mobility, as is the case of *Compagnons du devoir* for trades with a strong tradition of training by journeymen. The difficulty is that this companionship/fellowship mobility-based model is very difficult to transfer to other professional sectors that operate with specific pedagogies or approaches. The *Compagnons* model is thus not easily transferable to other branches and can only remain an isolated example [MENJ].

1.2. System level

1.2.1. Dimension 2.1. Apprenticeship type and 2.3. Apprenticeship function

The French apprenticeship system is a particular pathway providing access to professional VET qualifications, among other training routes. The VET qualifications are also accessible through scholar / training programs with the status of pupils or trainees, or through Accreditation of prior learning (*Validation des acquis de l'expérience*, VAE).

It corresponds to the type B in the classification developed by Cedefop⁷⁹. For a majority of the interviewees, this characteristic is not likely to hinder the implementation of policies for the development of the LTMA. On the contrary, as the French system is more open in terms of (accessing) qualifications, it generally facilitates the recognition of work-based training [AFREF]. The fact that the French apprenticeship model concerns all VET qualifications may favour long-term mobility [Erasmus+ France]. Companies with European subsidiaries will find it easier to implement LTMA, since mobility can potentially concern all the qualifications for which they provide apprenticeship training; however, this spectrum of companies with international subsidiaries remains very limited [MENJ].

Concerning the assessment, validation and recognition of learning outcomes in the French system of professional qualifications, there are contrasting views as to whether or not they are likely to favour LTMA (see below chapter 1.2.6).

The existence of an employment contract for an apprentice with salaried status in France can complicate the implementation of such mobility; however, the

⁷⁹ Apprenticeship schemes in European countries - A cross-nation overview (2018)
https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/files/4166_en.pdf

main obstacles related to this have been removed by the "Professional future" law of September 2018 (see below chapter 1.2.5).

1.2.2. Dimensions 2.2. Share of VET students in apprenticeship schemes

More than 458,000 young people were in apprenticeships in the first half of 2019⁸⁰. Between June 2018 and May 2019, 321,000 new apprenticeship contracts were registered⁸¹, an increase of 4.7% over the same period in the previous year.

According to some interviewees, the growth in the number of apprentices is expected to result in increased numbers of apprentices moving abroad [MENJ, MESRI, Compagnons du devoir, FIPA].

For others, on the contrary, such growth will not inevitably promote LTMA, which is hampered by specific problems and obstacles (as developed below in the chapters 1.2.3 to 1.2.6) [Erasmus +, AFREF, UIMM, FACE].

Informants also highlight the predominant share of higher education students among apprentices with access to LTMA. Such mobility is, therefore, currently primarily linked to the development of apprenticeships in higher education [MEP Jean Arthuis, FIPA].

1.2.3. Dimensions 2.4. Apprenticeship governance; 2.5. Funding of the in-company training;

France's national governance structure involving professional branches and social partners, with national regulation by the agency *France Compétences*, facilitates LTMA, compared to systems with more fragmented governance arrangements [ANFA]. The more than 200 existing branches, define their strategy linked to employment and training within their own National Joint Employment Commission (Commissions paritaires nationales de l'emploi, CPNE⁸²). Each of the 11 existing OPCOs gathers several branches⁸³.

The investment of the professional branches, in particular through the OPCOs, in the mobility of apprentices can take place at several levels:

- Support of CFAs, including in the search for partner organisations or host companies abroad, dissemination of good practices, animation of networks of "mobility advisors" [ANFA, CMA France];
- Involvement in the development of VET qualifications: systematic involvement for initial vocational training diplomas; optional but growing

⁸⁰ <https://www.gouvernement.fr/458-000-apprentis-en-france-une-filiere-qui-attire-toujours-plus>

⁸¹ <http://poem.travail-emploi.gouv.fr/detail-rapport/573c927e89cfa051057b23c6>

⁸² List of the CPNE: <https://www.paritarisme-emploi-formation.fr/les-cpne/>

⁸³ <https://www.centre-inffo.fr/content/uploads/2019/10/infographie-11-opco--mise-a-jour--09-10-2019-pdf--1-page-.jpg>

involvement in higher education [Ministry of Labour, MESRI], development of mobility-related experience included in the qualifications;

- Coverage of specific expenses related to LTMA (salaries of the mobility referents of the CFAs, language preparation, reception and accommodation of apprentices from other countries) [MEP Jean Arthuis].

The consequences of the reduced role of the Regions in the new system⁸⁴ are also subject to different assessments by the informants consulted for this report. They could be tempted to concentrate the proposed financial support linked to learner mobility on other publics [MENJ]. From the point of view of some large companies, however, the role of regions on short-term mobility had not always seemed effective [FIPA].

The 2018 law on "professional future" allows OPCOs to cover all or part of the costs incurred as part of mobility abroad. Indeed, the OPCO may, depending on its strategy and priorities, cover financial costs of any kind, including those corresponding to social contributions paid by the employer and, where appropriate, remuneration and ancillary costs associated with mobility outside the national territory; these may include travel, accommodation, etc. The OPCO must also cover the mobility costs borne by the CFAs (the costs related to the missions/trips of the CFA apprenticeship coordinators).

This possibility for OPCOs to provide additional funding is obviously a factor in facilitating CBLTMA [ANFA, Ministry of Labour, UIMM, AFREF].

However, the economic model of apprenticeship is already under strain in terms of resources, in view of the current government ambition to significantly increase the number of apprentices; this situation implies political choices in terms of funding priorities, which could weigh on the allocation of resources dedicated to LTMA as opposed to other priorities [UIMM].

1.2.4. Dimensions 2.6. Duration of the whole apprenticeship period; 2.7 Duration of in-company placements; 2.8. Alternance

The duration of the apprenticeship contract in France (between 6 months and 3 years) may have various effects for developing LTMA, disabling if shorter and enabling when longer. Recent legal provisions ("Professional future" law) have made the framework for the duration of the apprenticeship contract more flexible – previously the minimum duration of such a contract was one year). By way of derogation, the duration of the apprenticeship contract may be shorter than the

⁸⁴ Previously, Regional authorities had the competence to manage apprenticeship provision on their territory; some had developed financial support schemes for the mobility of apprentices. Now, the regions play a role in providing information on jobs and training. They keep financial means to subsidize CFAs in connection with regional development needs.

duration of the training course in order to take into account the skills acquired during a mobility period abroad.

Apprenticeships of two years or more may be more suitable for LTMA. A third year is likely to facilitate the organization of LTMA where placements abroad last at least six months [Jean Arthuis, ANFA]. Conversely, in the case of short apprenticeship training lasting about a year, the company has no longer any interest in employing an apprentice, if the apprentice is absent abroad for 6 months, for example. There is, therefore, a risk of discrimination in relation to CBLTMA depending on the duration of the apprenticeship contract, which will penalise apprentices in the shortest training courses [AFREF].

The duration of training will also affect the possibilities of developing foreign language skills, which is currently one of the most important obstacles to CBLTMA for apprentices with the lowest levels of qualification [CFDT].

The average period of in-company training, combined with the flexibility of regulations on the duration of training, is the subject of much discussion. The large companies surveyed⁸⁵ as part of the European project "Apprentices in motion" replied that at least 6 months of in-company training is a minimum to be able to implement a period of CBLTMA. Apprentices provided the same response [FACE].

