Evaluating impact and success for VET policies to tackle early leaving from education and training

Irene Psifidou, Cedefop
Daniela Ulicna, Patricia Vale, Sarah Fleury, Bianca Faragau-Tavares
ICF International

Expert Workshop
Brussels, 21 October 2015
Agenda

9.30 – 10.00 Introductory speech
   Presentation on the factors affecting early leaving from VET

10.00 – 11.00 Session 1: Features of effective VET measures

11.00 – 11.15 Coffee break

11.15 – 12.30 Session 2: Tools for implementation

12.30 – 13.30 Lunch

13.30 – 14.30 Session 3: Monitoring and evaluation

14.30 – 15.30 Session 4: Transferability and sustainability

15.30 – 15.45 Coffee break

15.45 – 16.45 Session 5: Key policy messages

16.45 – 17.00 Closing and follow up activities
Introductory speech:
Factors affecting early leaving from VET
Understanding the problem
Looking at solutions that work
Reconstructing the ‘theory’
Reviewing Evaluations
What is supporting transfer
What are the characteristics of measures that have proved to be effective?
Are the right things being measured to understand whether a policy is effective?

How is learning from evidence and evidence-based practice supported?
Linking the factors and measures’ characteristics (why does it work?)

Who are ELET and where do they come from?
Factors leading to ELET
Phase I
Factors associated with early leaving

Phase II
Policies and measures to tackle early leaving

- 755 interviews
  - National-level interviews (ministry, research centres, statistical offices, PES, chambers...); and
  - On-site interviews (school heads, teachers, learners, local authorities...)

In Austria, Belgium, Croatia, Denmark, Estonia, France, Germany, Hungary, Ireland, Italy, Luxembourg, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal and UK

- 44 measures selected for in-depth analysis

- Quantitative analysis: Adult Education Survey (AES); Programme for International Assessment of Adult Competences (PIAAC); national data (FR, NL).
Understanding better the scale of early leaving

- Experiencing dropout ≠ early leaving:
  - 58% of ELET are ‘non-starters’ – 42% have experienced a drop-out event
  - 1/3 of people with drop-out experience achieve upper-secondary qualification
  - Most achieve VET qualifications
- Still, the majority of those who are ELET at one point remain early leavers.
EL is more common for those enrolled in VET programmes
The overwhelming majority for those who start in general education and switch to VET programmes gain their upper secondary qualification.
Factors affecting EL(V)ET – and their relationship with education & training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual and family</th>
<th>(V)E&amp;T</th>
<th>Labour market</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Family engagement and support in education choices</td>
<td>• Overall education achievement</td>
<td>• Better pay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Health and well-being affecting education perf/ choices</td>
<td>• Students’ orientation</td>
<td>• Regulations (access to jobs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Gender</td>
<td>• Perceptions of the profession</td>
<td>• Working conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Migrant and ethnic minority background</td>
<td>• Negative self-perception linked to ones’ learning</td>
<td>• Overall economic context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Programme content and orientation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures addressing ELVET</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Prevention</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VET bridging and preparatory programmes, including study guarantees</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial incentives to reduce ELVET</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELVET resources or expertise for VET schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of teachers and in-company trainers to deal with ELVET</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intervention</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early warning systems and units</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional support: counselling, guidance, mentoring and case management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short term time out measures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Compensation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening up VET for new groups of learners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second chance VET programmes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive reengagement programmes making use of VET programmes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What makes measures to tackle ELET successful?

- The content of measures – the working methods being put in place
- The approach to design and implementation
Session 1. Features of effective VET measures
Early leavers profiles

- **Escapist**
  - Frequently absent and not interested in ET

- **Non-conformist**
  - Frequently absent, poor education achievement, negative attitude to school

- **Lost in transition**
  - Does not adapt to the requirements and expectations of the new programme

- **Resigned**
  - Does not find a suitable place due to lack of required skills

- **Obligated**
  - Decides to drop out for economic or family reasons

- **Marginalised**
  - Accumulates disadvantage and challenges
Low academic performance (and demotivation linked to previous failure)

Measures:
• Provide opportunities for remedial training, tutoring as part of mainstream programmes
• Integrate training covering basic skills depending on individual’s needs
• Individualised learning plans
• Activities aimed at building confidence and motivation

Students’ inappropriate orientation

• Opportunities to try different professional orientations (tasting)
• One-to-one coaching/Mentoring

Negative perception of VET education and negative self-perception

• Work-based learning as a means to valorise VET pathways
• Coaching for development of career-plans including development of a positive vision of one’s pathway
Lack of flexibility of the system (differentiation and track selection)

Measures:
• Possibility to transit between programmes
• Transition from remedial measures to VET programmes or apprenticeships
• Low-entry barriers to programmes

Low practical content of programmes and difficulty to find a work placement
• Develop work-readiness by working on skills such as time management, communication, working in a team
• Provide work-based learning and close-to-real simulations as a motivational measure
• Cooperate with employers

Low expectations on future employability
• Remuneration of apprentices
• Provide young people with a vision of their future beyond the qualification – offer positive role models
Difficult school and classroom climate, students’ not being well integrated

Measures:
- Accountability for all teachers and trainers to tackle the problem of ELET
- School-level action plans to tackle ELET

Non-supportive family environment

Measures:
- Parental involvement, giving parents the tools to support the education progression and choices of their children

Difficulties related to issues outside education: health, mental health, poverty, etc.