For some interviewees, the average duration of in-company training does not appear to be an obstacle to the implementation of policies relating to CBLTMA [CFDT]. What is important is not the length of the training period in the company as such, but its goals in terms of learning outcomes and its evaluation [AFREF].

For other interviewees [Synofdes], the average duration⁸⁶ of in-company training does not facilitate the implementation of policies relating to CBLTMA: When a young person is trained as an apprentice for two years, it is complicated to envisage a mobility period abroad lasting more than 3 months. Indeed, the employers, beyond their interest in providing training to ensure the future sustainability of their trade, have above all a need for manpower, including apprentices.

The departure of the young person as part of CBLTMA leads to a discontinuity in this supply of manpower [CRMA Rhône Alpes, FNADIR]. The further the apprentice progresses in training, the greater the return on investment for the company, and the more reluctant it may appear to let the apprentice go [CMA France]. The systematic/structured organisation of cross-border mobility could provide an answer to this problem [CMA France, MEP Jean Arthuis]. This difficulty of releasing apprentices to go abroad may also vary in certain sectors depending on the time of year: for example, a carpentry company located in a region that has

⁸⁵ <https://www.fondationface.org/projet/apprentices-in-motion/>

⁸⁶ In 2017, the average duration of an apprenticeship contract was of 20 months ; the duration of in-company training must be of 75% or less.

less construction business in winter will find it easier to send an apprentice on LTMA at this time of year [Compagnons du devoir].

A determining factor concerns the organisation of alternating periods of school-based and in-company training, the pace and duration of which vary greatly. The implementation of CBLTMA requires a very strong ‘individualization’ of the training path [Compagnons du devoir, ANFA]. Depending on the host country, the problem of the alternance structure of the work-study programme will also pose compatibility problems, or on the contrary, will prove easier to coordinate: for example, the alternance structure of six weeks in a company / two weeks in a training centre that can be associated with apprenticeship training for “*Certificat d’aptitude professionnel*” (CAP, Certificate of professional competence) in France, may appear difficult to coordinate with the apprenticeship-related structure in other countries [Compagnons du devoir].

CFAs are used to delegating work-based training periods to their partner companies. The principle remains the same in the case of CBLTMA [ANFA]. During the period of school-based training the mobility may be simpler to organise. However, the current work-study alternance structure reduces this option to short-term mobility: from this point of view it does not appear to be a favourable factor for CBLTMA [CRMA Nouvelle-Aquitaine].

Finally, the issue of the organisation of work-based training within the period of mobility also arises: the organisation of mobility in a training organisation without work-based training in a company is simpler, but much less beneficial for young people in apprenticeships [CFDT].

Another difficulty concerns the ways which would enable young people who have moved abroad to catch up on general education courses, which they will not have been able to follow during their extended time abroad [CMA France, Compagnons du devoir]. Within the framework of a pilot project, young French apprentices preparing for a vocational aptitude certificate (CAP) over a two-year period had to follow distance courses during their apprenticeship in Germany; they were then able to register for the final CAP exams organised by the MENJ as external candidates).

1.2.5. Dimensions 2.9. Type of contract; 2.10. Status of apprentices; 2.11. Remuneration; 2.12. Occupational health & safety standards and social insurance

At present, CBLTMA has mainly been developed for post-apprentices for long-term placements abroad (i.e. after the apprenticeship training period, and with the status of “vocational training trainees”) [Erasmus+ Agency, CMA France, Compagnons du devoir]. Vocational training trainees are not under an apprenticeship contract but are bound by an agreement between the CFA and the Public employment service (*Pôle emploi*). In this context, young people engaged in mobility do not have the same constraints as apprentices. Indeed, the decision

to participate in CBLTMA depends solely on the participant, the CFA and the employment centre [CRMA Rhône Alpes].

The contractual relationship model linked to apprenticeship in France can make the implementation of CBLTMA more complex, insofar as apprenticeship is both a training and an employment contract; indeed, this configuration is sometimes very different from what exists in other European countries [MEP Jean Arthuis]. The variety in the status of apprentices from one country to another is a major obstacle to CBLTMA [CMA France, FACE]. The status of French apprentices⁸⁷s sometimes unknown to foreign partners and needs to be explained [ANFA].

Respondents pointed out that the fact that the French apprenticeship system involves an employment contract can be a hindrance to CBLTMA: it is obviously more complicated to implement mobility (short- or long-term) as part of a wage-based contractual relationship, as this requires the agreement of the French employer [CMA France, Compagnons du devoir].

However, some of CBLTMA-related obstacles have been lifted by the recent "Professional Future" law, since this now allows for a "break" in the employment contract: thus the company, which sends one of its young people on mobility for more than four weeks, can "break" the employment contract and free itself from its responsibilities and obligations, including those concerning remuneration. In this case, an agreement must be signed between all the parties involved in the international mobility of the apprentice, setting out in detail all the terms and conditions. The model agreement template was still expected to be provided by the Ministry of Labour at the end of 2019.

This new possibility provided by the "Professional Future" law represents a facilitating factor as regards LTMA for the majority of the interviewees. However, from the point of view of some large companies, the possibility of maintaining the framework of a secondment agreement ("*convention de mise à disposition*"), without putting the employment contract on hold, could appear more reassuring for some employers [FIPA]. The caution shown by the actors on the possibility of taking a break from the work contract will require real support by all the actors involved in the development of CBLTMA (particularly the professional branches, OPCOs, CFA networks) [MENJ]. The question of social protection for the apprentice and his or her support during mobility must remain central to promoting LTMA from the point of view of the apprentice [CFDT].

⁸⁷ The apprenticeship contract is a special type of employment contract concluded between a young person or his/her legal representative and the host company. In addition to paying a salary, the employer undertakes to provide the apprentice with full vocational training, partly in the company and partly in an apprentice training centre. In return, the apprentice undertakes to work for the employer for the duration of the contract and to follow the training.

In particular, the new provisions raise questions regarding the remuneration of the apprentice. The main sources of funding for CBLTMA are Erasmus+ grants, OPCOs, grants from certain regional authorities.

In the case of a break in the apprentice's employment contract, the partial or total assumption of his/her remuneration is optional for the OPCOs. Some interviewees expressed doubts as to whether the social partners would agree to have the OPCOs finance the remuneration of mobile apprentices instead of the employer.

Failure to compensate for the loss of salary would be a major obstacle to securing good conditions for CBLTMA [CMA France, Compagnons du devoir, CFDT]. . From the apprentice's point of view, it may be necessary to have a financial contribution from the employer for daily expenses incurred abroad [accommodation, food, transportation, etc.) [ANAF]. In order to make CBLTMA attractive, especially for those undertaking the first qualification levels, it is fundamental that a way be found to maintain the level of remuneration of the apprentice [CFDT]. To this end, it may be necessary to create a specific financial aid [AFREF].

Prior to the 2018 reform, in the case of mobilities organised in a host company abroad, there was a possibility of drawing up a labour loan agreement which allowed part of the sending company's wage costs to be reimbursed by the host company. [CMA France]. Moreover, it should be noted that the remuneration of apprentices in France is on average higher than in other EU countries; even if they receive remuneration in the host country if they are employed there, the apprentice engaged in LTMA may see his/her remuneration decrease significantly [CRMA Nouvelle-Aquitaine].

With regard to health and safety standards at work, the suspension of the employer's obligations in this area, and with regard to the payment of contributions relating to accidents at work and occupational diseases, is an important facilitating factor as regards CBLTMA [ANFA, Erasmus+], within the framework provided by the new legal provisions which allow the apprentice to maintain social security coverage.

During the period of mobility abroad, the Labour Code provides that the apprentice is covered by the social security system of the host country, except where he or she does not enjoy the status of employee (or equivalent) in that country. In this case, the social security coverage is governed by the French Social Security Code. This coverage is provided outside the European Union by joining a voluntary insurance scheme.⁸⁸

With regard to the payment of contributions relating to accidents at work and occupational diseases, the CFA in France takes the place of the employer during

⁸⁸ [Art. L6222-42 of the Labour Code](#)
[Ord. No. 2019-861 of 21.8.19 \(OJ of 22.8.19\), Article 1](#)

the period of mobility of the apprentice. During the same period, the apprentice is covered against accidents at work and occupational diseases under the conditions provided for students.⁸⁹

This context makes it necessary to support the young person so that he or she can become properly familiar with these new rules [CFDT].

One CBLTMA-related difficulty identified is that if the student social security system applies, then the apprentice no longer has access to the complementary health coverage offered by the company. In this instance, he/she changes social security regime and his/her social security coverage deteriorates. From the point of view of some large companies, the option of having rules to avoid a break in the employment contract for mobile apprentices could be simpler and offer greater certainty regarding social security coverage [FIPA].

1.2.6. Dimensions 2.13. Curriculum training standard; 2.14. Use of validation; 2.15 Legal basis for apprenticeships and integration of mobility

The new provisions relax the rules on CBLTMA and make it possible to broaden the possible content of the training received abroad: the principle of work-study alternation inherent in the apprenticeship contract no longer applies.. In practice, training has no longer to be provided in a company and may not be aimed at obtaining a qualification [Erasmus+].

Whatever the period abroad is organised only as an in-company training, in a training organisation, or in both ones, one fundamental issue for some interviewees is that this period of mobility should be taken into account within the overall programme of apprenticeship training [Synofdes, FIPA].

An important point for the necessary adjustment of training programmes concerns the reinforcement of foreign language teaching, which is greatly reduced in training programmes for the first levels of qualification [ANAF, Compagnons du devoir, CFDT]. Online tools provided within the framework of Erasmus+ mobilities such as the Online Linguistic Support (OLS)⁹⁰ are not sufficient and require special support from the audiences concerned [Compagnons du devoir]. A special training offer could be developed within CFA, for example in English, which could facilitate the reception of young people from abroad and improve the language skills of French apprentices.

Through validation of non-formal and informal learning (*VAE, Validation des acquis de l'expérience*), anybody can obtain a full qualification or certificate based on his or her professional experience. The question of the possibility of having

⁸⁹ [Art. D412-3 of the Social Security Code](#)

[Decree No. 2019-1086 of 24.10.19 \(JO of 26.10.19\), Article 1](#)

⁹⁰ <https://erasmusplusols.eu/en/>

learning outcomes acquired abroad validated by the VAE at a later date does not appear to be central. However, this can be an enabling factor for CBLTMA insofar as a period of mobility in a company abroad could be then used later as experience that can be validated for acquiring a qualification [MENJ].

Concerning the validation of skills acquired abroad, the rules related to professional certifications in the French system are the subject of divergent assessments, as to their flexibility in favouring or not the LTMA.

The Ministry of Labour and the Ministry in charge of National Education stress the existing flexibility as regards validation. Other actors comment on (i) the complexity and difficulty of having the competences acquired in mobility recognised and certified [CFDT, Compagnons du devoir, CCI, CMA France]; and (ii) the need for more flexibility in relation to validation on the part of the academic authorities [MEP Jean Arthuis].

The existing flexibility is based on the possibility for a CFA to delegate part of the validation of a diploma to a foreign partner. However, this possibility is only open to CFAs authorised to carry out themselves continuous assessment during training. However, for the majority of the CFAs this is not the case, partly for financial reasons, as the implementation of continuous monitoring during training entails costs for the training centre [MENJ].⁹¹

If the CFA is authorised to carry out continuous assessment during training, in order to be able to take into account the assessment of learning outcomes (a skills block/set corresponding to a diploma certification unit) during mobility abroad, the CFA must, prior to the period of mobility, contact the authority issuing the diploma or qualification to ensure that all or part of a skills block/set can be assessed abroad in the context of mobility, and identify under what conditions this assessment is possible. The CFA must then specify in the agreement signed with the foreign partner(s) (company and/or training centre) the following elements: training activities; skills to be acquired; learning outcomes to be assessed; evaluation procedures; and grids and procedures for the transmission of results [MENJ].

In addition, the Ministry of National Education has introduced an Optional Mobility Unit (*Unité facultative de mobilité*, UFM) for all vocational diplomas of levels 3 and 4: the UFM, which is optional and which allows one to gain mobility-related points towards obtaining the VET diploma, mainly concerns short-term mobility [MENJ].

Some interviewees also underline the existence of cultural obstacles: in a national context, it is already difficult for education actors to integrate the company

⁹¹ Linked to the required traceability of the evaluation conditions, and to the mobilization of technical training platforms

in the assessment process. This difficulty will be even greater in relation to a foreign company [MESR].

Other tools traditionally used to promote the recognition of mobility learning outcomes are the Europass portfolio [Erasmus+ Agency].

ECVET credits are the main instruments for the development of evaluation and certification methods between European partners [Erasmus+ Agency, Compagnons du devoir]. However, their implementation requires support from experts [CCA-BTP, Erasmus+ Agency]. Combined with the use of ECVET, the division of French vocational qualifications into skills blocks/sets could be a favourable factor to encourage mobility and its use towards the obtention of a qualification.

1.3. Implementation level

1.3.1. Dimension 3.1. Governance of apprenticeship implementation

Social partners play a key role in raising awareness about LTMA among members of their organisations and their partners. The presence of social partners in *France compétences*, in the OPCOs, in the CFAs, in companies, makes it possible to support the development of certified and quality vocational training programmes, which may include CBLTMA. Social partners also have responsibility for monitoring compliance with contractual and health and safety-related standards [CFDT]. Social dialogue is a fundamental enabling factor of CBLTMA [CMA France, CRMA New Aquitaine].

The development of CBLTMA could constitute a factor of attractiveness at the level of CFAs, professional branches and OPCOs [FIPA].

The strengthened position of the professional branches and the possibilities given to OPCOs, according to their training development policies, to contribute to the financing of CBLTMA, are favourable factors for such mobility (cf. chapter 1.2.3). The ambition of the joint bodies to increase take-up of apprenticeships (e.g. by 50% by 2023 in the industrial sector) presupposes a number of concrete awareness-raising and communication activities in relation to the companies where CBLTMA can be included [UIMM].

However, the voluntarism of employers' organisations on this subject may not be enough: it is the company itself, which will sign the contract, which must be motivated, supported and provided with tools relating to LTMA [MENJ].

One criteria for the accreditation of the 11 new OPCOs was their ability to offer a “local service” at the benefits of small and medium sized enterprises. The territorial embeddedness of the OPCOs is a positive factor as regards LTMA [MESR]. In industry, the network of territorial chambers of trade unions⁹² is likely to provide a local service to companies, and in particular to VSEs that need support in relation to LTMA [UIMM]. There is a need to better promote the service offer of branch networks or networks such as those of the Chambers of Trades and Crafts to businesses [CMA France].