Measures:
- Case-management. Work in parallel on the full range of challenges the person faces. Young person is in contact with one intermediary.
**Exercise 1: Features of effective VET measures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work in pairs</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Discuss the key features identified in the Homework you have prepared prior to the event.</td>
<td>Rank the common features and fill in the table jointly</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Small group work</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Small group work – discuss key features focusing on a learner profile:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) at risk of dropping out</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) has just dropped out</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) has been outside education and training for a year</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Coffee break
Session 2. Tools for design and implementation of effective measures to address EL(V)ET
Learning from the CROCOOS project
Krisztina Mihalyi, Tempus Public Foundation

Learning from the Recognize, Remedy, Re-engage project
Béatrix Charlier, Ecole Privée Marie-Consolatrice
Exercise 2: Tools for design & implementation

Each group focuses on one question:
- *How are successful measures designed and funded?*
- *How do successful measures identify and reach out to potential target learners?*
- *How successful measures change attitudes of teachers / school leaders?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual reflection</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What are the challenges linked to design of measure/recruitment of learners/changing attitude of teachers?</td>
<td>Write 1 challenge per post-it and place it on the flipchart</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Small group work</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Discuss the challenges</td>
<td>Write down the common points on the flipchart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discuss solutions to the challenges identified (how these challenges can be addressed by successful measures).</td>
<td>List solutions identified on the flipchart</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lunch break
Session 3. Monitoring and evaluation

"Your performance rating is terrible, Fenwick, but I like your looks."
To know whether a measure is effective, we need to know what difference is it making, if any...
At individual level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>The number (or share) of people at risk of ELET</th>
<th>The number (or share) of ELET</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>Diminish the nbr of people at risk Retain the people at risk in ET Improve their education outcomes and ultimately employment outcomes</td>
<td>Diminish the nbr (share) of ELET Reintegrate them into ET Ensure they reach a qualification Improve their employment outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inputs</td>
<td>€, Human Resources, content of measures (activities)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outputs</td>
<td>Participants, Coaching sessions, Training sessions, etc. (depends on the activities)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results</td>
<td>Improved participation, improved engagement, improved orientation, improved attitude to ET, etc.</td>
<td>Improved motivation to integrate ET, participation in ET, improved basic skills, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact</td>
<td>Qualification attainment, education and employment outcomes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### At institutional level

| Problem | Overall: The number (or share) of ELET and those at risk  
Institutional level: Teachers, trainers tend to ‘evacuate’ the problem |
|---------|------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Objectives | Reduce the number of ELET. Increase the number of those who are at risk  
and who are supported  
Improve teachers’/ trainers understanding of issues leading to ELET  
Increase the number of teachers/ trainers who take actions to tackle ELET |
| Inputs | €, Human Resources, content of measures (activities) |
| Outputs | Participants, School-level action plans, training sessions, etc. (depends on the activities) |
| Results | Activities implemented as a result of training, school-level action plans,  
number of young people taking part in such activities |
| Impact | Change in teachers’ behaviours  
Share of young people reintegrated, retained or changed paths |
Out of 44 measures, 37 have been evaluated
2 include a baseline; 5 include a control group; 21 included a pilot or experimentation

**Indicators**

**Outputs**
- Number of participants: 32
- Number of organisations implementing measure: 14

**Results**
- Participant’s feedback (satisfaction): 20
- Participant’s attitudes to E&T: 15
- Participants staying in E&T: 27
- Participants reintegrating in E&T: 6
- Participant’s education performance: 9

**Impact**
- Achievement of upper secondary qualification: 15

**What is measured?**
Learning from the Resl.eu project

Ward Nouwen, University of Antwerp
Exercise 3: Monitoring and evaluation

Please make a tick (✓) next to the indicators on the flipcharts:

- which are currently being measured?
- which should be measured?
Session 4. Transferability and sustainability
Identify the problem

Review priorities and features of policies

Provide capacity building based on evidence

Disseminate knowledge about what works to local actors

Set priorities - use evidence

Accessible and user-friendly depository of evidence

Research about what works

Based on OECD Working out Change: Systemic innovation in VET
Examples of activities analysed

• BEfr - project ExPairs provides capacity building to VET schools in the design of their action plans and measures to improve students’ orientation and enhance retention in VET

• FR – the introduction of a new monitoring system of early leavers required the establishment of regional platforms to tackle early leaving

• Danish example – Retention Caravan. Evidence-based capacity building provided to schools
Exercise 4: Transferability and sustainability

Small group work

1. Please reflect on:
   - What is being done to support transfer of successful measures in their country
   - What should be done to support transfer of successful measures in their country

2. Please discuss the measures that can facilitate transfer from successful examples:
   - What process needs to be in place?
   - What tools are needed?
   - Who needs to be targeted?

3. Write on a post-it the key elements available to ensure transferability and key needs

4. Identify the three most important needs in terms of support needed to ensure transferability of measures
Session 5. Key policy messages
Panel discussion

Ann Vanden Bulcke, European Commission
Anna Rubin, OECD
Simona Abbatangelo, EACEA
Exercise 5: Key policy messages

1. Please read the key policy messages proposed on the flipcharts
2. Please make a tick (✓) next to the messages you believe are the most important
Exercise 6: Key policy messages

Individual reflection

Reflect on key policy messages at
- national
- EU level

Homework after the completion of the workshop

Send us by email the 3 most important policy messages
Thank you for your participation!

Soon all workshop outcomes on our project website
Visit our website at
www.cedefop.europa.eu