The increasing participation of professional branches in the co-design of degrees in higher education also creates favourable conditions for CBLTMA [MESR]. The professional branches can play a role in enriching the training offer by improving the coherence of competence standards across European countries [Compagnons du devoir].

⁹² The network of Chambers of Commerce and Industry in France gathers 126 establishments present at a national, regional and local level.

The new possibilities for companies to develop internal CFAs should be a favourable factor for CBLTMA, especially for companies with a presence in different countries. This can also concern training courses with an international dimension, as is for example the course recently developed by the temporary employment company Adecco. The latter has set up a CFA dedicated to recruitment-related professions, which should reinforce the attractiveness its international professional course [FIPA].

On the other hand, the reform of initial VET conducted by the Ministry of education plans to generalise apprenticeship provision in all vocational high schools; this should encourage CBLTMA due to a long tradition of education sector support for mobility projects [Erasmus+ Agency].

1.3.2. Dimension 3.2. Age of apprentices at enrolment

Long-term mobility requires preparation and maturity on the part of the apprentice. According to the Erasmus+ agency, the implementation of a long period of mobility is not necessarily appropriate at the very beginning of an apprenticeship training course (1st year of *CAP* or *Bac Pro*, for example).

CBLTMA is also easier to set up with apprentices who have reached the age of majority, compared to underage apprentices who require a greater degree of supervision/support and administrative work from the parties involved [ANFA, AFREF]. Underage apprentices may also lack autonomy due to their young age [ANFA].

However, for young people who have just started their vocational education, CBLTMA can be a valuable (learning) opportunity as they have fewer chances for mobility later in their personal and professional life [CFDT]. The experience of mobility will help them gain maturity [FIPA].

Mobility is more frequently implemented during the second year of training for level 4 qualifications in order to avoid mobility of minors and to select more mature and motivated young people [CMA France]. The apprentice will be more inclined to opt for long-term mobility, if he/she has already experienced short-term mobility as part of his/her training, which usually concerns young people who have already completed at least two years of apprenticeship training [CRMA Rhône Alpes].

1.3.3. Dimension 3.3. Employers' attitude towards apprenticeship

The employer's attitude towards the LTMA is decisive: if the sending company is convinced about the benefits of mobility, it will encourage its apprentices to go abroad; otherwise, it will hinder mobility [CFDT]. Employers must be as informed as the apprentices of the benefits and requirements of CBLTMA [ANFA]. The host company must also be made aware of the advantages of LTMA, for a successful reception and workplace integration of apprentices [FACE].

Some employers may perceive CBLTMA as a lever to increase the attractiveness of apprenticeship [ANFA]. The companies most committed to the

development of apprenticeships can facilitate CBLTMA as a means of developing their internationalisation strategy [CMA France]. The fact that the tutor has himself or herself already experienced periods of vocational training abroad can also be a facilitating factor.

The subject of LTMA could be integrated into Corporate Social Responsibility (*Responsabilité sociale de l'entreprise*, RSE) policies [FACE].

The implementation of LTMA schemes is closely correlated with the strength and quality of the relationship between companies and CFAs. According to the Erasmus+ agency, a company will be more willing to let its apprentice(s) go abroad as part of LTMA if:

- this company is already involved in international mobility as a sending or host organisation for apprentices;
- a mechanism for replacing employees/apprentices who have gone abroad as part of LTMA has been set up, prior to the employees'/apprentices' mobility

1.3.4. Dimensions 3.4 and 3.5 (Long-term) mobility national strategies or initiatives; 3.15 Pilot projects for (long-term) mobility

The government's goal is to increase by 2022 the number of internationally mobile apprentices to 15,000 (in terms of both short- and long-term mobility). Beyond this quantified objective for the mobility of apprentices, the French government, through the "Initiative de la Sorbonne" (speech of President Macron at the Sorbonne in September 2017), wishes that "*by 2024, half of students in any given age group must have spent at least six months in another European country before the age of 25*";⁹³ this concerns both students and apprentices. This French government's wish to foster the mobility of apprentices of any duration is likely to support LTMA (and short-term mobility as well) [Erasmus+ Agency].

The main conclusions to be drawn from some previous pilot projects were presented in the report "*Erasmus Pro: lifting the obstacles on the mobility of apprentices in Europe*" presented in January 2018.⁹⁴ The project 'European Apprenticeship Ambassadors' promoted by the EuroApp association⁹⁵ had counted no less than 60 obstacles as regards mobility of apprentices, revealing the extent of the problems of compatibility between the various national apprenticeship training schemes.

⁹³ <http://international.blogs.ouest-france.fr/archive/2017/09/29/macron-sorbonne-verbatim-europe-18583.html>

⁹⁴ https://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/rapport_arthuis_-_18_janvier.pdf

⁹⁵ The EuroApp association was created in 2016 by members of the "European Apprenticeship Ambassadors" consortium to promote European mobility actions for young apprentices. <https://www.euroapp.fr/>

The work preceding the drafting of the texts relating to mobility in the "Professional Future" law of September 2018 made it possible to identify the obstacles to mobility and pose the necessary questions for the development of an effective framework for the long-term mobility of apprentices: what should be the apprentice's social security coverage during the mobility period?; what are the impacts on the apprentice's employment contract?; etc. The Ministry of Labour has, therefore, worked with other ministries to create safe conditions for the apprentice to go abroad and return [Ministry of Labour].

The pilot projects had also highlighted the importance of the CFA in organising mobility, including for large companies. The 2018 "Professional Future" law integrates this dimension by imposing the presence of a mobility referent (see earlier discussion) in the CFAs.

The new modalities for LTMA have entered into force for contracts concluded as of 1 January 2019 and whose mobility period begins as of 25 October 2019. As the scheme is very recent, the implementation measures for the further development of mobility will be introduced in 2020: (i) communication and discussion with CFAs, OPCOs and companies; communication with the general public, etc. The measures will be implemented by the end of the year. At this stage, the Ministry of Labour has already published communication kits, available on the Ministry's website,⁹⁶ for companies and CFAs [Ministry of Labour].

It is not yet possible to gauge the effects of the new system that is being put in place, in terms of its impact on LTMA. An evaluation of skills needs to be addressed through mobility is yet to be carried out [MESR].

Referring to the development of Erasmus+ mobility in higher education, France can be considered to be in the second phase of the implementation of a national strategy for CBLTMA: the rolling out of new provisions for the development of CBLTMA⁹⁷. Other subsequent steps will be necessary: a communication to develop the LTMA, and an evaluation of its added value [AFREF].

In higher education, there are no pilot projects, but only local projects: for example, the creation of a cross-border CFA between France and Germany has allowed for the implementation of flexible mobility arrangements according to students' individual situations and needs, making it possible for them to move from site to site, without necessarily initially planning the specific corresponding periods over the three-year course [MESR].

⁹⁶ <https://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/demarches-ressources-documentaires/documentation-et-publications-officielles/guides/kits-mobilite-alternance>

⁹⁷ The first stage was the phase of the pilot projects to identify obstacles to CBLTMA, and the preparation of the 2018 reform taking into account these obstacles and setting up a framework more favourable to CBLTMA.

As far as the Ministry of Agriculture is concerned, a previous project dating from 2012 led to the development of some twenty bilateral mobility agreements between France and partner countries.⁹⁸ Each mobility agreement template was adapted to the particularities of the sending and receiving countries. The lessons learned from this project demonstrate the importance of the correct and clear translation of the mobility agreements (to the language of the foreign partners), so that their terms are sufficiently understood by partners in the foreign country.

More broadly, the pilot projects also showed the need to refine one's knowledge of the legal framework and mobility-related obstacles in the various partner countries [CMA France].

Among the projects recently developed, the Chamber of Trades and Crafts of the Rhone started in September 2019 an Erasmus+ strategic partnership project. This 24-month TRAPP project aims to facilitate, secure and promote long-term mobility during and after the learning period. It proposes to develop a European certification in the form of an international complementary mention for two specific sectors: hairdressing and automotive⁹⁹

As part of the internationalisation plan for the *Compagnons du devoir*, a target of 100 apprentices engaged in LTMA has been set for 2021.

1.3.5. Dimension 3.7. Methodologies and guidelines

In February 2019, the Ministry of Labour published two practical toolkits dedicated to the European or international mobility of students in alternance training schemes in order to facilitate the steps for CBLTMA to be implemented by the apprenticeship training centres and the companies employing apprentices.¹⁰⁰ They present useful information in terms of consequences on the employment contract¹⁰¹, financing of mobility, social security coverage and validation of the outcomes of mobility periods.

The Ministry of National Education has published a *vademecum* on European and international mobility for vocational secondary schools.¹⁰²

⁹⁸ <https://www.european-mobility.eu/>

⁹⁹ <https://www.cma-lyon.fr/se-former/europe/trapp>

¹⁰⁰ Ministry of Labour (2019). *Kits Mobilité européenne ou internationale des alternants [Kits European or international mobility of alternating trainees]*. <https://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/demarches-ressources-documentaires/documentation-et-publications-officielles/guides/kits-mobilite-alternance>

¹⁰¹ This refers to the possibility to “suspend” the employment contract during one mobility of more than one month

¹⁰² Ministry of national education and youth (2019). *Vade-Mecum – Les mobilités internationales et européennes [Vade-Mecum – International and European mobility]*.

It has also published regulations to promote mobility and its recognition in the certification of professional diplomas:

- Decree amending the provisions of the Education Code enabling international mobility as part of vocational diploma courses;¹⁰³
- Ministerial order establishing: an optional mobility unit and the MobilitéPro certificate as part of the vocational baccalaureate (*baccalauréat professionnel*):
 - the vocational certificate (*brevet professionnel*) and the trade certificate (*brevet des métiers d'arts*); and
 - a decree creating an optional mobility unit and the “MobilitéPro” certificate as part of the vocational skills certificate (CAP, *Certificat d'Aptitude Professionnelle*)¹⁰⁴.

The agency *Erasmus+ France Education and training* has coordinated the publication of a set of skills for European and international mobility advisors (“*référénts mobilité*”) in apprenticeship training centres.¹⁰⁵

Several sectoral networks have also published guides dedicated to the implementation of apprenticeship mobility projects, which are not limited to CBLTMA, for example ANFA for the automotive sector.¹⁰⁶

1.3.6. Dimensions 3.8. Authorities promoting long-term mobility if apprentices; 3.9. Involvement of intermediary organisations and structures;

The State will be able to communicate on and promote CBLTMA. Professional branches, depending on their policies, may choose to make CBLTMA a priority. The other institutions concerned are the Erasmus+ agency, the OPCOs, certain regional authorities, consular networks, and CFA networks.

Some economic actors point to a lack of clarity in the cooperation arrangements caused by the multiplicity of actors involved [FIPA].

In order to move from the early/pilot stage to a more established/mainstream stage, it might be relevant to organize one or two annual meetings at the national

https://cache.media.eduscol.education.fr/file/lycee_pro_2018/46/3/VM_Mobilitees_internationales_et_europeennes_1128463.pdf

¹⁰³ <https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/eli/decret/2019/8/30/MENE1909773D/jo/texte>

¹⁰⁴

<https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000039001883atEgorieLien=id>

¹⁰⁵ Agence Erasmus + France Education & Formation et al. (2018). *Les compétences d'un(e) référent(e) mobilité européenne et internationale dans un centre de formation d'apprentis* [The skills of a European and international mobility referent in an apprenticeship training centre]. http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/docs/2731_guide_cfa_final.pdf

¹⁰⁶ <https://www.anfa-auto.fr/sites/default/files/2018-01/guidemobiliteeuropeenne.pdf>

level to enable the ministries concerned [MENJ, Ministry of Labour, etc.] and the networks of CFAs, ECVET experts and other stakeholders to exchange information on LTMA-related practices and difficulties encountered. Such meetings would make it possible to make the regulations evolve in a pragmatic way [MENJ, Compagnons du devoir].

1.3.7. Dimension 3.10. Role and capacity of VET providers in implementing mobility

The 2018 "Professional Future" law has made it possible to create a new function within the CFAs: the "mobility coordinator" who is a member of staff dedicated to the mission assigned to the CFA in the context of an apprentice's mobility. The CFA is indeed required to:

- assist stakeholders in the conclusion of a mobility agreement;
- support the trainee and his/her employer in drafting and sending letters to the health insurance fund;
- take the necessary steps to obtain financial aid from the various funders;
- contact the authority issuing the diploma or qualification in order to organise the arrangements for the recognition of mobility-related learning outcomes;
- ensure follow-up of and support for the apprentice during the period of mobility, particularly in the case of difficulties abroad;
- ensure, if necessary, a successful reintegration into the home company after the period of mobility.

These measures will have to be in place by 1st January 2021 (1st January 2022 for the CFAs that already existed in September 2018).¹⁰⁷

The OPCOs cover costs related to the "mobility referent" [Ministry of Labour]. However, the precise details of the assumption of this responsibility by OPCOs remain to be determined. Mobility coordinators do not generally work full-time on the CFAs' international mobility mission, and their position includes other duties (organizational/administrative issues, management or teaching). Mobility projects often rely on the personal investment of few individuals, sometimes requiring extra work [Compagnons du devoir].

It is essential that the function of mobility referent be recognised, valued, and supported with appropriate training and professionalization [CMA]. Two areas of specialization of the job mobility function can be developed: by profession, or by geographical area of destination [Compagnons du devoir].

The implementation of CBLTMA requires a significant amount of outreach and promotional work (formalising the framework, convincing companies of the

¹⁰⁷ Criterion 4.20 of Decree 2019-65 of 6 June 2019 relating to the national reference system on the quality of actions contributing to skills development. https://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/guide-referentiel-qualite_28-10.pdf

benefits of CBLTMA, setting up an appropriate system for the recognition of learning outcomes in mobility, etc.) [Erasmus + Agency]. The apprentice must also be supported in related areas (housing, social insurance, transport, etc.).

Many long-standing CFAs often do not have the means and the time to devote themselves to this work [Erasmus + Agency]. The capacity of the CFAs is very uneven: some networks have invested in mobility and provide support to small CFAs; CFAs in higher education are better equipped in that regard; the company size can also play a critical role as regards LTMA [MENJ]. CFAs interviewed in the framework of a project led by large companies expressed a lack of capacity to develop CBLTMA, particularly due to the lack of harmonisation between European countries regarding apprentice status and social-type regulations [FACE].

It can be assumed that even if all CFAs must offer mobility opportunities to their apprentices, those with more experience of CBLTMA implementation will cooperate with and support those CFAs with no or limited experience in this area [CFDT]. International mobility could also be an attraction factor for newly established CFAs [AFREF].

From the point of view of a social partner [CFDT], the search for host companies in another country should not be the responsibility of the training centres, but of structures under the public employment service.

An important element of the internal organization of the CFAs concerns their capacity for financial analysis of the budgetary impact of the cost of mobility. In the case of higher education, the custom of operating within a subsidised framework for mobility may make it difficult to properly assess the financial burden of mobility, including the costs of support, on both apprentices and companies. An under-assessment of the human resources needed for CBLTMA poses a risk for the quality of the support to both apprentices and companies and the ultimate success of mobility [MESRI].

1.3.8. Dimension 3.11. Funding of long-term mobility

In order to make the mobility of apprentices as financially secure as possible, it is planned that a request for funding will be sent to the OPCO before the mobility agreement is concluded. The latter should also make it possible to specify the apprentice's financial resources needed during the period of mobility abroad (Ministry of Labour).

Even if they are more favourable than those for students, Erasmus Pro grants can only cover part of the subsistence costs, and do not compensate for the loss of earnings of an apprentice in the context of long-term mobility (Erasmus+ Agency).

The question of whether or not the OPCOs should take responsibility for the apprentice's loss of earnings, remains, therefore, a central issue (see chapter 1.2.5). By the end of 2019, only a few OPCOs had specified their policy for taking

charge of apprentice mobility, which for some was geared towards financing the costs borne by the CFAs.

Interviewees expressed different views as to whether or not it is necessary to harmonise and regulate centrally the conditions of funding of LTMA by the OPCOs.

Concern was expressed at the very different funding practices being established from one OPCO to another [MESR]; better visibility on accepted levels of funding would be needed [FIPA].

The governance of apprenticeship (professional branches and OPCOs from 2020 onwards and in connection with *France Compétences*) could allow the implementation of already structured pathways for CBLTMA, with appropriate provisions for expense coverage ensuring good conditions for the apprentice. This perspective would require cooperation between the professional branches, the CFAs and *France Compétences* in order to fix these "contract costs" [CFDT].

A streamlining of the procedures might be desirable, which would require the establishment of fixed lump sums calculated on various criteria and modulated depending the host country. This lump sum defined by decree would leave a percentage range at the discretion of the OPCOs. It could also include a level of remuneration in the case of a suspension of the employment contract. This model would require the establishment of a national framework [MESR, ATLAS].

1.3.9. Dimensions 3.12. Employers' interest in receiving apprentices from abroad on long-term mobility; 3.13. Employers' interest in letting apprentices go abroad on long-term mobility; 3.14. Apprentices and their families' interest in long-term mobility

Multiple factors play a role in motivating companies, young people and their families towards LTMA.

The formal recognition of the CBLTMA is a fundamental point: for example, a qualification or a specific competence block integrating the achievements of mobility [UIMM, ANFA, CFDT, ANFA, Erasmus + Agency]. In this situation, course titles should be self-explanatory and easy for the employer to understand.

The acquisition of "soft skills" can respond to a strong interest by both employers and apprentices, including the discovery of another culture, way(s) of working, as well as the acquisition of 'hard', technical skills like specific know-how in relation to a particular discipline/profession (ANAF, FACE). Improving foreign language skills is also an important benefit.

The international appetite for CBLTMA also echoes the more Europhile sentiments of the younger generation [MESR]. Mobility is a factor in building a sense of European citizenship and shared EU identity, which will be embodied in lived experiences across the EU; for example, non-French young apprentices in

the craft sector who are welcomed in France and stay there to settle and create their own company [Compagnons du devoir].

The improvement of transversal and professional/technical skills also generates positive effects in terms of young people's employability and personal development [Erasmus+ Agency, ANFA].

Cultural and psychological barriers remain important in terms of promoting mobility among learners preparing for level 3 and 4 qualifications [CMA].

The perception of the benefits of mobility is less easy from a company point of view [CMA]. However, providing sufficient motivation for both sending and host companies is an imperative condition for developing LTMA [Erasmus + Agency].

In certain fields of activity, the company will be able to benefit upon the apprentice's return from specific working methods and know-how acquired during his/her stay abroad [Compagnons du devoir, CCCA-BTP, CMA France]. The LTMA can also support a company's internationalization strategy.

Furthermore, an employer's ability to send apprentices abroad can be seen positively as a strength and a factor of attractiveness by apprentices and their families [ANAF] [CMA France].

The EQAMOB&CO label¹⁰⁸ is a means of promoting companies offering quality mobility while improving their visibility at EU level [Compagnons du devoir, CMA].

One way of enabling companies to benefit from the skills development of their apprentices undertaking a mobility period abroad is to organise the return to the home company after CBLTMA, for example with full-time presence of the apprentices in the company during the last 3 or 4 months of the training course, once they have passed their exams [MESR].

The benefits of mobility also extend to the CFA apprenticeship training centres concerned, which report "unintended effects": overhaul of teaching approaches and methods, professionalisation of teams, new momentum with companies, increased attractiveness of apprenticeships for young people and their families.

¹⁰⁸ <http://www.euroapprenticeship.eu/fr/information-sur-eqamob-co-1.html>

CHAPTER 2. Latest and future developments

The new legal framework for apprenticeships in France benefits from a particularly favourable conditions at both National and EU level for the development of CBLTMA.

More still needs to be done to meet the challenge of democratising CBLTMA.

The French apprenticeship system is undergoing a transition that will last until 2021, and the players in the new VET system are still adapting to these changes in the early 2020s.

The liberalisation of the opening of CFAs has encouraged the arrival of new players: By mid-December 2019, the Ministry of Labour had already listed nearly 900 intentions to establish CFAs, about a third of which have already been established. These new institutions are created by training organisations, with a view to diversifying their activities and/or to making a profit. About 60 are carried by companies that create their own CFA, in order to adapt the training as closely as possible to their needs.

The possible effects on LTMA will vary from sector to sector, depending on their level of internationalisation. The interest of new CFAs in LTMA may be fuelled by the attractiveness of CBLTMA but held back by the related costs.

This new context could make it easier to bring together the 'sphere' of large companies, including those with international operations, which mainly organise mobility outside the Erasmus+ programme, and the institutional 'sphere' of those involved in the development of apprentices' mobility (Ministry of National Education, stakeholders involved in apprenticeships and CFA networks rather targeted at small and medium-sized enterprises and which use Erasmus+ funding opportunities).

The implementation of the new provisions designed to develop the mobility of apprentices in France will be accompanied by operational details, which will affect the impact of these provisions for CBLTMA in particular.

Depending on the decisions of the social partners for the professional branches they represent, each of the OCPOs takes a position on the subject of mobility by specifying the modalities chosen to take charge of the mobility of apprentices: for example, for the OPCO mobility,¹⁰⁹ a flat rate of €1,200 per European mobility and

¹⁰⁹ Transport and automotive sectors

€1,500 per international mobility; for the OPCO Afdas,¹¹⁰ a flat rate of €400 for mobility of less than 4 weeks, €500 up to 6 months and €600 above, with a 10% increase for BAC levels and below.

To our knowledge, no OPCO has so far taken a position on the open possibility of taking over the loss of earnings of apprentice engaged in LTMA for whom there is a break in his/her employment contract, while he/she is abroad .

The levels of coverage of mobility costs applied by the OPCOs could possibly be the subject of a second phase which lists the different costs effectively funded by the OPCOs, to improve the visibility of the financial aids available for the CFAs.

If the dialogue at the local level between CFA and OPCO proves insufficient, it may be necessary to set up an inter-OPCO operating framework at a later stage, or even to establish a national framework for the coverage of mobility costs.

The issue of remuneration for mobile apprentices, should it fail to be addressed satisfactorily within the framework currently envisaged, may require further policy action in the future.

The model agreements to be used by the CFAs for short and long-term mobility are still expected at the end of 2019, with the corresponding decrees currently being drafted. These are essential because they constitute the legal basis for the period of mobility.

One question still outstanding is whether or not the employer will be able to opt out of a break in the apprentice's employment contract in the case of mobility of more than four weeks, as requested by large companies.

With regard to funding by the Erasmus+ programme, in its new programming period Erasmus+ 2021-2027 will operate in a simplified manner for vocational education and training, moving closer to the way it operates for higher education: e.g. accreditation of each training organisation according to its strategy for developing mobility, evaluated in accordance with quality standards.

The respective share of short- and long-term mobility to be developed remains very uncertain. Although short-term mobility will certainly remain dominant, the stakeholders interviewed insist on the difference in aims and ambition between short-term mobility and CBLTMA. The impact of CBLTMA is broadly considered by the stakeholders interviewed as immeasurable in terms of skills developed and long-term effects. However, short-term mobility can be used as a steppingstone to raise awareness among young people, their families and

¹¹⁰ Culture sector, creative industries, communication

companies of the benefits of international mobility, and to enable CFAs to start mobility projects.

The evaluation of the CBLTMA projects will provide data enabling to communicate more widely on the benefits of CBLTMA and to raise some interest among various players and stakeholders in supporting or being involved in new CBLTMA projects.

Conclusions

The CBLTMA can only develop by building on existing and future dynamics and initiatives taken in other European countries and at EU level.

Compatibility between the systems of the different countries is a major factor, as highlighted by the CBLTMA pilot projects.

The development of reciprocal exchanges, twinning, joint qualifications, is a possible way to support the development of CBLTMA, based on the construction of bilateral partnerships. However, compatibility between apprenticeship systems is not symmetrical: a facility for sending apprentices from country A to country B does not automatically imply a facility for receiving apprentices from country B in country A.

EU support could focus on identifying the level of compatibility for the CBLTMA of different learning systems in relation to each other. The identification of the systems most open to CBLTMA could make it possible to constitute a "first circle" of countries most favourable to it.

At the multilateral level, the development of partnership networks structured in a sustainable way at European level, involving apprenticeship stakeholders, represents an institutional infrastructure capable of promoting CBLTMA: European alliances involving economic stakeholders, in particular at the level of professional branches, development of CoVETs, ...

One hypothesis is that the development of apprentice mobility could be correlated with trends towards specialisation by fields of activity and geographical areas.

The choice of whether or not to give priority to strategies aimed at harmonization at European level arises at different levels: efforts towards social harmonization with the search for convergence concerning the status of apprentices, or concerning vocational qualifications, training programs and assessment frameworks.

Another option is to focus on supporting cooperative capacities for the CBLTMA without aiming to reduce the very great heterogeneity of national systems and frameworks. This orientation requires equipping the actors to enable them to develop CBLTMA projects integrating the diversity of national situations and constraints.

Whatever the direction taken, strong support from national authorities, the EU and European organisations competent in the field of vocational training will be essential to support the players and allow significant development of high-quality and recognised CBLTMAs.

Annex 1. Interview partners

Sort by type of organisations

Short name	Full name	Type of organisation (e.g. public authority etc.)	Interviewee
MENJ	Ministry of national education and youth <i>Ministère de l'Éducation nationale et de la Jeunesse</i>	Public authority	Brigitte Trocmé
MESRI	Ministry of higher education, research and innovation <i>Ministère de l'Enseignement supérieur, la Recherche et l'Innovation</i>	Public authority	William Gamard
Ministry of Agriculture	Ministry of Agriculture Regional directorate for Nouvelle-Aquitaine	Public authority	Anne Richard
Ministry of Labour	Ministry of Labour Employment, Vocational Training and Social Dialogue <i>Ministère du Travail, de la Formation Professionnelle et du Dialogue social</i>	Public authority	Laurie Albien
Agency Erasmus +	Agency Erasmus + France / Education and training <i>Agence Erasmus+ France / Education Formation</i>	Public body	Sébastien Thierry
Agency Erasmus +	Agency Erasmus + France / Education and training <i>Agence Erasmus+ France / Education Formation</i>	Public body	Sylvain Scherpereel
ANFA	Association Nationale pour la Formation Automobile <i>National Association for Automotive Training</i>	Social partners	Gabriel Andreas

Short name	Full name	Type of organisation (e.g. public authority etc.)	Interviewee
ATLAS	OPCO (skills operator) of financial and consulting services	Social partners	Nizzar Bouchada
CCCA BTP	Building trade CFA network	Social partners	Marek Lawinski
CFDT	French Democratic Confederation of Labour <i>Confédération Française Démocratique du Travail</i>	Social partners	Michèle Perrin
CMA France	National Network of Chambers of Trades and Crafts <i>Réseau national des Chambres des métiers et de l'artisanat (ex APCMA - Assemblée Permanente des Chambres des Métiers et de l'Artisanat)</i>	Social partners	Sabine Weger
CRMA Nouvelle-Aquitaine	Regional Network of Chambers of Trades and Crafts <i>Réseau régional des Chambres des métiers et de l'artisanat (ex APCMA - Assemblée Permanente des Chambres des Métiers et de l'Artisanat)</i>	Social partners	Agnieszka Litwinowicz
CRMA Rhône Alpes	Regional Network of Chambers of Trades and Crafts <i>Réseau régional des Chambres des métiers et de l'artisanat (ex APCMA - Assemblée Permanente des Chambres des Métiers et de l'Artisanat)</i>	Social partners	Sophie Putcrabey
UIMM	Union of metalworking industries and trades <i>Union des industries et métiers de la métallurgie</i>	Social partners	Xavier Delpy
AFREF	French Association for Reflection and Exchange on Training <i>Association française pour la réflexion et l'échange sur la formation</i>	National expert	René Bargorsky

Short name	Full name	Type of organisation (e.g. public authority etc.)	Interviewee
MEP Jean Arthuis	Member of European Parliament Jean Arthuis	National expert	Jean Arthuis
Compagnons du devoir	Association Companions of Duty and Tour de France <i>Association des Compagnons du devoir et du Tour de France</i>	Organisation representing VET Providers	Marinne Dolle
Compagnons du devoir	Association Companions of Duty and Tour de France <i>Association des Compagnons du devoir et du Tour de France</i>	Organisation representing VET Providers	Vanessa DUVAL
FNADIR	National Federation of Regional Associations of Managers of Apprenticeship Training Centres <i>Fédération Nationale des Associations Régionales de Directeurs de Centres de Formation d'Apprentis</i>	Organisation representing VET Providers	Thierry Joseph
SYNOFDES	National Union of Training Organizations <i>Syndicat national des organismes de formation</i>	Organisation representing VET Providers	Catherine Nasser
ANAF	National Association of Apprentices of France <i>Association nationale des apprentis de France</i>	Organisation representing apprentices, learners and youth	Aurélien cadiou
FIPA	Innovation for Learning Foundation <i>Fondation Innovation pour les apprentissage</i>	Employers	Yann Bouvier
Fondation FACE	Foundation Acting against exclusion <i>Fondation Agir contre l'exclusion</i>	Employers	Sarah Cheriha

Sort by short names

Short name	Full name	Type of organisation (e.g. public authority etc.)
AFREF	French Association for Reflection and Exchange on Training <i>Association française pour la réflexion et l'échange sur la formation</i>	National expert
Agency Erasmus +	Agency Erasmus + France / Education and training <i>Agence Erasmus+ France / Education Formation</i>	Public body
Agency Erasmus +	Agency Erasmus + France / Education and training <i>Agence Erasmus+ France / Education Formation</i>	Public body
ANAF	National Association of Apprentices of France <i>Association nationale des apprentis de France</i>	Organisation representing apprentices, learners and youth
ANFA	Association Nationale pour la Formation Automobile <i>National Association for Automotive Training</i>	Social partners
ATLAS	OPCO (skills operator) of financial and consulting services	Social partners
CCCA BTP	Building trade CFA network	Social partners
CFDT	French Democratic Confederation of Labour <i>Confédération Française Démocratique du Travail</i>	Social partners

Short name	Full name	Type of organisation (e.g. public authority etc.)
CMA France	National Network of Chambers of Trades and Crafts <i>Réseau national des Chambres des métiers et de l'artisanat (ex APCMA - Assemblée Permanente des Chambres des Métiers et de l'Artisanat)</i>	Social partners
Compagnons du devoir	Association Companions of Duty and Tour de France <i>Association des Compagnons du devoir et du Tour de France</i>	Organisation representing VET Providers
Compagnons du devoir	Association Companions of Duty and Tour de France <i>Association des Compagnons du devoir et du Tour de France</i>	Organisation representing VET Providers
CRMA Nouvelle-Aquitaine	Regional Network of Chambers of Trades and Crafts <i>Réseau régional des Chambres des métiers et de l'artisanat (ex APCMA - Assemblée Permanente des Chambres des Métiers et de l'Artisanat)</i>	Social partners
CRMA Rhône Alpes	Regional Network of Chambers of Trades and Crafts <i>Réseau régional des Chambres des métiers et de l'artisanat (ex APCMA - Assemblée Permanente des Chambres des Métiers et de l'Artisanat)</i>	Social partners
FIPA	Innovation for Learning Foundation <i>Fondation Innovation pour les apprentissage</i>	Employers
FNADIR	National Federation of Regional Associations of Managers of Apprenticeship Training Centres <i>Fédération Nationale des Associations Régionales de Directeurs de Centres de Formation d'Apprentis</i>	Organisation representing VET Providers
Fondation FACE	Foundation Acting against exclusion <i>Fondation Agir contre l'exclusion</i>	Employers
MENJ	Ministry of national education and youth <i>Ministère de l'Éducation nationale et de la Jeunesse</i>	Public authority

Short name	Full name	Type of organisation (e.g. public authority etc.)
MEP Jean Arthuis	Member of European Parliament Jean Arthuis	National expert
MESRI	Ministry of higher education, research and innovation <i>Ministère de l'Enseignement supérieur, la Recherche et l'Innovation</i>	Public authority
Ministry of Agriculture	Ministry of Agriculture Regional directorate for Nouvelle-Aquitaine	Public authority
Ministry of Labour	Ministry of Labour Employment, Vocational Training and Social Dialogue <i>Ministère du Travail, de la Formation Professionnelle et du Dialogue social</i>	Public authority
SYNOFDES	National Union of Training Organizations <i>Syndicat national des organismes de formation</i>	Organisation representing VET Providers
UIMM	Union of metalworking industries and trades <i>Union des industries et métiers de la métallurgie</i>	Social partners

Annex 2. References

- Agence Erasmus + France Education & Formation et al. (2018). *Les compétences d'un(e) référent(e) mobilité européenne et internationale dans un centre de formation d'apprentis [The skills of a European and international mobility referent in an apprenticeship training centre]*. http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/docs/2731_guide_cfa_final.pdf
- Arthuis, J. (2018). *Erasmus Pro, lever les freins à la mobilité des apprentis [Erasmus Pro, removing obstacles to the mobility of apprentices]*. https://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/rapport_arthuis_-_18_janvier.pdf.
- CCCA-BTP (2018). *Mobilité européenne : se professionnaliser et augmenter son employabilité [European mobility: professionalizing and increasing employability]*, *Hors-série CCCA-BTP n°12*, Education permanente, 2018-4. http://www.education-permanente.fr/public/articles/articles.php?id_revue=1753&id_article=2729#esume2729
- CEREQ 2016. *Dispositif d'enquêtes sur les formations et itinéraires des salariés - Premiers indicateurs du volet entreprises [Survey on employee training and career development - First indicators of the investigation concerning businesses]*. www.cereq.fr/content/download/16720/134826/file/netdoc156.pdf
- CEREQ (2016). *Typologie sectorielle des modes de gestion de la main d'œuvre [Sectoral typology of workforce management modes]*. www.cereq.fr/content/download/16701/134612/file/netdoc157.pdf
- CEREQ (2019). *Les déterminants de la gestion des compétences au sein des entreprises [The determinants of skills management in companies]*. <http://www.cereq.fr/content/download/22748/194699/file/WP7.pdf>
- Cedefop (2018). *Apprenticeship schemes in European countries - A cross-nation overview* https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/files/4166_en.pdf
- DARES (2015). *En 30 ans, forte progression de l'emploi dans les métiers qualifiés et dans certains métiers peu qualifiés de services [In 30 years, strong growth in employment in skilled trades and in some low-skilled service trades]*. <https://dares.travail-emploi.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/2015-028.pdf>

- Ministry of Labour (2019). *Kits Mobilité européenne ou internationale des alternants [Kits European or international mobility of alternating trainees]*. <https://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/demarches-ressources-documentaires/documentation-et-publications-officielles/guides/kits-mobilite-alternance>
- Ministry of national education and youth (2018). *Repères et références statistiques sur les enseignements, la formation et la recherche 2018 [Benchmarks and statistical references on teaching, training and research 2018]*. https://cache.media.education.gouv.fr/file/RERS_2018/22/8/depp-2018-RERS-chap-05_1018228.pdf
- Ministry of national education and youth (2019). *Vade-Mecum – Les mobilités internationales et européennes [Vade-Mecum – International and European mobility]*. https://cache.media.eduscol.education.fr/file/lycee_pro_2018/46/3/VM_Mobilitees_internationales_et_europeennes_1128463.pdf
- IGAS (2017). *La mobilité européenne des apprentis [European mobility of apprentices]* http://www.igas.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/2017-048R_.pdf
- Observatoire Erasmus + (2018). *Note n° 10 - Erasmus + : Vers une démocratisation et une inclusion renforcées ? [Erasmus +: Towards greater democratisation and inclusion?]*. http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/docs/2772_observatoire_10.pdf
- Observatoire Erasmus + (2019). *Note n° 11 - L'alternance dans Erasmus + : un premier état des lieux [Note 11 - The alternating training in Erasmus +: a first inventory of the situation]*. http://www.agence-erasmus.fr/docs/2781_observatoire_11.pdf